



A Guide to
No-Fault Insurance
in New York

Editors

John M. Nonna, Esq.

Christopher W. Healy, Esq.

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION

New York State Bar Association publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2021
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 978-1-57969-034-2
Product Number: 412721

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1 No-Fault Insurance

Skip Short, Esq.

Michael Billy, Jr., Esq.

Christopher O'Donnell, Esq.

Chapter 2 Motor Vehicle Coverage Issues

Anthony J. Piazza, Esq.

Mark T. Whitford, Jr., Esq.

Chapter 3 Exceeding the No-Fault Threshold: Serious Injury

Michael F. Chelus, Esq.

Michael M. Chelus, Esq.

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1 No-Fault Insurance

Skip Short, Esq.

Michael Billy, Jr., Esq.

Christopher O'Donnell, Esq.

[1.0]	I.	Introduction	1-3
[1.1]	II.	Eligible Injured Persons	1-5
[1.2]	III.	Timeliness of the Claim	1-7
[1.3]	A.	Timely Written Notice of Claim	1-8
[1.4]	B.	Timely Written Proof of Claim	1-10
[1.5]	1.	Definition of Proof of Claim	1-10
[1.6]	2.	Time Requirements for Proof of Claim	1-12
[1.7]	a.	Health Provider Bills	1-12
[1.8]	b.	Lost Wages and Other Necessary Expenses	1-12
[1.9]	c.	Responses to Verification Requests	1-13
[1.10]	IV.	Policy Exclusions	1-15
[1.11]	A.	Intoxication and/or Drug Impairment	1-16
[1.12]	1.	Only the Operator Is Excluded.....	1-16
[1.13]	2.	The Intoxication or Drug Impairment Must Be a Contributing Cause of the Accident.....	1-17
[1.14]	3.	A Criminal Conviction Is Not Necessary.....	1-18
[1.15]	4.	Definition of Intoxication and Drug Impairment	1-18
[1.16]	5.	Proof of Intoxication and/or Drug Impairment	1-18
[1.17]	6.	Presenting the Intoxication and/or Drug Impairment Defense	1-20
[1.18]	7.	Verification and Investigation.....	1-20
[1.19]	B.	Intentional Injuries	1-20
[1.20]	C.	Felonious Acts.....	1-23
[1.21]	D.	Avoidance of Apprehension or Arrest	1-23
[1.22]	E.	Race or Speed Test.....	1-24
[1.23]	F.	Stolen Vehicles.....	1-24
[1.24]	G.	Claimant Operating or Occupying His Uninsured Vehicle	1-25
[1.25]	H.	Pedestrian Injured by His Own Uninsured Vehicle	1-26
[1.26]	I.	Repairing Vehicles	1-26
[1.27]	J.	Use or Operation by a Transportation Network Company Driver.....	1-27

[1.28]	V.	Denials of Claim.....	1-28
[1.29]	VI.	Interest.....	1-35
[1.30]	VII.	Resolution of Disputes	1-35
[1.31]	VIII.	Conclusion.....	1-38

Chapter 2 Motor Vehicle Coverage Issues

Anthony J. Piazza, Esq.

Mark T. Whitford, Jr., Esq.

[2.0]	I.	Introduction	2-3
[2.1]	II.	The Insuring Agreement.....	2-3
[2.2]	A.	“Accident” Requirement	2-3
[2.3]	B.	Duty to Defend, Generally	2-6
[2.4]	C.	Duty to Defend in Automobile Cases	2-7
[2.5]	III.	Who Is an Insured?.....	2-8
[2.6]	A.	“Family Member” or “Resident Relative”	2-8
[2.7]	B.	Ownership/Transfer of Title Issues	2-10
[2.8]	C.	Coverage for Vehicles Bearing Dealer’s Plates	2-11
[2.9]	D.	Permissive Users	2-12
[2.10]	IV.	Exclusions	2-13
[2.11]	A.	Expected or Intended Injury	2-13
[2.12]	B.	Livery Exclusion	2-14
[2.13]	C.	Furnished or Available for Regular Use	2-16
[2.14]	D.	Business Pursuits.....	2-16
[2.15]	E.	Permissive Use	2-16
[2.16]	1.	Unlicensed Use.....	2-17
[2.17]	2.	Misrepresentation or Fraud	2-17
[2.18]	3.	Scope of Permission	2-18
[2.19]	4.	Owner Negligence for Theft	2-19
[2.20]	5.	Declaratory Judgment	2-20
[2.21]	F.	Spousal Liability Exclusion	2-20
[2.22]	V.	Limits of Liability	2-21
[2.23]	VI.	Conditions	2-21
[2.24]	A.	Failure to Cooperate	2-21
[2.25]	B.	Prompt Notice and Forwarding of Suit Papers.....	2-23
[2.26]	C.	Claimant’s Late Notice.....	2-27
[2.27]	D.	Validity of Cancellation Notices	2-27
[2.28]	VII.	Coverage Issues Involving Rental Cars.....	2-28
[2.29]	A.	Introduction	2-28
[2.30]	B.	Cases Addressing the Federal Legislation	2-29
[2.31]	1.	New York Cases.....	2-29
[2.32]	2.	Other Decisions Relating to Constitutionality of Statute	2-30

[2.33]	C. Analysis With Respect to Liability Coverage.....	2-31
[2.34]	1. Priority of Coverage.....	2-32
[2.35]	2. Permissive Drivers and Rental Cars.....	2-32
[2.36]	3. Rental Company's Ability to Seek Indemnification From Driver	2-34
[2.37]	D. Property Damage.....	2-35
[2.38]	E. Other Issues in Rental Disputes	2-35
[2.39]	1. Coverage for Negligent Entrustment	2-35
[2.40]	2. Coverage for "Temporary Substitute"	2-36
[2.41]	3. Typeset Requirement	2-37
[2.42]	4. Changing Law	2-37

Chapter 3 Exceeding the No-Fault Threshold: Serious Injury

Michael F. Chelus, Esq.

Michael M. Chelus, Esq.

[3.0]	I. Introduction	3-3
[3.1]	A. Purposes	3-3
[3.2]	B. History	3-4
[3.3]	II. Early Judicial Construction—Licari v. Elliott.....	3-6
[3.4]	III. Categories of Serious Injury.....	3-7
[3.5]	IV. Categories Defined.....	3-7
[3.6]	A. Significant Disfigurement	3-8
[3.7]	1. Facial Scars	3-8
[3.8]	2. Bodily Scars	3-9
[3.9]	B. Significant Limitation of Use of a Body Function or System.....	3-10
[3.10]	C. Permanent Loss of Use of a Body Organ, Member, Function or System, and Permanent Consequential Limitation of Use of a Body Organ or Member....	3-11
[3.11]	D. 90/180-Day Material Acts.....	3-13
[3.12]	V. Burden of Proof.....	3-14
[3.13]	A. Presenting Proof.....	3-20
[3.14]	B. Scrutiny of the Proof	3-22
[3.15]	C. Affidavits by Health Care Providers Other Than Medical Doctors	3-26
[3.16]	VI. Sample Cases.....	3-26
[3.17]	A. Significant Disfigurement	3-26
[3.18]	B. Soft-Tissue Injuries	3-28
[3.19]	1. Range of Motion	3-28
[3.20]	2. Loss of Employment or School Time	3-30
[3.21]	C. Psychologic Injury	3-31
[3.22]	D. Complaints of Pain.....	3-33

[3.23]	E. Miscellaneous Injuries.....	3-34
[3.24]	1. Temporomandibular Joint Syndrome.....	3-34
[3.25]	2. Teeth.....	3-34
[3.26]	3. Cartilage Loss.....	3-35
[3.27]	4. Discs	3-36
[3.28]	5. Carpal Tunnel Syndrome	3-37
[3.29]	VII. Conclusion.....	3-38

Contributor Biographies

CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES

EDITORS

JOHN M. NONNA, ESQ.

John Nonna is currently serving as Westchester County Attorney. He supervises a law department of over fifty attorneys handling litigation and transactions on behalf of the County. He was previously managing partner of the Squire Patton Boggs LLP New York office. He litigated complex commercial disputes, particularly those involving insurance and reinsurance, involving a range of business matters.

As a litigator, Mr. Nonna is known for his innovative approaches to complex cases involving accountants' malpractice, fraud, breach of fiduciary duty, breaches of warranties and representations, employment discrimination, distributorship agreements, stock and asset purchase agreements, and M&A disputes. He is a Fellow of the American College of Trial Lawyers, and has lectured at numerous conferences on topics including trial practice, arbitration and mediation, insurance and reinsurance coverage, commercial torts, and the attorney-client privilege. Mr. Nonna served as Mayor of Pleasantville, N.Y., and as a Westchester County Legislator, where he chaired the Legislation Committee.

CHRISTOPHER W. HEALY, ESQ.

A member of the law firm Duane Morris LLP in New York City, Christopher Healy practices primarily in the areas of insurance, commercial, financial services and mass tort and product liability litigation. He also advises clients on a variety of liability and insurance-related issues and topics, including commercial insurance and reinsurance, directors and officers liability and insurance coverage. Mr. Healy is a graduate of the College of the Holy Cross and Loyola University School of Law. He writes and lectures frequently on insurance and mass litigation topics.

AUTHORS

MICHAEL BILLY, JR., ESQ.

Michael Billy, Jr. graduated from Georgetown University Law Center in 1975 and was admitted to practice law in New York in March 1976. While at Georgetown Law, he was a Supervisory Editor and Editorial Board Member of the American Criminal Law Review. He graduated from Fordham University, College of Liberal Arts at Lincoln Center in 1972. In 1979, he was co-founder of Short & Billy, P.C. Prior to that, he was a staff attorney at Hanover Insurance Company.

A GUIDE TO NO-FAULT INSURANCE IN NEW YORK

He is co-author of the Claims Examiner's No-Fault Manual as well as the No-Fault chapters in New York Insurance Law (published by Matthew Bender) and Insurance Law Practice (published by New York State Bar Association). He has co-authored 2011 Chapter 27 of the New Appleman on Insurance Law Practice Guide.

He has conducted seminars for claims adjusters on no-fault and uninsured motorist claims. In addition, he has lectured for New York State Bar Association, Suffolk Academy of Law, Buffalo Claims Association and New York Trial Lawyers Association.

MICHAEL F. CHELUS, ESQ.

Michael F. Chelus is of counsel to Chelus, Herdzik, Speyer & Monte, P.C., one of the oldest law firms in Buffalo, N.Y. Mr. Chelus's practice areas include all forms of litigation, such as labor law, products liability, negligence and insurance coverage. Prior to joining the firm in 1971, he served in the U.S. Army and was certified as a military lawyer. He became of counsel to the firm in 2013.

Active in numerous bar associations and professional organizations, Mr. Chelus has chaired the Erie County Bar Association's Negligence Committee; he is a member of the New York State Bar Association's Torts, Insurance and Compensation, and Trusts and Estates Law Sections; the American Bar Association's Business Law, Torts and Insurance Practice, and Law Management Practice Sections (1978–2016); the Western New York Trial Lawyers Association (1976–2013); the Defense Trial Lawyers Association of Western New York (1976–2013), Civility Award 2015; the Defense Research Institute (1978–2013) and American Board of Trial Advocates, Charter Member, New York Chapter (1996–2013). Mr. Chelus conducts seminars and is a frequent speaker on various legal subjects for regional, professional, social, philanthropic and corporate institutions. He has published articles in the NYSBA Journal.

MICHAEL M. CHELUS, ESQ.

Michael M. Chelus is a member of the Buffalo, N.Y. law firm of Chelus, Herdzik, Speyer & Monte, P.C. Mr. Chelus practices primarily in the areas of personal injury and civil defense, commercial and insurance coverage litigation. He is a member of the New York State and Erie County Bar Associations and is admitted to practice in the courts of the State of New York, the United States District Courts for the Western and Northern Districts of New York and the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit.

CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES

Mr. Chelus has written and co-authored articles and updates and presented on various insurance and litigation topics. He received his undergraduate degree in Management from Pennsylvania State University and his J.D. degree from the State University of New York at Buffalo School of Law.

CHRISTOPHER O'DONNELL, ESQ.

A member of the New York City law firm Short & Billy, P.C., Christopher O'Donnell practices in the area of insurance litigation. Prior to joining Short & Billy, Mr. O'Donnell spent 5-1/2 years as an Assistant District Attorney in the Bronx County District Attorney's Office. He is a graduate of Hunter College and the University of Pennsylvania Law School.

ANTHONY J. PIAZZA, ESQ.

Anthony J. Piazza, a partner in the Rochester, N.Y. office of Barclay Damon LLP, serves as Chair of Barclay Damon's Insurance Coverage & Regulation Practice Area. Mr. Piazza's experience in handling insurance matters has prompted national insurance companies to retain him on a regional and statewide basis. Mr. Piazza's practice in this field includes litigating declaratory judgment actions throughout the Northeast. He is also a seasoned attorney who has successfully tried numerous cases to verdict. Additionally, Mr. Piazza frequently advises insurers, third-party administrators, self-insured entities and others on claims-handling procedures and practices, and addresses complaints with state insurance departments. He is admitted to practice law in New York and Pennsylvania.

SKIP SHORT, ESQ.

A member of the New York City law firm Short & Billy, P.C., Skip Short practices in the areas of insurance, international and commercial litigation. The author of numerous articles on the topic of insurance, Mr. Short has written for the New York State Bar *Journal*, *The Claims Forum*, the *No-Fault/SUM Arbitration Reporter* and the *New York Law Journal*. He is co-author of *The Claims Examiners' No-Fault Manual* and the chapter "No-Fault Automobile Insurance" in *New York Insurance Law*, published by Matthew Bender. Mr. Short has served on the faculties of special investigation and fraud detection associations, including the state Insurance Department Fraud Bureau. He has served as a Special Master in the Supreme Court, New York County, and the Civil Court, New York County; and an arbitrator and a mediator for the American Arbitration Association. He is a graduate of Fordham University and Georgetown University Law Center.

A GUIDE TO NO-FAULT INSURANCE IN NEW YORK

MARK T. WHITFORD, JR., ESQ.

Mark T. Whitford, Jr., is a partner with Barclay Damon LLP, where he focuses his practice on insurance coverage matters as well as tort and products liability litigation. His practice includes insurance coverage disputes under homeowners, automobile, commercial general liability, directors and officers and errors and omissions insurance policies for numerous major national insurance companies.

Mr. Whitford pursued his B.A. at the University at Buffalo, where he graduated *summa cum laude* in 2002. He received his J.D. with honors from The University of Connecticut School of Law in 2005. He was also managing editor of the *Connecticut Insurance Law Journal*. He is admitted to practice in New York. Mr. Whitford formerly worked as an appellate court attorney for the New York State Supreme Court, Appellate Division, Third Department. He is a member of the New York State Bar Association.