



**NEW YORK LAWYERS'
PRACTICAL SKILLS SERIES**

2023–2024

New York Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits
Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Michelle Itkowitz, Esq.

New York State Bar Association publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207 or publications@nysba.org.

Copyright 2023
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 978-1-57969-284-1
Product Number: 416924

CONTENTS

§ 1.1	Introduction.....	1
§ 1.2	The COVID-19 Emergency Eviction and Foreclosure Prevention Act of 2020	3
§ 1.3	The Tenancy	4
	[A] Elements of a Lease	11
	[1] Oral vs. Written Leases.....	11
	[2] The Parties	13
	[3] The Premises	16
	[4] Rent	19
	[5] Default	20
	[6] Recording of Leases.....	21
	[B] Market Rentals	22
	[C] Rent Regulation	22
	[1] Rent-Stabilized Premises	24
	[a] Rent Stabilization Coverage	24
	[b] Tenants' Rights Under Rent Stabilization	26
	(1) The Right of Renewal	26
	(2) Limits on Rent	28
	(3) Succession and Enhanced Remedies for Tenants Regarding the Landlord's Failure to Make Required Repairs	33
	[c] Exemptions From Rent Stabilization	33
	[2] Rent-Controlled Premises	44
	[3] Rent-Overcharge Claims.....	47
	[a] Rent-Overcharge Claims Generally	47
	[b] Calculating Damages in Overcharge Claims	51
	[4] Succession Rights	54
	[5] Preferential Rents.....	61
	[D] Public Housing.....	63
	[E] Section 8 (Tenant and Project-Based) Housing.....	65
	[1] The Voucher Program.....	65
	[2] Project-Based Section 8	70
	[F] Cooperatives and Condominiums	71
	[1] Cooperatives Generally.....	71
	[2] Cooperative and Condominium Conversions	74
	[3] Condominiums.....	76
	[4] Subsidized/Regulated Cooperatives Under the Private Housing Finance Law	77
	[a] Housing Development Fund Companies	77
	[b] Limited-Profit Housing Companies (Mitchell-Lama Housing).....	78
	[G] Lofts	79
	[H] Hotels and Single-Room Occupancy Buildings (SROs)	82
§ 1.4	Tenancy Protections.....	85
	[A] Housing Discrimination	85
	[B] Warranty of Habitability	88
§ 1.5	Conveying the Tenancy	93
§ 1.6	Summary Proceedings	96

[A]	Introduction to Summary Proceedings	96
[1]	Overview.....	96
[2]	The Basic Structure of Modern Summary Proceedings.....	100
[a]	Pleadings	100
[b]	Governing Procedural Statutes	101
[c]	Counterclaims and Jury Waivers	101
[d]	Attorney Fees and Costs	102
[e]	Types of Summary Proceedings	102
[B]	Holdover Proceedings.....	104
[1]	Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants.....	106
[2]	Grounds for Holdover Proceeding Against Tenants—Breach of a Substantial Obligation of the Tenancy	108
[a]	Unauthorized Sublets	108
[b]	Pets.....	112
[c]	Alterations.....	115
[d]	Specified Use or Purpose	116
[3]	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Wrongful Acts of Tenants and Nuisance	117
[a]	Nuisance.....	117
[b]	Hoarding	120
[c]	Chronic Late Payment of Rent.....	120
[d]	Access	122
[e]	Destruction of the Premises	123
[f]	Illegal Occupancy	123
[g]	Illegal Use	124
[4]	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Separate Grounds to Recover Rent-Regulated Units	128
[a]	Nonprimary Residence	128
[b]	Owner’s Use	134
[c]	Recovery for Use by Nonprofit Institution	138
[d]	Demolition	138
	(1) Application and Requirements Under Rent Stabilization	139
	(2) Notice Requirements Under Rent Stabilization.....	141
	(3) Administrative Orders, Conditions and Tenant Protections Under Rent Stabilization.....	142
	(4) Distinctions Between Rent Control and Rent Stabilization	144
[e]	Withdrawal from the Rental Market	145
[f]	Eviction Plan.....	145
[g]	Failure to Renew	145
[h]	Profiteering	146
[5]	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Nontenants.....	148
[a]	Proceedings by Purchasers in Foreclosure.....	148
[b]	Licensee Proceedings.....	149
[c]	Squatters.....	151
[d]	Occupant Remaining in Possession After Sale of the Premises	151
[e]	Vendee in Possession After Default Under Contract of Sale	152
[f]	Occupant Under Cultivation Agreement	152
[g]	Employer-Employee Proceedings.....	152

	[h] Occupant After Termination of Life Estate	154
	[i] Occupant by Forcible or Unlawful Entry	154
[6]	Predicate Notices	154
	[a] Overview.....	154
	[b] Notice to Cure.....	155
	[c] Notice of Termination.....	156
	[d] Timeliness of Notices Served by Mail.....	165
[7]	Notice of Petition and Petition.....	165
	[a] Notice of Petition/Service/Necessary Parties	165
	(1) Issuance of the Notice of Petition	165
	(2) Timing for Service of the Notice of Petition and Petition	166
	[b] Contents of the Petition.....	169
	(1) General Requirements.....	169
	(2) Description of the Premises Sought to Be Recovered	170
	(3) Statement of the Parties' Interests in the Premises Sought to Be Recovered	171
	(4) Regulatory Status of the Premises and Compliance With the Applicable Rent Regulation Laws	173
	(5) Verification of the Petition	174
	(6) Liberalization of Pleading Requirements	174
	(7) Alternative Pleadings.....	174
	(8) Inquests	176
[C]	Nonpayment Proceedings	177
	[1] Proper Parties	177
	[2] Elements of a Nonpayment Proceeding.....	177
	[3] What May Be Recovered as Rent in a Nonpayment Proceeding	178
	[4] Rent Demands.....	180
	[a] Overview.....	180
	[b] Contents of the Rent Demand.....	180
	[c] Modifying Notice Requirements by Agreement Between the Parties.....	182
	[d] Compliance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	183
	[5] Notice of Petition and Petition.....	184
	[6] Defaults.....	185
	[7] Spiegel Law	186
	[8] Bankruptcy.....	187
[D]	Answering a Summary Proceeding.....	188
[E]	General and Affirmative Defenses to Summary Proceedings	191
	[1] Overview.....	191
	[2] Traverse/Service	193
	[3] Lack of Multiple Dwelling Registration in New York City	193
	[4] Lack of a Proper Certificate of Occupancy	194
	[5] Failure Accurately to State Regulatory Status and Comply with Rent Laws.....	195
	[6] Omitting or Misstating Required Elements of the Petition.....	196
	[7] Lack of Proper Predicate Notice/Rent Demand Notice	196
	[8] Predicate Notice Vitiating/Tenancy Reinstated	196
	[9] Retaliatory Eviction	196

[10]	A Laches Defense in a Nonpayment Proceeding.....	197
[11]	Conditions	199
[12]	Actual Eviction/Constructive Eviction	199
[13]	Statute of Limitations.....	201
[14]	Succession Rights	201
[15]	Waiver of a Breach of Lease.....	201
[16]	Illusory Tenancy Doctrine (Licensee or Subtenant Is Actually the Rent-Stabilized Tenant)	201
	[a] Professional Operator Tenants.....	202
	[b] Profiteering	203
	[c] Alter Ego / Strawman	203
	[d] Collusion / Constructive Knowledge.....	203
	[e] Subtenant Expectations.....	204
[F]	Recovery of Use and Occupancy in Summary Proceedings.....	204
[G]	Disclosure in Summary Proceedings	208
[H]	Rent Deposits/Pendente Lite Use and Occupancy.....	210
[I]	Stays, Warrant, Cures	212
	[1] Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Nonpayment Proceedings	212
	[2] Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Holdover Proceedings	214
	[a] Ten-Day Stay of Warrant of Eviction in Breach of Lease Holdover Proceedings.....	214
	[b] Extension of the Post-Judgment Cure to Holdover Proceedings Based on Grounds Other Than Breach of Lease	216
	(1) Non-Renewal of a Rent Stabilized Lease	216
	(2) Failure to Give Access.....	216
	(3) Nuisance.....	216
	(4) Unavailability of a Post-Judgment Cure in Certain Types of Holdover Proceedings.....	217
	(5) Public Policy Against Forfeiture of Tenancies in New York	218
	(6) Non-Residential Tenants and Tenants Outside the City of New York	219
	[3] General Powers to Stay Warrants in Summary Proceedings.....	219
	[4] Stay of the Proceeding Itself Before or After Judgment.....	220
[J]	Service of Process in Summary Proceedings.....	221
	[1] Overview of “Traverse” in Summary Proceedings.....	221
	[2] Service Requirements	222
	[3] Challenging Service	226
	[4] Process Server Rules and Regulations in the City of New York.....	227
	[a] Overview of Rules	227
	[b] Licensing Requirements/Process Servers and Process Server Agencies.....	228
	[c] Mandatory Posting of Bonds	228
	[d] Record-Keeping Requirements.....	229
	[e] GPS Technology	229
	[f] Judicial Actions and Proceedings/Claims for Improper Service/Traverse Hearings	230
	[g] Exemptions	230
[K]	Alleging a Respondent’s Military Status	230

[L]	Competency of Parties to a Landlord-Tenant Proceeding, Including the Unrepresented, Non-English Speakers, and Those Needing Guardians Ad Litem	232
[M]	Settlements and Stipulations in Landlord-Tenant Summary Proceedings.....	235
	[1] Stipulations in General.....	235
	[2] Strategic Considerations in Landlord-Tenant Settlements	238
	[a] Whether to Continue the Tenancy	238
	[b] Whether to Break the Lease.....	239
	[c] Whether the Tenant is Rent-Regulated.....	239
	[3] Elements of Stipulations of Settlement.....	239
	[a] Whereas Clauses	240
	[b] Judgment of Possession and Warrant of Eviction—Strategic Considerations	240
	[c] Itemize Arrears and Money Judgment.....	241
	[d] Payment Applied First to Current Rent Due.....	242
	[e] Motion Practice Resolved	242
	[f] Security Deposit.....	242
	[g] Further Orders to Show Cause.....	242
	[h] If the Tenant is Vacating.....	243
	[i] Repairs	243
	[j] Attorney Fees.....	243
	[k] Default	243
	[l] Probationary Periods.....	244
	[4] Special Elements for Rent-Regulation Buyout Agreements.....	244
	[a] Anti-Harassment Considerations	245
	[b] Using a Separate Agreement Outside of the Court Stipulation of Settlement	245
[N]	Enforcing Warrants of Eviction and Orders of Possession.....	246
[O]	Post-Eviction Relief.....	247
	[1] Legal-Fees Provisions.....	250
§ 1.7	Landlord-Tenant Actions and Proceedings Other Than Nonpayment and Holdover Proceedings	256
	[A] Ejectment Actions.....	256
	[B] HP Proceedings.....	259
	[C] Rent Stabilized Tenants Can File a DHCR “Application for a Rent Reduction Based Upon Decreased Services in an Individual Apartment”	265
	[D] Article 7-A Proceedings.....	266
	[E] Proceedings Under the Tenant Protection Act in New York City	267
	[1] Expanded Definitions of Harassment	268
	[2] Presumption of Intent.....	269
	[a] Penalties for Harassment	269
	[F] Illegal Lockout/Unlawful Eviction Actions and Proceedings	270
	[1] Overview.....	270
	[2] Summary Proceedings to Be Restored to Possession	270
	[3] Criminal Penalties.....	272
	[4] Plenary Actions for Damages/RPAPL 853.....	272
	[5] Defenses Against Illegal Lockout Allegations	273
	[G] Foreclosure Proceedings	273

	[H] Yellowstone Injunction Actions	280
	[I] Plenary Actions Between Landlords and Tenants	282
	[J] Rent Strikes.....	283
	[K] Class Actions	284
	[1] Numerosity.....	285
	[2] Commonality	285
	[3] Typicality	286
	[4] Adequate Representation	286
	[5] Waiver of Treble Damages	286
	[6] Superiority	286
§ 1.8	Leaving the Premises	287
	[A] Abandonment and Surrender of Possession.....	287
	[B] Security Deposit.....	289
§ 1.9	The Pandemic and Its Effects on Residential Landlord and Tenant Law and Procedure	291
	[A] Expired Protections for Residential Tenants During the Pandemic	292
	[1] The COVID-19 Emergency Eviction and Foreclosure Prevention Act of 2020	292
	[B] Administrative Orders and Civil Court Directives Applicable After CEEFPA and TSHA Expiration	293
§ 1.10	Courts That Award Possession of Real Property.....	295
	[A] Overview of Which Courts Adjudicate Summary Proceedings in Which Geographic Locations	295
	[B] Supreme Court	295
	[C] The New York City Civil Court	296
	[D] New York State District Courts (Nassau and Suffolk Counties).....	300
	[E] City Court	301
	[1] The Housing Part of Buffalo City Court.....	301
	[a] History	301
	[b] Code Violation Actions	301
	(1) The Initial Impetus Behind the Problem-Solving Model— District-by-District Scheduling.....	302
	(2) Use of Housing Court Liaisons	303
	(3) Arraignment	304
	(4) Use of Interlocutory Orders	305
	(a) Orders to Vacate	305
	(b) Demolition Orders	306
	(c) Receiverships	306
	(d) Case-Specific Orders	306
	(5) The Funding Calendar	307
	(6) Sentencing.....	307
	[c] Evictions	310
	(1) Accessibility.....	311
	(2) Legal Representation for Qualifying Tenants.....	311
	(3) Linkage	311
	(4) Stays Until Housing Violations Are Addressed	312

	(5) Stipulations	312
	(6) Mandatory Mediation	313
	(7) Habitability Investigations and Hearings.....	313
	(8) Duty to Repair in the Commercial Setting.....	314
	(9) Hearing Before the Court Attorney/Referee	314
	(10) Money Judgments and Appearances in the Buffalo City Court ..	314
	(11) Attorneys Signing Petitions	315
	(12) Control of Out Dates.....	315
	(13) Evictions in Section 8 Tenancies	316
	(14) Conclusion	316
	[2] City Courts Outside Buffalo and the City of New York.....	317
	[a] Binghamton City Court.....	317
[F]	Town and Village Courts	319
	[1] Overview.....	319
	[2] Eviction Proceedings Specific to Town and Village Courts in Upstate New York	320
	[3] Town and Village Courts: Jurisdiction and Venue	321
	[4] Notice of Petition	322
	[5] Petition	323
	[6] Service	323
[G]	Surrogate’s Court	324
[H]	County Courts	324
[I]	Federal Courts	324
§ 1.11	Appeals	325
§ 1.12	Conclusion	330
Appendix 1	The COVID-19 Emergency Eviction and Foreclosure Prevention Act of 2020, Notice/Hardship Declaration Form and Affidavit of Service	331
Appendix 2	New York’s Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act of 2019: What Lawyers Must Know	351
	New York Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure Forms Index	379
	Table of Authorities	395
	About the Authors.....	453

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The coauthors of the 2023–2024 edition thank Rachel E. Miller Esq., Judge Lebovits’s assistant court attorney, and Town of DeWitt Justice Samuel C. Young for their contributions. The authors of the fourteenth (2021–2022) and thirteenth (2020–2021) editions thank Hon. Michael L. Weisberg for his co-authorship of the twelfth (2019–2020) edition; Hon. Carol A. Cocchiola, a Binghamton City Court judge, for updating the City Court section; Dov Trieman, Esq. for his co-authorship of the eleventh (2018–2019) and tenth (2017–2018) editions; Jeffrey R. Metz, Esq. for his co-authorship of the ninth edition (2016–2017); Michael B. Terk, Esq., for his co-authorship of the eighth (2015–2016), fifth (2012–2013) and fourth (2011–2012) editions; Peter K. Diskint, Esq., for co-authorship of the seventh (2014–2015) and sixth (2013–2014) editions; Victor S. Faleck, Esq., for his co-authorship of the third (2010–2011) and second (2009–2010) editions; and Dan M. Blumenthal, Esq., for his co-authorship of the first (2008–2009) edition. For their research on the sixth (2013–2014) edition, the authors thank Peter Kane, Esq., and Nancy Hassell of the Appellate Term, First Department, and law students Ian Steinberg (Cardozo) and James Steiner (New York Law School). For their research on the fourth (2011–2012) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Daphne Bareket (Florida International), Alison Genova (Fordham), and Hailey B. Render (Syracuse). For their research on the third (2010–2011) edition, the authors thank then-New York Law School students Deena M. Crimaldi and Alana Sliwinski. For their research on the second (2009–2010) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns P. Alex de Richemont (Harvard), Mariella Soussou (Fordham), and Mary Jane Yoon (Columbia). For their research on the first (2008–2009) edition, the authors thank Mary Ann Amodeo, Esq., Judge Lebovits’s court attorney Alexandra Standish, Esq., and Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Alana Wrublin (Fordham), Victor J. Brubaker (New York Law School), and Stephanie L. Torre (New York Law School). For writing the section on the Buffalo Housing Court and for providing the Buffalo Housing Court forms, the authors thank former Buffalo City Court judge, and now Supreme Court justice, Henry Nowak and now-retired court attorney/referee Mark Doane, Esq. For writing the section on the Justice Courts, the authors also thank Town of Bethlehem Justice Ryan Donovan and Katelyn Primono, Esq.

The authors would also like to thank the State Bar staff who worked on the book and the CLE program, including Kathryn Calista, Alex Dickson, Kirsten Downer, Reyna Eisenstark, Kimberly Francis, Christian Nolan, Naomi Pitts, and Kathy Suchocki.

HONORABLE GERALD LEOVITS

Hon. Gerald Lebovits has been a New York City judge since 2001. An acting Supreme Court justice in New York County, he serves as the president of the New York State Association of Acting Supreme Court Justices. He previously presided in Civil Court, for which he was the president of the Board of Judges of the New York City Civil Court; Criminal Court; and Housing Court, for which he served as the president of the Association of Housing Court Judges. A part-time teacher for 39 years, he is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Columbia Law School, Fordham University School of Law, and New York University School of Law and was an adjunct at St. John's University School of Law and New York Law School. Active in the New York State Bar Association, for which he has lectured at many Continuing Legal Education programs, he is a past Co-chair of the Association's Committee on Landlord and Tenant Proceedings, has authored the *Bar Journal's* Legal Writer column since 2001, and has published 35 articles in the Association's journals, 19 of them in the Association's *New York Real Property Law Journal*. A Canadian native, he graduated from the Ottawa (LL.L.), Tulane (M.C.L.), and New York University (LL.M.) law schools.

Justice Lebovits dedicates this book to his late father, Eugene Lebovits, a man of great courage and character.

DAMON P. HOWARD, ESQ.

Damon P. Howard practices real estate law in New York and New Jersey, with experience ranging from commercial litigation to residential and commercial landlord-tenant issues. He also advises owners, developers and lenders on real property tax benefit programs and performs due diligence to identify regulatory issues and potential liability that may affect real estate development plans, financing and valuation and to provide strategies to optimize rental revenue. As a litigator, he has represented clients in seminal cases in the State's highest courts. Damon has been published by the New York Law Journal and the Journal of Affordable Housing and he has lectured at bar association seminars and real estate classes as an expert on real estate litigation and administrative law. Mr. Howard is a graduate of the University of Texas at Austin and the Tulane University Law School. He is admitted to practice in New York, the Southern District of New York, New Jersey, and Louisiana.

MICHELLE ITKOWITZ, ESQ.

Michelle Itkowitz is the founder of Itkowitz PLLC, and she has been practicing commercial and complex-residential landlord and tenant litigation in the City of New York for over 25 years. She represents both landlords and tenants as a litigator and a consultant.

Ms. Itkowitz works on pretty much anything having to do with Rent Stabilization, including but not limited to: Rent Stabilization coverage issues; non-primary residence; succession rights; owner's use proceedings; chronic non-payment of rent; rent overcharges; substantial rehabilitation; preferential rents; illegal sublets; and 421-a and J-51 Rent Stabilization. She does extensive co-living consulting. She works on commercial landlord and tenant litigation, including good guy guaranty enforcement and defense, Yellowstone Injunctions, and commercial lease build out disputes. She handles the landlord and tenant aspects of development projects. She represents residential tenants in buyouts. She helps to clean up "hairy" buildings and apartments with chronic landlord and tenant problems. She works on matters having to do with short-term leasing problems (like Airbnb). Ms. Itkowitz works on matters involving special types of apartments, such as SROs (single room occupancy), luxury apart-

ments, co-op apartments, and Loft Law (interim multiple dwelling) apartments. She deals with all kinds of occupancy issues, regarding roommates, family members, subtenants, and running a business in an apartment.

Ms. Itkowitz creates and shares original and useful content on landlord and tenant law in the City of New York, through numerous articles, books, lectures, and continuing legal education presentations. She writes the commercial lease remedies and good guy guaranty litigation chapters for the New York State Bar Association's Commercial Leasing treatise. She is frequently quoted in the press on a variety of landlord and tenant issues. Every three years, she develops a fresh seven-part continuing legal education curriculum for Lawline entitled "Landlord and Tenant Litigation in New York." Lawline named her as one of their top faculty.

Ms. Itkowitz is the host of the very popular Tenant Law Podcast, which can be heard on Spotify, Apple, Amazon, Pandora, Castbox, or wherever you get your podcasts. She is a pioneer of Legal Project Management, a system by which project management principles are imposed upon the practice of law.

Ms. Itkowitz is immensely proud that Itkowitz PLLC was awarded its New York State Women Business Enterprise Certification by the Empire State Development Corporation. Her eponymous law firm is one of the largest women-owned law firms, by revenue, in the state.

Ms. Itkowitz is admitted to practice in New York State and the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York. She received a Bachelor of Arts in Political Science in 1989 from Union College and a Juris Doctor in 1992 from Brooklyn Law School. She began her legal career at Cullen & Dykman.