

*SYMBOLIC HISTORY*  
*Through Sight and Sound*

8. Gothic Prelude: Lux Nova

CHARLES G. BELL  
ST. JOHN'S COLLEGE  
SANTA FE, NEW MEXICO

or

1260 CANYON ROAD  
SANTA FE, NEW MEXICO 87501

August 1995  
Last Revised January '96

## SYMBOLIC HISTORY Through Sight and Sound

### 8. Gothic Prelude: Lux Nova

a1) *French Ivory, 13th cent., Madonna and Child, Louvre, Paris; + V detail (CGB '80)*

1) *French Gothic, 1228, Cloister, Mont Saint-Michel (CGB '74)*

The waking of a culture shares with spring and dawn this mystery: first buds seem most jewelled, brightest songs greet the earliest rays:

Lenten is come with love to toune,  
With bloshmen and with briddes rounne,  
That al this blisse bringeth ...

Almost incredible, the New Light with which Gothic love opens in the ascetic dusk, gracing the beauty of earth with sacred sanction.

So the lilting poignance of a 1235 motet, "Ave Maria," with this detail and another from Mont-Saint-Michel, and three from Rheims.

Music: French, c. 1235?, Ave Maria, Syntagma Musicum, SIC-6052

2) *French Gothic, c. 1210, Kitchen, Mont-Saint-Michel (CGB '74)*

Va3) *French Gothic, c. 1220-30, Head of Mary from a Visitation (full face), West Portal, Rheims Cathedral*

3) *Same (profile), Rheims Cathedral*

4) *French Gothic, 1211-90, Clerestory of Nave, detail, Rheims Cathedral*

Va5) *Closer detail of 5 (from Gothic Wave, 9)*

5) *French Gothic, c. 1260, West Front, detail with Coronation, Rheims Cathedral (CGB '74)*

(fade "Ave Maria")

But the waking had begun by the year 1000, two and a half crucial centuries before Rheims portal. From its Gothic height, this prelude must look back —

- 6) *Mont-Saint-Michel Chapel, 11th cent. Nave and late 15th cent. Choir (CGB '74); video: detail only*
- 6a) *Mont-Saint-Michel Chapel, 11th cent. Nave (CGB'74); video: details only, below and above*
- 6b) *Mont-Saint-Michel Chapel, 15th cent. Choir (CGB '74); again, video to details, below and above*

where Romanesque vaults toward Gothic out of the Dark Age ground. As the cathedrals soar from earlier crypts as dark as holy, or the rhymed tropes embellish scripture, as the organa and motets of Ars Antiqua flow from plainsong —

Music: Free Organum, 12th cent., Agnus Dei, opening, HSL-2071 (7)  
(fade)

so the 11th-century nave of Mont-Saint-Michel lightens to a late-Gothic choir (time of Ockeghem)

Music: Ockeghem, c. 1480?, from Missa pro defunctis: "ad fontes aquarum," Archiv 2533 145 (B)

— a favored blend, as at Aachen, Tournai, Le Mans. (fade Ockeghem)

- 7) *Italian Byzantine, 5th cent., Mausoleum of Galla Placida, interior with Tombs, Ravenna; video to details, below and above*

Music: Gregorian (Solesmes) Da pacem, 1st mode, V-M-87, side 18

We have seen Christianity, in the crumbling of pagan power, rear in the grave, antinomies of eternal faith and world abandonment. At first the poles were draped in the dissolving arts of classical leisure.

(fade Gregorian)

- 8) *Carolingian, c. 800, First cover of the Lindau Gospels, J.P. Morgan; + V detail*

Music: Liturgical Chant, 10th cent., from "dextera tua, domine", close of Offertory, Nonesuch H-71348 (A-4)

But as they move north, a symbolic cross to the German tribes, while these pour southward over Rome, the residual suavities of space and consciousness are stripped

away, leaving the poles burning as in void, with the abstract inconsequence of timeless vision.

(fade 10th cent. chant)

- 9) *North Italian, c. 1100-35, Christ Enthroned, Bronze doors, S. Zeno, Verona (CGB '59); + V detail*

Music: Santiago de Compostela, MS, 12th cent., Conductus — Annua guadia (close) Decca DL 79416 (B-1)

And the first strands of the Western temporal fabric stretch over the rift, a pre-Gothic sharpness of joy and pain, concentrating into spirit the apocalyptic enigma where they are born.

(end Annua Gaudia)

- a10) *French Gothic, c. 1163 into 13th cent., Notre Dame from S.E., Paris (CGB '80)*

- 10) *Same, c. 1163-77, Ambulatory of Notre Dame, Paris (CGB '59)*

- 10a) *Same, c. 1270, Rose and lancets of South Transept, Notre Dame, Paris (CGB '80); video: detail only*

Or the metaphor of poles may be extended to the historical weaving. Then the cross of stripped faith and earthly negation becomes a temporal base for the western curve, the Gothic birth a many-phased unfolding from that somber ground. Such the rearing of Notre Dame and Perotin.

Music: Perotin, c. 1200, Sedêrunt principes, separate quadruplum (close), Archiv 2723045 (1b)

- 11) *Byzantine, 6th cent., Virgin, detail of Icon, Monastery of St. Catherine, Sinai; video: detail only*

But the ground is ideal, an assumed limit of the actual field. What is its art locus? Not the early Christian and Byzantine — not this 6th-century Madonna from Sinai, with its troubled Greek shadowings of sensuous personality.

- 12) *Armenian, 915-21, Virgin and Child with Gabriel, King Gagik's Church, Aght-Amar; video: detail only*

The negation had begun there, but it had not run its course. The stripping to the bare abstract was the Dark Age drift of Christendom everywhere. Here we pick it up from 10th-century Armenia, still in precursive contact with the West, though soon to fall to the Sultan.

- 13) *Irish, late 8th cent., Virgin and Child, Book of Kells, Trinity College, Dublin; + V detail*

The Book of Kells exhibits the general affinity and even specific features derived from earlier Coptic and Armenian contacts. Through that old-world ascetic hardening, Celtic wonder looks out, a child's eyes through a mask of age. How near is the Kells flowering to the Dark Age ground?

- a14) *Irish MS, c. 1000, David and the Lion, Southampton Psalter; V: detail only*  
 14) *Irish MS, c. 1000, David and Goliath, Southampton Psalter (V14, wider)*

The Irish were faithful, anyway, to linear abstraction — the Book of Kells a summit among such manuscripts produced over more than three hundred years. By 1000, after the Viking raids and the exodus of scholars, representation (as in this Southampton Psalter David and Goliath) seems flattened to the barest outlines of penmanship — what Klee and the 20th century would revive in post-Freudian psyche-art. But is that inverted Goliath lying on the Dark Age ground?

- 15) *Carolingian (Rheims), early 9th cent., Luke, from Four Evangelists Page, Codex Aureus, Cathedral Treasury, Aachen*

Carolingian manuscripts, struggling for space in spacelessness, hardly admit of so comical a grounding. Nor the poems of mondo-pessimism and God-hope: Alcuin's epitaph: "Yearning I followed the delights of the world —/ Ashes and dust now..." — "delicias mundi... nunc cinis et pulvis..." Nor the Anglo-Saxon Wanderer's vanity of vanities: "All is labor and loss in this lower world."

- 16) *Rheims, c. 820, St. Matthew, Gospel Book of Ebbo, Epernay; first, V detail*

Nor from Cynewulf's Christ, late 8th century: "swa we on laguflode ... windge holmas/ Ofer deop gelad ...

A waste of surges we sail across

In this wavering world, over wind-swept tracts  
Of open sea ... The Son of God guides us. (after Spaeth)

- 17) *Anglo-Saxon (Ely), 1006-23, Nativity from Sacramentary, f. 32 v. MS Y 6, Bibl. Mun., Rouen; video: details only, below and above*

As the dialectic of poles implies, the clearest expressions of that winter ground do not come from the broken trough, but as the forces rally that would lift off from it — as in the pre-Conquest schools of Winchester and Ely, a vitality alien as something from China opens in the calligraphic symbol-world.

- 18) *German, 9th cent., pre-Romanesque Church at Oberzell, Reichenau*

Music: Notker Balbulus, d. 912, Christus hunc diem, 1-5 (HAM) MHS  
OR 349

The final outpost of a transition where lean backward-looking presages the birth to follow is the Germany of the Ottos. There Notker and Wipo were writing the sequences our historical discs leave historical. There the Saxon nun, Hrowswitha, about 980, created out of faith and stark Latin a sacred drama, blending comic and tragic — though the mystery plays it anticipates would grow not from such learned imitation, but from the life of the Mass.

- a19) *German (Ottonian) Reichenau, c. 1020, Woman and the Beast, Bibl., Bamberg; first, V detail*  
19) *Same, "Fount of Living Waters"; + V detail*  
19a) *German, 1015, Bronze door, Cathedral, Hildesheim; video: two details only*

Consider a plot: Callimachus has to wife the saintly Drusiana; to avoid his legitimate caress (that monastic chastity Hegel would despise) she receives death by prayer, is protected by a divine serpent, revived by the Apostle John, converts old Callimachus, and banishes a vulgar servant to hell. As in Ottonian illumination, mind, action, and world begin and end in miracle; nothing stoops to the physical; every cause reverts to First Cause.

(fade Notker after "apostolos")

That the pagan vanity of drama can be revived in piety is one of the life-giving reversals by which the profane and temporal spring in the timeless enclosure of creed. So at the end of the Dark Ages, we have seen outlawed reason ("Professing themselves to be

wise, they became fools") prove in Anselm the Tertullian impossibility of God's Incarnation.

- 20) *Late 10th cent. German, Lothair Cross, with 1st cent. Augustus; Palace Treasury, Aachen*
- 20a) *Same, detail (which V takes from 20)*
- 20b) *Same, closer detail of center — Augustus cameo*
- 20c) *Carolingian, 9th cent (or 16th cent.?), equestrian statuette of Charlemagne; Louvre, Paris*

Music: Carmina Burana 52, Conquest of Jerusalem, 1099: Nomen a Solemnibus, MHS 3793

For the deified Augustus (1st-century cameo) to win the center of the 10th-century Cross of Lothair reflects in its most dramatic form the same about-face, by which Christian withdrawal changes to Christian attack. It began with Constantine, but the Dark Age life of paradox, from Charlemagne's Saracen struggle to the First Crusade, made it the automatic stance of Warrior Christianity. Thus Fulcher of Chartres describes the 1099 fall of Jerusalem, also hailed in music:

The Franks entered the city magnificently at the noonday hour on Friday, the day of the week when Christ redeemed the whole world on the cross... Nowhere was there a place where the Saracens could escape the swordsmen... Within Solomon's Temple about ten thousand were beheaded. If you had been there, your feet would have been stained up to the ankles with the blood of the slain... They did not spare the women and children.

Within a faith once of radical peace and estranged from Empire, what Vico calls the holy wars of heroic peoples have been reinstated.

(fade Nomen a Solemnibus)

The mode of this accomplishment is the medieval mode of faith-symbol. Augustus here is both the Prince of Peace and his secular image. So Arthur and the Peers of France are baptized; the Celtic Graal becomes the Cup of Redemption, the horn of Bran (cors), by a Frankish pun, the wafer of Corpus Christi — even as bread and wine are body and blood. So the eagle-shaped M in Dante [Paradiso XVIII and cf. VI] raises Roman Monarchy to the stars.

- 21) *French (Norman), 1020 and after, Mont-Saint-Michel from the causeway (CGB '74)*
- 21a) *German Romanesque (Köln), 10th cent. and after, Gross St. Martin, apse and tower, from the S.E.*
- 21b) *French Romanesque (Burgundy), 1088-97, Remains of Abbey Church, Cluny, France*
- 21c) *French Romanesque (from the Meuse), 11th cent., Tancremont Crucifix, Tancremont Abbey, France; + V detail*

Music: Marcabru, 1137, from Pax in Nomine Domini (Munrow: Crusades)  
Argo ZRG 673 A 2

Under the cult of the timeless and spaceless, what has occurred? Europe was rising like Mont-Saint-Michel out of the mist. The warhorse had been bred for chivalry, the mouldboard plow invented for the forest soil; the "three-field" crop system was boosting food production. For the destroyed life-trade of the Mediterranean, the road and river trade of Europe had seeded the medieval towns. The very principle of disruption — empire into warlike fiefs — shapes the feudal ties of modern kingdoms. The Dark Age terrors of war and passion — Brünhilde, Deirdre, Hallgarda — turn to chivalric devotion; while the Church, vitiated and corrupted through the Time of Troubles, begins with Cluny, 910, its passionate regeneration. Even in statements of the ascetic ground — Peter Damiani, 11th century: "Nothing remains but the love of God and mortification of yourselves" — we forget that the key words, "love" and "self" are subtly changing. "My wretched heart," (his Yeatsian cry) "which will not lose the memory of a form seen but once." So Marcabru's 1137 lament becomes a chivalric call.

(end Marcabru)

- a22) *German Tapestry, 11th-13th cent., Knight, fragment of "The Twelve Months," Kunstindustri Mus., Oslo; + V detail*
- 22) *German Romanesque, 1040-50, West Facade, Cathedral of Trier (CGB'74); video to details, above and below*

Music: Carmina Burana 11th-12th cent., #22, Homo quo vigeas (Binkley)  
SAWT 9522-A

Everywhere the earthly is entrained in the heavenly quest: Pope Urban prompts to the First Crusade not merely for the glory of God and his kingdom: "This land is too



narrow for your population ... Jerusalem is a land fruitful above all others." To which the cry of acceptance was "Dieu li volt."

From that crusading century, the symptom of new life which still dominates the landscape is a wave of first-Romanesque churches in those rising centers of trade and prosperity. If the Kaiserdoms of the Ottonian Rhine and Mosel (here the west front of the Roman Basilica of Trier, with a Golliard chant) initiate the surge — in a form as weightily archaic as the organization of the Empire — it is at once caught up, or independently advanced, in northern Italy and France.

(end Carmina Burana 22)

- 23) *N. Italian Romanesque, 1063-1118, Cathedral of Pisa, from S.W. (CGB '48)*
- 24) *Same, view of the Apse (CGB '48)*
- 24a) *N. Italian Romanesque, 1063-1350, Pisa Group: Cathedral, with Baptistry and tower (CGB '48)*

1063: and the free commune of Pisa begins an arcaded marble basilica of proto-Renaissance harmony. Though if vault had been grappled with as in the driven North, this first benign beauty of our culture could hardly have afforded such purity and ease. In the paucity of early organa and plainness of their reconstruction, it is of interest that the first Italian polyphony ("Regi Regum Gloriosa", 11th century Lucca MS) blends smooth plainsong melodies in perfect intervals — against the more dissonant risks of French organum:

Music: 11th c. Ital. (Lucca 603), Regi Regum Glorioso, RCA-V-LM 6015  
(cut, end stanza)

- 25) *Venetian Byzantine, 1069-74, Cathedral of St. Mark's*

Music: Byzantine, Mt Athos, Easter chant, 9th Ode, ARC-2533 413, end of side 1, ARC 2533 413

At the same time in Venice, queen of the Adriatic and Eastern trade, the art lingering of Constantinople found hospitable soil and leafed out in the breath-taking domes of St. Mark's (1069-74). Though beneath the outward exhalation,

- 26) *St. Mark's interior, Crossing of nave and transept, Cupola of the Resurrection, with 13th-cent. mosaics; video: details only, above and below*

*26a) Same, another (lighter) view; video: detail only (for digital, a26)*

brood gold mosaic vaults, decorated through centuries, but still symbolic enclosures of jewels burning in the Dark Age gloom. Was the chant as Byzantine as the art? **(fade Athos)** Or had the diaphony of French-Italian Guido already reared the poles of Organum? — Parallel **(Music)**, and Contrary **(Music)**.

Music: Guido of Arezzo, c.1025, Parallel & Contrary Diaphony, examples 9 & 18 from *Micrologus*, sung by K.Williamson et al.

*a27) S. Italian, c. 1090, Christ in Glory, S. Angelo in Formis, near Capua*

*27) S. Italian, c. 1080, interior of S. Angelo in Formis (video order: 27, detail; then a27, detail; and again, detail of 27)*

To the south, the impoverished heart of what had been imperial Rome showed no such progress.

Music: Gregorian, Psalm 116, Laudate, 8th mode, History of Italian Music, VLM 40000, I, 1

It must have seemed strange to the independent north, that the Papal tail should so determinedly wag the dog. Especially when the Tuscan Hildebrand, elected pope in 1073, pushed ahead with church reform in the spirit of Cluny, outlawing the imperial practice of lay investiture. Against the archaic Roman manner of this little Capua church,

**(fade Laudate Dominum omnes gentes)**

*28) German, 11th-13th cent. (and later), Cathedral of Mainz; + V28, detail*

*28a) German, 11th cent., from the bronze doors of Augsburg Cathedral, Creation of Eve, Fall, etc. (copy of Faust, 15 — CGB '59); V and digital: Adam only*

*V28b) German Romanesque, 1080-1160, Cathedral of Speyer, Rhenish Kaiserdome*

*28c) German Romanesque, 1000-1181, Apse and Towers, Worms*

Music: Carmina Burana, 11th-12th cent., #19 Fas et nefas (Binkley) SAWT 9455A

how vastly the Mainzer Dom, 11th century at core (though a conglomerate from the 10th to the 19th) sprawls over the Rhine. With such gangling pride Henry the Fourth must have gathered his appointed bishops to answer Gregory VII's claim that the Roman Church had never erred, nor would err to all eternity, that it was in the apostolic power to

depose emperors, and that Henry should "Obey the mandate of God".

(fade Carmina Burana)

Henry, king ... by the holy ordination of God, to Hildebrand, not pope but false monk ... By wiles ... thou hast achieved money; by money, favor; by the sword, the throne of peace. And from the throne of peace thou hast disturbed peace ... Thou, therefore, damned by this curse ... relinquish the apostolic chair which thou hast usurped ... I, Henry, king by the grace of God, together with all our bishops, say thus unto thee: Descend, descend, and be damned throughout the ages.

29) *French Norman, 1062 and after, St. Etienne (Abbaye-aux-Hommes) Caen; first, video detail*

Music: Santiago MS (Magister Albertus of Paris) c. 1135, Congaudeant, opening, Argo ZRG 900

But Hildebrand was linked all over Europe with the rising tide of Catholic power — from Santiago. through Magister Albertus' Paris, as far as Normandy, where Duke William and his churchmen were then creating the most pregnant of Romanesque styles, which, in the superimposed heights of his own monastery at Caen, already looks to Gothic. (fade Congaudeant) The papal ban was no negligible weapon. Henry's submission at Canossa in the snowy winter of 1077, Gregory himself describes:

30) *N. Italian, 940, rebuilt 13th cent., Castle of Canossa ruins, Emilia; + V close detail (as in slide 306)*

30a) *Roman Mosaic, 1128, Crucifix with Vine, S. Clemente, Rome*

306) *Again, Canossa ruins, slide: close detail; video: a wider detail (from 30)*

Music: Carmina Burana, 11th-12th cent. Dulce solum, (Binkley) SAWT 9455-A

And there, having laid aside all the belongings of royalty, wretchedly, with bare feet and clad in wool, he continued for three days to stand before the gate of the castle. Nor did he desist from imploring with many tears the aid and consolation of the apostolic mercy, until he had moved all those who were present there ... to pity and depth of compassion.

Today the Apennine castle of Canossa is a ruin as abandoned as the Papal dream of Europe under spiritual sway.

(fade Carmina Burana)

31) *French Norman, 1020 and after, Mont-Saint-Michel, upper portion (CGB '74)*

Though the feud went on, even to Henry's taking Rome in 1084 and the Norman-Sicilian Guiscard's recovering it for the Pope, but with such rape and misconduct that Gregory was driven into exile by the outraged Romans. As in all deep conflicts of history, progress banked on both sides: the emerging national states, and the Catholic synthesis of Europe. While in thought and the arts, France confirmed itself as the ordering center.

32) *Norman French, soon after 1066, from the Bayeux tapestry; video: detail of ships only*V32a) *Same, detail: King Edward*V32b) *Same, detail: Guy takes Harold*32c) *Same, detail of battle*V32d) *Same, detail: Norman archers*

The Chanson de Roland, against the looser German epics, reveals the formative discipline of the Norman French. The Bayeux tapestry, record of the conquest of England, has such clean force and drama within the iconographic stripping of all figures — as description in the Roland is cut to a functional core: "Rollant est proz e Oliver est sage" — "Roland is brave, and Oliver is wise." And are we not told by Malmesbury and Wace how the Duke's jongleur Taillefer (or Toliver) joined battle at Hastings chanting the "Cantilena Rollandi"?

a33) *Norman Romanesque, 1059-66, La Trinité or Abbey-aux-Dames, outside at dusk, Caen (CGB '74); video: details only, below and above*b33) *French Romanesque, c. 1080, The Archangel Michael, Church of St. Savin*33) *Norman Romanesque, 1059-66, La Trinité or Abbaye-aux-Dames, Nave, Caen (CGB '74)*

Music: Magister Albertus, c.1235(?), Congaudeant, conclusion, st. 3 & 4, Argo ZRG 900

Emotion, pathos, everything personal, is held here in the severity of automatic faith, which dominates and transforms, until the horn of Roland sounds through the Pyrenees like the trumpet of doom: "Roland feels that his time is no more." He is on a steep hill

that looks toward Spain ... He has held up his right glove to God: the angels of heaven come down to him. AOI" — "Angles del ciel i descendent a lui. AOI."

With the Norman Conquest, and even just before, that mighty style (here Matilde's church of the Trinity in Caen)

*a34) Norman, 1089-1100, and 15th cent., Gloucester Cathedral over the town*  
*1st 34) English Norman, 1079-93, remade Perpendicular, 1366-1404, Nave of Winchester (CGB '74)*

spreads over England, so that most of the Cathedrals of the island are built round or carved out of a great Norman core, often begun within ten years of the conquest. **(fade Congaudeant)** Thus at Winchester, longest cathedral in Europe, the solemn proportions of the 1079-93 nave must be felt through a Gothic surface of the time of Chaucer.

Music: Worcester Fragments, c. 1325, Hocketed trope from "Epiphaniam Domino," Nonesuch H-71308, A, bd.4, middle

The verticals, the lierne vault,

*35) Winchester, exterior, Nave from the south (CGB '74)*

stretch the low solidity of structure, lightened by modest buttresses and the pointing of windows once round-arched.

*V2nd 34) Winchester, nave: video returns briefly to an upper detail of 1st 34*

Yet all that richness speaks

**(fade hocketed trope)**

*2nd 33) La Trinité, nave; video: details only, above and below; digital: above*

what it came from and must have been —

Music: French, 12th cent.(?), Verbum bonum et suave (first 2 st.), SAWT 9531 A

again the Abbey of Matilde, wife of the Conqueror. There are always attempts to differentiate Romanesque from Gothic, as Frankl's *additif* against *divisif*: still, this vaulted stone already contains the other future, as centuries of polyphony would unfold from this early organum. **(fade**

**Verbum bonum)**

*3rd 34) Winchester, nave, through the choir screen (CGB '90); video: first detail of 1st 34, then of V3rd 34 (CGB '74)*  
 (Music: Continue hocketed trope, as above)

And what could more beautifully show the sweep of Romanesque-Gothic than to move from Matilde's Caen to the nave of Winchester — melodized and harmonised hockets on that ground?

(end Trope)

*2nd 35) Again, Winchester, exterior (CGB '74)*

Here, where the poise of Norman, to be continued through the quieter Gothic of England, awaits the filling-in of Renaissance, we are struck by the continuity of the Western rebirth, the speed with which it found its expressive forms.

*36) French Romanesque (Vienne) c. 1080, St. Savin s. Gartempe (interior)*

Another of those early polyphonies, this from Chartres before 1100, an Alleluia, Organum joined with plainsong, will let us move from the pre-Romanesque of Southern France (1080, St. Savin)

*37) French Norman, 1063 ff., Abbaye-aux-Hommes (St. Etienne) interior; Caen (CGB '74)*

through William the Conqueror's own church in Caen, begun in 1063 — piers (as alternately through Romanesque and early Gothic) replacing columns, the dialectic of vertical and lateral, like the Scholastic vaulting of "Yes and No," grandly anticipated —

*38 and for 2nd 37)*

*English Norman, early 12th cent., aisle, with nave columns, Tewkesbury Abbey (copy of 2nd 38 — CGB '66)*

to English Norman, columned again in Tewkesbury, early 12th century, later windows glimpsed through the dusk; though we would need more music than we have, records recovered from the still vibrating molecules of those church walls,

*2nd 36) St. Savin s. Gartempe; video: details only, below and above*

to distinguish the musical stages of Romanesque.

Music: Chartres MS, c. 1100, from Alleluia: Angelus Domine, V-LM 6015

*2nd 37) Again, Abbaye-aux-Hommes, Caen; video: detail only*

*2nd 38) Again, Tewkesbury Abbey (CGB '66); video: details only*  
(cut plainsong close)

Tewkesbury, with the aisled solemnity of Egyptian Karnak.

*39) Tewkesbury Abbey, from the south, c. 1110-50 and after (CGB '66)*

And outside, the long nave roof and tremendous tower of Norman. How much French history was enacted north of the Channel: the Anglo-Norman scribe of the Roland, Anselm, Archbishop of Canterbury, Marie de France also of England, the play of Adam, chief relic of 12th-century drama.

*a40) French (Burgundy), 1120-40 ff., Vezelay exterior; video: detail only*

*b40) Same, Vezelay interior; video has detail of c40*

*c40) Same, Vezelay portal, lighted*

Back to France, Vezelay (1120-40); and now, available music admits of a style distinction. At the very time when the upward reach of Gothic begins in art and soul — that angel clarity of fierce mystic love, in which so many great men join: theologian-lover Abelard, builder-politician Suger, mystic Hugh of St. Victor, and even their puritanical censor Bernard of Clairvaux — Gregorian stretches out to a tenor (Latin: *tenere*, "to hold") over which new melodies slide in melismatic organum.

*40) Burgundian, 1132-40, Nave viewed through portal, Vezelay; + V detail*

*V40a) French (Burgundy), Vezelay interior (from slide b40)*

With the Vezelay portal and Gislebertus' Christ and the Magdalene, hear the brief recorded section of a Benedicamus Domino, of



the St. Martial school at Limoges — the first beautiful performance of polyphony.

Music: St. Martial School, mid-12th cent., *Benedicamus Domino*, Haydn Society, L2071 (close during slide 41)

- 41) *Burgundian, c. 1120-40, Gislebertus, Christ & the Magdalene, St. Lazarus, Autun (CGB '80); + V details (while slide goes to Gislebertus, 1120-40, Flight to Egypt, detail, St. Lazarus, Autun)*
- 41a) *Again, Gislebertus, Christ and the Magdalene, detail (CGB '80)*

Here is Hugo of St. Victor, early 12th century, in praise of Love — *De Laude Caritatis*:

You have great power, O love; you alone could draw God down from heaven to earth. How strong is your bond with which even God could be bound... You brought him bound with your bonds, you brought him wounded with your arrows... you wounded him who was invulnerable, you bound him who was invincible, you drew him who was immovable; the Eternal you made mortal... O love, how great is your victory.

Set that celebration of love's paradox against its ultimate source,

- 42) *Hellenistic, 3rd-2nd cent. B.C., Socrates, Diotima, and Eros, Mus. Naz., Naples*

Socrates taught by Diotima in the Symposium, of which this Hellenistic relief survives, where Plato invokes Eros, just to avoid the paradox of the divine and earthly:

What then is love?...He is a great spirit... the mediator who spans the chasm which divides the divine and the mortal... For God mingles not with man; but through Love all the intercourse and converse of God with man, whether awake or asleep, is carried on.

2nd 41 and 2nd 42)

*French glass, c 1150, Notre Dame de la Belle Verriere, 1st window, south aisle of Choir, Cathedral, Chartres; but video inserts a detail of Socrates from Alexandrian Melt, a90 (see V2nd 42)*

"The Eternal you made mortal ... O love, how great is your victory" — what lucent contradictions have opened stained glass windows in the dark, since the Socratic search for rationality.

*Va43) French, 1145-50, Two Queens of Judah, detail, Royal Portal, Cathedral, Chartres*

*643) Same, One of the Queens of Judah, closer detail*

*43) Southern France, c. 1130, Prophet holding a Scroll, Moissac (Tarn et Garonne); + V detail*

In Southern France,. and soon after in the north, the love of woman, its poetry and music, are caught up in the same mystical fervor. Perhaps the best known Troubadour song is that high chivalric one by Bernard de Ventadorn of the 12th century: the lover's envy when he sees the lark:

As she beats her wings with delight against the sun,  
Loose herself and fall, in the sweetness that goes to her heart —

Can vei la lauzeta mover/ de joi sas alas contral rai  
Que s'oblid' e's laissa chazer/ per la doussor c'al cor li vai...

In the dearth of secular art, we hear it with the Moissac Prophet Holding a Scroll — both pierced by timeless ecstasy. The improvised accompaniments are lost, and efforts by later groups (Binkley, etc.) to supply them, make us treasure the solo refinements of Max Meili, or (here) Mertens, of the Brussels Pro Musica Antiqua.

Music: Bernard de Ventadorn, 12th cent., "Can vei la lauzeta" EMS 201

In troubador love,

- a44) *Gislebertus, c. 1120-40, Flight into Egypt, Mary and Jesus, detail; St. Lazarus, Autun*
- V644) *French early Gothic, c. 1200, detail from Coronation of the Virgin; St. Yved, Braisne*
- 44) *Gislebertus, Burgundian, c. 1120-40, Recumbent Eve; St. Lazarus, Autun*
- 44a) *German Gothic, end 12th cent., Fall of Man, Ceiling Painting; St. Michael's Church, Hildesheim*
- 44b) *Again, Gislebertus, Eve, detail of upper body*
- 44c) *G. Pisano, 1302-11, Nativity, detail, from the Pulpit, Cathedral, Pisa*
- 44d) *Closer detail of Eve's upper body; video then returns to 44*

in the burning love of Mary, second Eve, a new species of joy possesses Europe; (**end Ventadorn**) as if mutation had produced a flower of unknown grace and fragrance, we see as recognizably as snowdrops spread through a forest, the lyric fire (Gislebertus' Eve in the snake-vines) lighten from Provence over Burgundy and France, to England, Germany, and to the Italy of "the Sweet New Style." For early 12th-century France, Abelard and Eloise draw both loves to a flaming core. That the man, condemned by St. Bernard for logic and rationality ("This man has no mind to believe what his reason has not previously argued") would later stand for medieval passion sacred and profane, hints at the sheer ambivalence of that intellectual fire.

A likely conjecture, that the supreme Latin love poem of the time, the "Dum Diane Vitrea," in its richness and freedom, may be one Abelard sang for Eloise, and heard sung after him by admiring scholars. From it we cull three phrases:

When the gleaming lamp of Diana is kindled  
Late at the rosy light of her brother,  
And west winds bearing fragrance  
Wander the ether-ways of heaven... (CGB)

Dum Diane Vitrea/ sero lampas oritur,  
et a fratris rosea/ luce dum succenditur,  
dulcis aura zephyri/ spirans omnes etheri ...

The sounds of water on pure sand  
And of a mill wheel turning round  
Steal oblivious eyes from the light... (CGB)

murmura rivorum/ per arenas puras,  
 circulares ambitus/ molendinorum,  
 qui furantur somno/ lumen oculorum ...

Sweet is the passage from love into sleep,  
 But sweeter the waking from sleep to love... (CGB)

Hei quam felix transitus/ amoris ad soporem,  
 sed suavior regressus/ soporis ad amorem...

- a45) *Ottonian, c. 975, Gero Crucifix, detail, Cathedral, Cologne*  
 45) *French Romanesque (Haute Loire), c. 1135, Lavaudieu Head of Christ, Louvre, Paris; + V detail*

From the Gerokreuz at the close of The Dark Ages, identification with the human Savior matures to this Lavaudieu Head of 1135; and again it is Abelard who, in his epochal poem on Good Friday, at the condemned close of his own life, voiced the personal theory of atonement, which, as Waddell says: "His century branded as heresy, and which is the beginning of modern theology":

- 46) *Spanish Romanesque, 1st half of the 12th cent., Doubting Thomas, Santa Domingo de Silos, near Burgos*  
 46a) *Same, Doubting Thomas, detail*

"Alone to sacrifice thou goest, Lord" — "Solus ad victimam procedis, Domine."

From northern Spain at the same time (which shares with France the passions of pre-Gothic), such human participation melts with tenderness the archaic figures of the Silos reliefs. As with Abelard, the sin which required Christ's sacrifice is taken up, deeply and personally ours: "Nostra sunt, Domine, nostra sunt crimina."

- 47) *French, 12th cent., Crucifixion and Ascension window from Poitiers; + V details, below and above (V47 and V47a)*

That spirit is confirmed in the 12th-century Passion windows of Le Mans, this Poitiers, then Chartres. "Why must thou suffer torture for our sin?" Abelard's answer is to fast as with Christ in the grave:

Heavy with weeping may the three days pass,  
To win the laughter of Thine Easter Day.

So Dante would himself descend on Good Friday and rise the third day.

- a48) *Again 41, Burgundian, c. 1120-40, Gislebertus, Christ and the Magdalene; St. Lazarus, Autun*  
 48) *Spanish, 1st half of 12th cent., Deposition – Resurrection, S. Domingo de Silos, near Burgos; first, video details*

We stand here at the source, not only of Protestant theology, but of the realistic incarnations of Christian art, the impersonation of the Easter trope which engendered Western drama:

"Quem queritis in sepulcro, O Christicolae? —  
Whom do you seek in the sepulcher, O women of Christ?"

"Jesum Nazarenum, crucifixum — Jesus of Nazareth, crucified."

"Non est hic, surrexit. Ite, nuntiate. —  
He is not here ... Go, and announce that the Lord has risen."

That earliest (St. Gall) example is of the time of the Gerokreuz; but by the twelfth century, the sacred play has developed as startlingly as, in this other 1140 relief from Silos, the burial of Christ indicates its entire realistic bent and pre-Renaissance soul. As in Abelard, the inward change has been made. It would take centuries to elaborate the techniques of the earthly; but this martyred Jesus, the mourning Marys, the sleeping guards below, stand on the threshold

- 49) *English, c. 1380-1400, Resurrection from retable, Norwich Cathedral*  
 49a) *Rembrandt, 1639, The Resurrection of Christ, Alte Pinakothek, Munich*  
 49b) *Burgundian, 12th cent., Descent from the Cross, Louvre, Paris*  
 49c) *Catalan Romanesque, early 12th cent., Lazarus the Beggar, fresco, from San Clemente de Tahull*

of the 1400 humanization which heralds the Renaissance, the Norwich-school Resurrection, say, toward which the arrow of Romanesque awareness is drawn. How many strands of the Western soul are already spun into the fabric of the time of Abelard.

In that fabric, indeed, forces opposed become the warp and woof of one awakening. Even Bernard of Clairvaux (1090-1153), faith-centered watchdog against progress, was so borne on the individual and passionate tide, that he seems a source of Reformation, with the Christ-imitating piety of its arts.

Small wonder he was already at odds with Abelard, most daring precursor of Renaissance — Reformation and Renaissance a warring identity, joined in the larger empowering of man and world; though Reformation's drive toward renewed Christianity would counter the classical claims of reason and taste.

- a50) French (Burgundy), c. 1110-15, South portal of Saint-Pierre, Moissac*
- b50) French Romanesque, 1120-50, Conversion of St. Eustace, from a Vezelay capital*
- c50) Gislebertus (Burgundian), c. 1120-40, Body of St. Vincent guarded by ravens, capital, Cathedral of Autun (CGB '80)*
- 50) French (Burgundy), c. 1120-30, Main portal of St. Lazare Cathedral, Autun*
- 50a) Romanesque-Gothic, 1134-50, Triple West Portal, Chartres (CGB '59; copy of Gothic II, 42); video uses lower spread of a51*

St. Bernard not only hunts down what he calls heresy (Abelard, Arnold of Brescia, William of Conches, and the rest); he attacks the now wealthy monasteries of Cluny for the size and extravagance of their churches — then as richly colored and jewelled as they are still recognizably carved —

What profit is there in those ridiculous monsters... that deformed comeliness, that comely deformity... those half-men... and fighting knights, those hunters winding their horns?...

Doth not the root of all this lie in covetousness, which is idolatry... At the sight of these marvellous vanities men are more kindled to offer gifts than to pray. Thus wealth is drawn up by ropes of wealth, thus money bringeth money... (Coulton)

Yet as from Abelard not only the heretical but the church-sustaining energies of the next generations were to spring, so in the great series of portals beginning about 1100 to 1120 with Moissac and (here) Autun and culminating after 1140 in the Royal Portal of Chartres, we experience a logos powerful in ordering the divine — an achievement impossible without a daring that continually walked the knife-edge of heresy — heresy being in Abelard's case an advance too rapid or too proud along the road his followers would make orthodox.

- a51) French Gothic, 1134-50, West front up to Tower, Chartres Cathedral (copy of CGB '59); here video takes the upper spread of this slide*
- b51) French Gothic, 1145 ff., view of Chartres from hotel*
- 51) French Romanesque-Gothic, 1145 ff. and 1194 ff., the western façade of Chartres Cathedral, with the 15th-cent. taller spire*
- 52) Lesser's Geometrical Analysis of the same west front, Chartres*
- 52a) Double of 51 and 52 — actual church and scale analysis<sup>1</sup>*

Right, that Geoffrey, Bishop of Chartres and of its Platonic school (just before the 1130 fire occasioned much of the present West front), should defend Abelard at Soisson (1121), since in this divine geometry, heaven-scaling reason speaks "with most oracular organ".

It was in the brilliance of his youth that Abelard opened dialectic theology with the *Sic et Non* — Yes and No: for 157 questions crucial to the faith, a columned array of quotations from the Bible, the Fathers, the pagan classics, affirming and denying — a handbook of contradictions. The prologue states what is almost Heidegger's basic tuning (*Stimmung*) of Western thought, Cartesian certainty mediated by question: "For by doubt," says Abelard, "we come to inquiry, and by inquiry we arrive at the truth." This was the book which Peter Lombard later called his "breviary," and from which Aquinas would draw his method of Objection and Reply.

Though Abelard was even more blamed for his lectures and tract (c. 1120) On the Divine Unity and Trinity.

---

<sup>1</sup>After b51, held longer in the slide show than in the video, these are the basic slides — yet differently applied. In the video, the double not only closes the sequence, but opens it, as if it were c51, as well as 52a. Between, the video runs a series of separate details — photo followed by Analysis — first of the façade up to the towers; then of the towers; then a lower central detail (Analysis only). Here the video returns to the slide double.

In "The Story of my Calamities" he tells of writing it for his scholars, who wanted to know "rather what could be understood than what could be stated ... nor could anything be believed unless it could first be understood." Bernard could hardly ignore such a reversal of Augustine's "believe that you may understand — crede ut intelligas." He bestirred himself before the second trial, at Sens, 1140:

Peter Abelard is trying to make void the merit of Christian faith when he deems himself able by human reason to comprehend God altogether. He ascends to the heavens and descends even to the abyss; nothing may hide from him! Not content to see things through a glass darkly, he must behold all things face to face...

(Taylor, The Medieval Mind)

The church builders had it better. They were not tried for heresy, despite their daring or Bernard's disapproval. Though the geometric analysis of the West Front of Chartres, revealing the three superimposed modules and harmonies of the 1145 and 1194 constructions, with the 15th-century taller spire, leaves no doubt how far those architects trusted Whitehead's "unbridled reason of the Middle Ages" in proclaiming the divine.

53) *Same, Chartres, Royal portal (1145-50), central door (video crops first from 50a, triple portal, CGB '59); + V detail*

53a) *Same, Christ of Tympanum; video: detail only of 53*

That formulation of the Trinity which Bernard called heretical ("He savors of Arius when he speaks of the Trinity ... The faith of the righteous believes, it does not dispute.") is most briefly and beautifully expressed in the close of Abelard's hymn for Saturday Vespers ("O quanta qualia/ sunt illa sabbata"). With what measured glory the logic of God becomes the flesh of the poem, in the untranslatable mastery of Latin syntax:

To the Lord of forever,  
Praise evermore,  
From whom all, by whom all,  
In whom all, are.  
From-whom-are, Father is;  
By-whom-are, Son;  
In-whom-are, Spirit,  
Of Father, Son, one. (CGB)

Perenni Domino  
perpes sit gloria,  
ex quo sunt, per quem sunt,



in quo sunt omnia.  
 ex quo sunt, pater est,  
 per quem sunt, Filius,  
 in quo sunt, Patris et  
 filii Spiritus.

To that intellectual precision, apparent even in translation,

- a54) French (Auvergne), 12th cent., Christ head, Louvre, Paris (another view of the Lavaudieu head of slide 45, above)*
- 654) French, 12th cent., bronze Crucified Christ, Metropolitan Museum, NYC*
- 54) French (Auvergne), 2nd half of 12th cent., Virgin and Child, Metropolitan Museum, NYC; + V details*
- 54a) Auvergne, 2nd half of 12th cent., detail of Virgin, Louvre, Paris*

Bernard's hymn, "Jesu dulcis memoria" — within the same style-horizon — is diametrically opposed.

Music: Bernard of Clairvaux, c. 1145(?), "Jesu dulcis memoria," St. John's group under Frank Flinn

In this puzzling saint the old dilemma of faith crops out: selfless humility and dogmatic pride. Arnold of Brescia, whom Bernard had thrown out of France, accused him (John of Salisbury reports) "of being a pursuer of vain glory, one who envied all who were not of his own school." Yet the hymn shows simple piety and childlike faith — so childlike indeed that it evaporates in translation, leaving the obvious sentiments of later religion. It begins:

Jesu dulcis memoria  
 dans vera cordis gaudia,  
 sed super mel et omnia  
 eius dulcis praesentia.

Jesus sweet to recall,  
 The heart's joy in essence;  
 More than honey and all,  
 The sweetness of your presence. (CGB)

Bernard's key word "faith" is also crucially changing — like some 12th century Madonnas, filled with the sensuous actualizations of person. As if his Christ were to be apprehended by taste. While the melody, against modal Gregorian, moves like a

Protestant hymn, by harmonic chords.

(close "Jesu dulcis memoria")

- 55) *French Gothic (Suger), 1140-44, Ambulatory, St. Denis, (CGB '84); video divides to a central spread and detail of the vault*
- 55a) *Again, St. Denis, but the upper church, rebuilt about 1230*
- 55b) *Again, the Ambulatory of St. Denis, Chapel of St. Peregrin, two windows (before which video has returned to the central spread of 55)*

Music: French, mid-12th cent, Benedicamus Domino, 2-voice (Cape) EMS  
201

The great Suger, regent of France and abbot of Saint-Denis, north of Paris, provides a link between Abelard, whom he defended, and Bernard, by whom he was stirred. In 1140 to '44, about the time melismatic organum joined with discant, he had his church enlarged, windowed and triple portalled — an act which, as much as any, turned Romanesque into Gothic. Though most of that Saint Denis has been rebuilt or defaced, this ambulatory with Suger's account of the building (edited and translated by Panofsky), heralds a new mysticism of Gothic Incorporation, an anagogical ascent, by which the earthly is symbolically elevated to the spiritual and becomes a kind of sacrament.

(fade **Benedicamus**)

56) *Catalan, mid-12th cent., Porch of Santa Maria at Ripoli*

It is hard in any period to call one man of the past and another of the future; Bernard's backward looking inspires another future, of penitential reform. "The church is resplendent in her walls, beggarly in her poor. She clothes her stones in gold, and leaves her sons naked ... "

57) *French, 11th-12th cent., Basilica (St. Remi), Rheims (CGB '76); video takes this in three cuts: below, middle, and above*

But we who, for the sake of Christ, have deemed as dung whatever shines with beauty, enchants the ear, delights through fragrance, flatters the taste, pleases the touch — whose devotion, I ask, do we intend to incite by means of these very things?

Indeed, the monumental pre-Gothic bareness of Bernard's own church at Clairvaux seems to have exerted the sort of revolutionary impact Bernard himself did. That church is mostly destroyed, but the shadowy vast Basilica of Rheims (not the cathedral, but this older church, 11th-12th centuries) may suggest the type.

58) *Again, Suger's Ambulatory, 1140-44, another view (CGB '84); video takes only an upper detail; then a lower detail of 55, with tomb; then a detail of the vault from slide 636 to follow)*

58a) *Closer view of 58: column between windows (CGB '84); from which video gives only an upper detail of the right window*

Music: Leonin, c.1160, from Haec Dies, near close (Tinayre) Lumen 32011

It was Bernard's passionate rephrasing of the Dark Age question which Suger's church (here a chapel of the ambulatory) was made to answer. And not only his church, but a theology derived by way of Irish-born John Scotus from the Pseudo-Areopagite (Syrian, ca. 500), viewing all process as an ascent, in which the material and sensory is drawn up and receives the radiance of the divine: so the lilt of troubador love in the sacred organum of Leonin. **(resume speaking on the last held note of the Haec Dies)** Here is a passage from Suger which becomes a jewelled window, itself lighting a hundred and more years of the mystical fabric of Gothic —

- a59) French Gothic, 1212-41 and after, Rheims, interior, nave and west windows*  
*59) Same, west windows, nearer (CGB '59); video: rose window only*

up to the height of Rheims, the height of Perotin.

Music: Perotin, c. 1200, from an Alleluia, last section, Seraphim SIC 6052

When... in the beauty of the house of God the loveliness of the many-colored gems has called me away from external cares... I see myself dwelling, as it were, in some strange region of the universe which neither exists entirely in the slime of earth, nor entirely in the purity of Heaven; and that, by the grace of God, I can be transported from this inferior to that higher world in an anagogical manner...

(end Alleluia)

- 60) Jan van Eyck, 1425, Madonna in a Church, Berlin-Dahlem Museum; first, V detail*

Music: Dufay c.1440(?), from Flos Florum (at "Regina"), (Cape) ARC 3003

There is the insight behind centuries of Gothic incorporation, from Chartres through The Divine Comedy, to the 15th-century symbolic sanctities of here and now — this Dufay, with Van Eyck's Madonna in a Church, where as Panofsky has noted, the light that seems so actual falls from the North, as on Dante's Earthly Paradise.

(fade Dufay, after "dolorum")

- Va61) Again, Chartres, Royal Portal, center cropped from 50a, above*  
*61) French Romanesque-Gothic, 1145-50, Central Tympanum, Royal Portal, Chartres (CGB '59); + V detail (replaced in the slide show by 61a, again Suger's Ambulatory, two windows; CGB '84)*

On the gilded doors which by his analogy open (like this portal of Chartres) to heaven, Suger inscribed a Latin poem, in which repetition takes the place of rhyme:

For the splendor of the church that has fostered and exalted him,  
 Suger has laboured for the splendor of the church.  
 ... Bright is the noble work; but being nobly bright, the work  
 Should brighten the minds, that they may travel through the true lights  
 To the True Light where Christ is the true door.  
 In what manner it inhere in this world the golden door defines:  
 The dull mind rises to truth through that which is material  
 Raised from prior submersion by the sight of this light.

Mens hebes ad verum per materialia surgit  
 Et demersa prius hac visa luce resurgit.

62) *Suger's Ambulatory; variant: column between windows (CGB '84)*

On the windowed enlargement of the upper Choir, a model for Notre Dame and so many to follow (though it is the ambulatory that remains), another poem was inscribed:

Bright is that which is brightly coupled with the bright,  
 And bright the noble edifice pervaded by the new light.

Such is Suger's Lux Nova, the sacramental light of Gothic.

63) *French early Gothic, begun c. 1170, Buttressed Apse, Mantes (CGB '74)*

63a) *French Romanesque, 1039-65, Transept Crossing, Ste. Foy, Conques, Aveyron*

63b) *Again, Suger, 1140-44, Ambulatory, St. Denis (slide overexposed to show Gothic vaulting, used by video earlier, as detail, see 58, above; while here video shows a detail of Mantes, from 63)*

V63c) *Cathedral of Laon, 1160-1205, buttressing, north side of nave, detail from a vertical slide (CGB '74); digital: add v63d, Canterbury Choir*

What ingenuities of structure that light required, any early Gothic apse (here Mantes, near Paris, 2nd half of the 12th century) will remind us of. From the first groining and ribbing of vaults (the aisles of Bernay Abbey, Norman, 1017; the crossing of Ste. Foy, Conques, 1039 ff. — as in music from the principle of simultaneously moving voices — a chain leads as by necessity to the dialectic triumph of Gothic. To open his

windows, Suger reduced the walls to buttresses, though he did not make them fly. But within ten years at Noyon that step was taken — to be followed at once in the churches being built at Sens, Laon, and not long after, in England, at Canterbury.

- 64) *French Gothic, 1162-82, (rebuttressed 13th cent.?) Choir Apse, Notre Dame, Paris, from far-off (CGB '59); + V detail*  
 64a) *Same, buttressing of Choir, from the south (copy of CGB '59; see Gothic II, 55); first, two video details, the second now video-revised to the Madonna of the North Portal, also Notre Dame, Paris (CGB '80 — V64b)*

Music: Leonin, c. 1180(?), Deum timê. Organum duplum, Lumen 32011

The boldest early application was at Notre Dame in Paris, 1162-82.

In music it was Leonin, master there through that time, who perfected the sustained-tone style, combining it with powerfully driven rhythmic passages of note against note — or of tenor note against a triple in the organal voice — here his Deum timê, sung by Tinayre. The prerequisite for those soaring polyphonies was what we take for granted, though it had then to be painfully evolved, a system of time notation that would blend independent voices. It is the crisscrossing of Perfect, or triple, rhythm that gives the music its stripped energy; it is the sustained-tone melting of melody over a held ground which complements that force with a shifting devotional tenderness of incomparable poignance; while the mystical turning from the vanity of earth to the eternal is attested by the bare-fifth harmony.

- 65) *Double: [A] Gainsborough, c. 1783, Mrs. Sheridan, detail, head; National Gallery, Washington, D.C.; and [B] French Gothic, c. 1210, N. Portal, Head of Sainte Modeste, Chartres Cathedral; + singles.*<sup>2</sup>

In the world of Enlightened hope, of Gainsborough (right), Haydn, Jane Austen, dissonance is a passing trial, which resolves into the triadic chord of homecoming to the valid earth. (**Music: harpsichord cadence, Richard Stark**) But in Gothic, those triads of the heart are passing tones, dissonances of wish; and what they resolve into is the transhumanity of perfect intervals.

---

<sup>2</sup>Where the slide show goes from 65, through B, then A, and back to the double, the video enriches to 65, then B, again 65, then A, again 65, and finally A once more.

Music: French, c. 1240, Anima–Descendi–Alma, close, AS 91)

So in Sainte Modeste at Chartres (left) the loves and moods affirmed by our major and minor hang unvalidated, as over an eternity of pure fifth, octave, unison. Such formal exclusion of the chords of joy and tears, in which Gainsborough's Mrs. Sheridan (right) has her being, might seem of the Dark Age Ground; but their actual appearance, floating in the mystery of denial, tokens the shadowy first smile with which Gothic love lightens the ascetic pre-dawn. No piece so voices that suspension as

66) *Score of Leonin's Organum Duplum, Judea et Jerusalem, transcribed by Richard Stark from Cape performance (video follows through the text and performance in a series of 17 details)*

Leonin's organum on "Judea et Jerusalem". This opening Duplum, in the lower or tenor voice, stretches out those three words, with their notes, as heard in the plainsong. (**Music: Solesmes opening of Judea et Jerusalem, French Decca 7.452A.**) We are in the fourth mode, whose tonic is the closing E. The dominant is A, to which the tenor rises once at the climax of the discant section. Discant denotes the bar-by-bar treatment marked in yellow. (**Music: Stark, on harpsichord.**) Sustained tone, or *vel purum*, bespeaks the melismatic melting over held tones, into which the discant also returns at the close.

(**Music: Stark, on harpsichord.**)

The tension between the life of earth, which was to shape tonal harmony, and the earthless center is enacted between the Gregorian tonic E and the F with which the chant opens. For no sooner does the organizing voice move from F above, than the entire claim of sensuous F Major appears, dreamed over the mystic void — as in four haunting variations of the B-flat phrase marked in red — the desired smile of Guinevere. (**Music: CGB, recorder #1 and #4.**) In that emergence of romance, the repeated rise to the sacred tonic E (marked in blue), a seventh over the earth ground, F, sharpens a spirit-cry. Which way do we move? The "Judea" close affirms temporal F. With the "Jerusalem" phrase, the flat is withdrawn. The penultimate search (over F) avoids B. Still hungry for F we are led toward dissonant E ("our sister the death of the body"). But the plainsong tenor drops to its E close. How strangely earth's climb completes itself in the modal octave of mystery, the timeless center of creed.

Let us hear, first with the score, the tender Cape performance.

Music: Leonin, c.1160, Judea et Jerusalem, 1st Duplum, ARCHIV 14068  
(close)

67) *French Gothic, c. 1160, S. Transept, Soissons Cathedral, (CGB '59)*

And now once more, with details from Soissons and Chartres — the perfection of the New Light:

Music: The same, repeated

68) *French Gothic 1194-1225, North Ambulatory, columns and windows, Chartres (CGB '59)*

69) *French Gothic, 1194-1225, South Aisle of Choir, Chartres (CGB '74)*

69a) *French Glass, c. 1150, West Lancets and Rose, Chartres (video divides to lancets first, then rose)*

(close Leonin)

Such keenness of discovery, within the veneration of sacred authority,

Va70) *Mont-Saint-Michel, Chapel, 11th-cent. Nave and late 15th-cent. Choir (returning to slide 6 of this show, CGB '74)*

70) *French Romanesque, 11th-12th cent., and Gothic, 13th cent., from Nave into Choir, Le Mans Cathedral (CGB '74); + V details*

is visibly attested by those dual constructions (as Mont-Saint-Michel earlier, and here Le Mans) where a Gothic choir launches itself from the round-archings of a Romanesque nave. And in music too, the Leonin two-part, the huge Perotin three- and four-part organa, expand their resources in the ritual embrace of plainsong. No correlation of one living polarity with another presents a true match. Romanesque is not (as popularly conceived) quite cognate with plainsong, nor polyphony with Gothic — since the new Romanesque already embodies, with note-for-note organum, the principles from which Gothic would spring. But to the extent that Christendom with its patristic reverence continually shapes contrasts of new and old, a Perotin Quadruplum (here from the Deller "Vidêrunt Omnes")

71) *Le Mans, outside, from the Northwest, Romanesque nave and Gothic transept (CGB '74)*



may accompany the Gothic east-end of Le Mans as it springs from the lower containment of the nave.

Music: Perotin, c. 1220(?), from "Vidêrunt Omnes" (2nd sect. plainsong, and 4-voice, from "Jubilate") BG-S 5045

- 72) *Same, Le Mans, 11th-12th cent. N. aisle of Nave (CGB '74)*  
 (with plainsong close)
- 1st 73) *Same, 13th cent., Choir, buttressing, from the NE (CGB '74)*  
 (with Quadruplum)
- 1st 74) *Same, Choir, interior, N side, with columns (CGB '74); video makes two views of the vertical slide, above, then below*  
 (fade Perotin)

Here, even in the Gothic choir, the supporting columns preserve the stability of Romanesque — as the quadruplum not only follows, but itself rests on plainsong.

- Va2nd 73)  
*Lower section of slide 76 ff., detail of Apse arches and windows (CGB '74)*
- 2nd 73 and 74)  
*A closer copy of 1st 73, above (CGB '74)*

Though with the tour-de-force of Le Mans choir, we should play the liveliest recorded Quadruplum (attributed to Perotin), a motet of victory over death — *Mors* — sung after de Van's death by his masterly syncopators.

Music: Attributed to Perotin, c. 1220(?), 4-voice Motet, "Mors," from OL 232

- V2nd 74)  
*Same, interior, S. side of Choir from N. Transept (CGB '74); lower detail*
- 75) *Le Mans Choir, S side, from N Aisle: arches and clerestory (CGB '74)*
- 76) *Same, Apse: arches, windows, and vault, (CGB '74; lower spread has been videoed as Va2nd 73; here, video uses only the upper spread)*
- 77) *Same, from S. Aisle: rhythm of arch and piers (CGB '74; after which, video reverts to upper detail of slide 74)*  
 (end Mors)

In this return to high-Gothic, the style we compared at the beginning to dawn, it may seem that we have misapplied the metaphor, since in the display of Le Mans choir, we are already in the blaze of Gothic sun. From which soul may well long back to the mystical glimmer of true dawn, as from these canny rhythms to the shifting "Duplum vel Purum" of Leonin.

- Va78) Chartres, 1145: a wider view, right of the main portal*
- 78) Same, Kings and Queens of Judah: the four figures to the right of the Main Portal; first, a video detail of the central two*
- 78a) Same, detail of the King second from the left; video uses V78a, another King*
- 78b) Same, detail of another of the Queens*
- V78c) Same, detail of still another King of Judah*

Back where the Kings and Queens of Judah smile from the columnar distance of Chartres. The road there is of Grail romance, Chretien's Knight of the Cart, where Lancelot crosses the bridge of a single sword to rescue Guinevere (always such sacred resonances) from "the Land from which no Stranger returns". Those Arthurian knights inhabit the anagogical dream, before the codification of space, time and cause ("Why, when, and where?") sapped the life of chivalry. There men swim in telepathic mystery: Lancelot rides to the queen's rescue before he could have learned of her capture; he mounts the shameful cart on the blind promise of news — a disgrace of which everyone thereafter is aware, even the Queen in the other country, who blames him, not for mounting, but for the converse love-fault of a moment's hesitation. With how spectral a smile the lover in that realm gazes from a castle window at the glimpsed procession of the Queen, her captor and the wounded Kay:

- a79) Still Chartres, c. 1150, Angel of the Sundial; + V detail*
- 79) Same, but the plaster cast, Musée des Monuments, Paris (CGB '80); video shows details only*
- 79a) Back to a detail of the Chartres original (a79); video: head only*

And early at the dawning hour  
 The gentle lady of the tower  
 Called for the sacrament of mass,  
 And waked the knights and bid them dress;  
 And when the mass was sung and said,  
 The one knight sat with pensive head  
 (He who had ridden in the cart)

At a little window just apart,  
 And looked into the open land.  
 To the other window near at hand  
 The maiden came, and as she stood,  
 My lord Gawain with her abode  
 And spoke with her a word or two,  
 But what they spoke I do not know;  
 Their private words I cannot tell,  
 But as they leaned on the window sill,  
 Along the fields by a river clear  
 They saw one carried in a bier.  
 It was a wounded knight who was borne,  
 And by his side to weep and mourn  
 Three maidens walked in sorrow strong.  
 After the bier there followed along  
 A company, and at their head  
 A proud knight rode in arms, and led  
 A lady by the bridle rein.  
 And that knight saw it was the Queen.  
 At the high window still he stood  
 And followed her as long as he could  
 With eager eyes and with delight  
 Until she had passed out of his sight.  
 And when he saw that she was gone,  
 He thought at once to throw him down  
 And break his body on the stones. (CGB)

As in the enigmatic smile of the Chartres Angel of the Sundial, childish simplicity here is of a piece with magic skill.

- Va80) Again, Chartres, 1145-50, (from 643, above) A Queen of Judah; detail of face only*
- b80) Return to upper half of 79, Angel of the Sundial, plaster cast, Musée des Monuments, Paris (CGB '80); video shows face only*
- c80) Provence, c. 1169, Beardless Prophet (or St. Michael?) from the façade of St. Gilles du Gard, near Arles (waist up); + V detail*
- Vd80) Return to Christ detail of 41, above: Gislebertus, Christ and the Magdalene, S. Lazare, Autun (CGB '80)*
- Ve80) Return to face of Moissac, C. 1130, Prophet holding a scroll, detail of 43, above*
- Vf80) Return to head of Angel of the Sundial, Chartres, from 79a, above*

80) *Again, head of St. Gilles du Garde, c. 1160, Beardless Prophet, detail of c80, above*

Such the sustained-tone melting through love's discords into the octave or fifth. Such the recovered paradise in the Easter sequence by Abelard's successor Adam de Saint Victor — the "paradisi gaudium" which is also the springtime of earth:

Coelum fit serenius,  
Et Mare tranquillius,  
Spirat aura levius,  
Vallis nostra floruit.

The heavens quiet be  
And tranquil is the sea,  
The winds blow tenderly,  
The vales of our land flower. (CGB)

The Gilles-du-Garde beardless prophet is a paradigm of that lyrical self-giving. How the face blends with emasculated Abelard's Easter hymn, another paradise recovered:

Vera Jerusalem  
est illa civitas ...

Jerusalem is the city  
Of everlasting peace...  
There finds the dreamer waking  
Truth beyond dreaming far,  
Nor is the heart's possessing  
Less than the heart's desire. (Waddell)

So too the promise of Leonin's "Judea and Jerusalem," twice heard, and now, triune:

Music: Again Leonin, Judea et Jerusalem, 1st duplum, from ARC 14068