

NEW YORK ANTITRUST AND CONSUMER PROTECTION LAW

(THIRD EDITION)

Editors:

Barbara Hart, Esq.

Robert Hubbard, Esq.

Stephen S. Madsen, Esq.

New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2011
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-321-0
Product Number: 40258

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface		xi
Chapter 1	New York Antitrust Law—The Donnelly Act..... <i>Elai Katz, Esq.</i>	1
Chapter 2	Unfair and Deceptive Business Practices..... <i>April Tabor, Esq.</i>	39
Chapter 3	Government Enforcement under Executive Law § 63(12)	57
	<i>Paul R. Braunsdorf, Esq.</i> <i>Gregory J. McDonald, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 4	Private Enforcement..... <i>Jennifer B. Patterson</i>	73
Chapter 5	Settlements of Government Antitrust Cases	93
	<i>Lawrence I. Fox, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 6	Multistate Enforcement of Antitrust and Consumer Protection Laws—An Overview.....	209
	<i>Emily Myers, Esq.</i>	
About the Contributors		231
Table of Authorities.....		233

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface		xi
Chapter 1	New York Antitrust Law—The Donnelly Act	
	<i>Elai Katz, Esq.</i>	
[1.0]	I. Introduction	3
[1.1]	II. Legislative History and the Antitrust Laws.....	3
[1.2]	A. New York Statutory and Common Law Background of the Donnelly Act.....	4
[1.3]	B. Legislative History Surrounding the Passage of the Donnelly Act	5
[1.4]	III. Contemporary Interpretation of the Donnelly Act in Light of Federal Sherman Act Cases.....	7
[1.5]	IV. Donnelly Act Basics: Key Areas of Antitrust Law in the Donnelly Act	9
[1.6]	A. Overview—Statutory Language	9
[1.7]	B. Concerted Activity and “Arrangements”	9
[1.8]	C. Monopolization.....	11
[1.9]	D. Agreements among Competitors	13
[1.10]	E. Agreements Between Buyers and Sellers.....	16
[1.11]	1. Agreements on Resale Prices	16
[1.12]	2. Non-Price Agreements Between Buyers and Sellers	17
[1.13]	F. Refusals to Deal.....	17
[1.14]	G. Tying Arrangements	18
[1.15]	H. Attempts	20
[1.16]	I. Damages and Penalties	21
[1.17]	1. Treble Damage Actions	21
[1.18]	2. Criminal Penalties	22
[1.19]	3. Civil Penalties.....	23
[1.20]	V. Price Discrimination	23
[1.21]	VI. Immunities, Exemptions and Defenses to Antitrust Liability	24
[1.22]	A. State and Local Government Action	25
[1.23]	B. Statutory Exemptions and Defenses	25
[1.24]	1. Labor.....	25
[1.25]	2. Agriculture.....	27
[1.26]	3. Right to Contribution.....	27
[1.27]	C. Statutory Exemptions for Regulated Industries	27
[1.28]	1. Insurance.....	27

[1.29]	2. Utilities	29
[1.30]	3. Farmers Cooperatives	30
[1.31]	4. Motor Carrier Rate Bureaus	30
[1.32]	5. Solid Waste Disposal	30
[1.33]	D. Judicially Created Exemptions and Defenses.....	30
[1.34]	1. Licensed Professionals	30
[1.35]	2. Nonprofit Charitable Associations	31
[1.36]	3. Oil and Natural Gas	31
[1.37]	4. Petitioning Activity.....	32
[1.38]	5. Primary Jurisdiction Doctrine.....	32
[1.39]	6. <i>In Pari Delicto</i>	33
[1.40]	7. Unclean Hands.....	33
[1.41]	E. Witnesses' Immunities	34
[1.42]	VII. Federal Preemption.....	34
[1.43]	A. Introduction	34
[1.44]	B. Claim Preclusion.....	37
[1.45]	VIII. Statute of Limitations	38

Chapter 2 Unfair and Deceptive Business Practices

April Tabor, Esq.

[2.0]	I. Statutory Authority	41
[2.1]	A. Unlawful Practices under N.Y. General Business Law § 349 and § 350 (GBL)	41
[2.2]	1. Employers.....	42
[2.3]	2. Doctors.....	43
[2.4]	B. Remedies	43
[2.5]	1. Remedies Available to the State Attorney General	43
[2.6]	2. Remedies Available to Private Plaintiffs.....	44
[2.7]	C. Federal Consumer Protection Law	45
[2.8]	II. Cases.....	47
[2.9]	A. "Consumer-Oriented" Transaction	48
[2.10]	B. Misrepresentation in a Material Way	52
[2.11]	C. Injury to P "by Reason of" D's Conduct	54
[2.12]	1. "Actual Harm"/Causation.....	54
[2.13]	2. Statute of Limitations	56

Chapter 3 Government Enforcement under Executive Law § 63(12)

Paul R. Braunsdorf, Esq.

Gregory J. McDonald, Esq.

[3.0]	I.	Introduction	59
[3.1]	II.	The Statute.....	59
[3.2]	A.	Text of Executive Law § 63(12).....	59
[3.3]	B.	Legislative History	60
[3.4]	C.	Broad Applicability of the Statute.....	61
[3.5]	D.	Key Terms and Their Judicial Interpretation..	62
[3.6]	1.	Fraud or Fraudulent	62
[3.7]	2.	Illegality.....	64
[3.8]	3.	Persistent or Repeated Conduct.....	66
[3.9]	III.	Investigatory Powers of the Attorney General	66
[3.10]	IV.	Proceedings under § 63(12).....	67
[3.11]	V.	Remedies	68
[3.12]	A.	Injunctive Relief	69
[3.13]	B.	Restitution and Damages	69
[3.14]	C.	Cancellation of Business Certificate and Recovery of Penalties and Allowance.....	70
[3.15]	VI.	Practical Considerations	71

Chapter 4 Private Enforcement

Jennifer B. Patterson

[4.0]	I.	Introduction	75
[4.1]	II.	Private Enforcement under the Donnelly Act— Select Issues.....	76
[4.2]	A.	Indirect Purchasers Can Sue for Damages	76
[4.3]	B.	Remoteness Challenge Upheld Despite Donnelly Act Amendment.....	78
[4.4]	C.	Class Actions in State Court Are Barred under the Donnelly Act	78
[4.5]	D.	The Donnelly Act Prohibition Against Duplicate Recovery	81
[4.6]	III.	The New York Consumer Protection Act— GBL § 349	82
[4.7]	A.	Remoteness Bar to Standing under GBL § 349	83
[4.8]	B.	Class Actions under GBL § 349	84
[4.9]	C.	Judicial Bar to Duplicate Recovery under GBL § 349	85
[4.10]	D.	GBL § 349 Claims Require Actual Deception of Consumers	85

[4.11]	IV.	Unjust Enrichment.....	88
[4.12]	V.	The New York False Claims Act.....	89
[4.13]	A.	Introduction	89
[4.14]	B.	<i>Qui Tam</i> Actions for False Claims	90
[4.15]	C.	Construction of the Act.....	91

Chapter 5 Settlements of Government Antitrust Cases

Lawrence I. Fox, Esq.

[5.0]	I.	Introduction	95
[5.1]	II.	Considerations in Settling.....	96
[5.2]	A.	Advantages of Settling.....	96
[5.3]	B.	Disadvantages of Settling	98
[5.4]	C.	Bilateral Settlements in Multiparty Cases	98
[5.5]	D.	Effect of Judgment Sharing/Indemnification Agreements on Advisability of Settlement....	99
[5.6]	E.	Third-Party Intervention	100
[5.7]	F.	Use of Settlement or Consent Decree as Evidence in Subsequent Litigation	102
[5.8]	G.	Collateral Estoppel Effect of Antitrust Settlement	103
[5.9]	H.	Anticompetitive Effects and Implications of Settlement Agreements.....	105
[5.10]	I.	Timing Issues: When to Settle.....	105
[5.11]	J.	Court Approval of Settlement Agreements	106
[5.12]	K.	Violation of Consent Decrees.....	109
[5.13]	1.	Introduction	109
[5.14]	2.	The Issue of Interpretation.....	109
[5.15]	3.	Recent Developments	111
[5.16]	L.	Modification & Termination Decrees.....	111
[5.17]	1.	The Early Years	111
[5.18]	2.	Current Law	112
[5.19]	3.	Modification and the Continuing Microsoft Saga.....	113
[5.20]	III.	Form and Contents of Settlement Agreements.....	115
[5.21]	A.	Opening Statement	115
[5.22]	1.	Parties	115
[5.23]	2.	Preamble	115
[5.24]	B.	Definitions of Terms.....	117
[5.25]	C.	Agreement	118
[5.26]	1.	Scope of the Settlement	118
[5.27]	2.	Bona Fides	119
[5.28]	3.	Class Certification	119

[5.29]	D. Injunction.....	120
[5.30]	1. Injunctive Relief	120
[5.31]	2. Divestiture and Dissolution	120
[5.32]	3. Rights Retained by Company	121
[5.33]	E. Administration Account	121
[5.34]	1. Amount of Payment.....	121
[5.35]	2. Nonconsummation Clause.....	122
[5.36]	3. Event of Nonparticipation by States	123
[5.37]	4. Residual Funds	123
[5.38]	5. Administration of Moneys Paid as Settlement	124
[5.39]	F. Restitution.....	125
[5.40]	1. Nonadmission of Liability	125
[5.41]	2. Use of Funds Paid.....	126
[5.42]	3. <i>Cy Pres</i> revisions in Consent Decrees.....	129
[5.43]	a. <i>Cy Pres</i> Distribution in Settlements, Generally	129
[5.44]	b. <i>Cy Pres</i> Distribution in Antitrust Consent Decrees.....	129
[5.45]	4. Event of Nonparticipation by States	132
[5.46]	5. Attorney Fees for Private Plaintiffs	132
[5.47]	G. Affirmative Relief	133
[5.48]	H. Claims Procedure.....	134
[5.49]	1. Identification of Class Members	135
[5.50]	2. Distribution.....	135
[5.51]	3. Additional Payments	135
[5.52]	I. Preliminary Approval and Notice.....	135
[5.53]	1. Notice by Mail to Qualified Consumers	136
[5.54]	2. Notice by Publication of Advertisements	136
[5.55]	3. Right of Qualified Purchasers to Opt Out of Settlement.....	137
[5.56]	J. Enforcement	138
[5.57]	1. Continued Jurisdiction of the Court	138
[5.58]	2. Institution of an Action if Settlement Is Breached	138
[5.59]	3. Inspection	139
[5.60]	4. Compliance Procedures	139
[5.61]	K. Implementation.....	141
[5.62]	1. Application for Court Approval	142
[5.63]	2. Entry of Final Judgment	143

[5.64]	3.	Dismissal of Claims	143
[5.65]	4.	Release by States	143
[5.66]	5.	Nonadmission by Defendants	144
[5.67]	6.	Event of Disapproval by the Court	144
[5.68]	7.	Bona Fides	145
[5.69]	L.	Benefit and Binding Effect	145
[5.70]	M.	Term.....	145
[5.71]	N.	Information Disclosed During Settlement	146
[5.72]	1.	Tunney Act Section 16(b): Publication of Information.....	146
[5.73]	2.	Standard Provisions	147
[5.74]	O.	Agreement Voidable.....	147
[5.75]	P.	Bankruptcy Provisions: Language and Purpose	148
[5.76]	Q.	Integration Clause.....	149
[5.77]	IV.	Conclusion	150
Appendix A		Settlement Agreement (Sample 1).....	151
Appendix B		Settlement Agreement (Sample 2).....	167
Appendix C		Settlement Agreement (Sample 3).....	187
Appendix D		Settlement Agreement (Sample 4).....	195

Chapter 6 Multistate Enforcement of Antitrust and Consumer Protection Laws—An Overview

Emily Myers, Esq.

[6.0]	I.	Introduction	211
[6.1]	II.	Legal Authority.....	211
[6.2]	A.	Federal Law	211
[6.3]	B.	State Law	214
[6.4]	III.	Multistate Enforcement	218
[6.5]	A.	Antitrust	219
[6.6]	B.	Consumer Protection	224
[6.7]	IV.	The National Association of Attorneys General....	226
[6.8]	A.	Competition and Consumer Protection Advocacy	228
[6.9]	B.	Enforcement Guidelines	229
		About the Contributors	231
		Table of Authorities.....	233

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

PAUL BRAUNSDORF, ESQ.

Paul Braunsdorf is a partner in the Rochester law firm of Harris Beach PLLC, where his primary areas of practice are antitrust law (both litigation and counseling) and commercial litigation. A graduate of the University of Virginia Law School, he is a member of the American Bar Association's Antitrust Section and Litigation Section. He is also a member of the New York State Bar Association's Antitrust Law Section and Trial Lawyers Section. (He has been a member of the Antitrust Law Section's Executive Committee for several years.) He was a contributing author for the *Antitrust Health Care Handbook II* (ABA 1993) as well as a contributing author for both *Antitrust Law in New York State* (1993) and *Antitrust Law in New York State* (Second Edition, 2002). He has lectured on various antitrust and litigation topics for the New York State and Monroe County Bar Associations.

LAWRENCE I. FOX, ESQ.

Lawrence I. Fox is the partner principally responsible for McDermott Will & Emery's Distribution Law & Strategies Group and is also the head of the Antitrust and Competition practice of the firm's New York office. He has represented clients in handling investigations, litigations and trials commenced by private plaintiffs as well as federal and state antitrust authorities. His distribution practice includes advising clients regarding their domestic and international activities.

ELAI KATZ, ESQ.

Elai Katz is a partner at Cahill Gordon & Reindel LLP, where his practice focuses on a wide range of antitrust law matters, including mergers and acquisitions, counseling, litigation and government investigations. He is a member of the Executive Committee of the New York State Bar Association's Antitrust Law Section. Elai writes a monthly column on antitrust law in the *New York Law Journal* and is recognized among the top antitrust lawyers in New York by *Chambers USA*. Elai earned his B.A. at Yale University and studied law at Columbia Law School.

GREGORY J. MCDONALD, ESQ.

Gregory J. McDonald, a partner in the Rochester, New York office of Bond, Schoeneck & King, PLLC, concentrates on business and commercial litigation. He received his J.D. from Pace University School of Law, magna cum laude, and his undergraduate degree from Tulane University.

EMILY MYERS, ESQ.

Emily Myers is Antitrust Counsel at the National Association of Attorneys General. Before joining NAAG in 1993, she was an associate in the Washington office of Squire, Sanders & Dempsey. She received her law degree in 1987 from the University of Pennsylvania, where she was an Arthur C. Littleton Legal Writing Instructor, and her undergraduate degree in History from Brown University in 1982. She is the author of the “State Enforcement” chapter of the ABA publication *Antitrust Law Developments V*, as well as several annual updates to the treatise. Emily also works on Attorney General powers and duties cases and is the editor of *State Attorneys General Powers and Responsibilities*, a treatise on state Attorneys General, published in 2007.

JENNIFER B. PATTERSON, ESQ.

Jennifer B. Patterson is a partner at Kaye Scholer LLP, where her practice focuses on antitrust law (including litigation, mergers, and counseling) and commercial litigation. She is a co-author of a chapter on U.S. antitrust law in *the Frankfurter Kommentar: Kartellrecht*, a German antitrust law treatise, and has lectured on various antitrust topics in both Germany and the U.S. Jennifer received her law degree from the Georgetown University Law Center and her undergraduate degree from Vanderbilt University.

APRIL TABOR, ESQ.

April Tabor is a Senior Attorney at the Federal Trade Commission and Vice President at Silver Starr Art Studios LLC. She was a partner at McDermott Will & Emery LLP. She graduated from Columbia University and Georgetown University Law Center.