

file Race Initiative

August 11, 1998

Bobbie Greene
Office of the First Lady

Hummer - Pls distr. note to ^① Melanney ✓
② Gen'l. News
I kept one set

Dear Ms. Greene:

Enclosed are documents prepared by Professor Christopher Edley for the First Lady and her staff. Thank you for distributing them.

Sincerely,

Jane Price-Smith

Jane Price-Smith

Administrative Assistant, The President's Initiative on Race

**ONE AMERICA:
THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT TO THE NATION
ON RACIAL AND ETHNIC JUSTICE IN THE 21ST CENTURY**

What I hope to accomplish with this report/book:

- Authoritative social scientific background information on demographics, disparities, discrimination, and intergroup relations;
- My vision of One America in the 21st century, and why it is preferable to some alternatives that are implicit in public discourse, and how the motivation for that vision is rooted in our history and cherished ideals;
- Some models or examples of how we can constructively engage one another on hard questions, and the promising practices that may build bridges connecting people across lines of color and class;
- A workplan for the nation – not just what the Federal government should undertake this year and next, but what *all* of us can do together and individually. Federal, state and local governments; private sector and voluntary sector; in our public lives and our personal lives, to help build One America with racial and ethnic justice

Introduction: One America in the 21st Century

Context for the book; why I launched this; 21st century challenges; no subject more vexing; my personal experiences and motivation, in private and public life; summary of core themes and vision; appreciation to the Advisory Board; some highlights of the book; closing message to Congress and to the American people.

Chapter 1. Were Is America On Race, And Where Are We Going?

Salience of race/ethnicity in our daily lives; demographic trends; disparities; authoritative evidence on the extent of discrimination and prejudice; information on integration, social relations; thematic social policy history since Myrdal/Kerner; most salient progress to date; the effects of race on our political and policy discourse.

Chapter 2. More Than A Dream: Racial And Ethnic Justice In The 21st Century

My vision of One America with racial and ethnic justice in the 21st century, and why his vision is preferable to competing visions. Seeking clarity about our value commitments and ambitions for One America. [The section should be significantly historical, illustrating the conceptual points with references to historical struggles and statements, revealing the competing visions in the views of notable figures, past and present.]

Chapter 3. Wrestling Lessons: Constructive Engagement Of Our Vexing Differences

[Modeling how to think about complex, hard questions involving race.] Tackling tough questions that divide us requires attention to the facts, and a search for the kernel of truth

in what the *other* side of the debate is saying. Beyond the black-white paradigm: distinctiveness created by colonization, conquest and culture; the importance, and limits, of the old model. Examples from the unfinished agenda of combating discrimination, bigotry and exclusion – including: how much does race still matter; affirmative action and race-conscious policies; merit; the definition of discrimination; profiling. Examples from the new agenda of inclusion and opportunity – including: how much do we care about integration; identity politics and ethnic enclaves; bilingualism; reconciling tribal sovereignty and interdependence; immigration and nativism.

Chapter 4. Promising Practices: How To Build Bridges That Connect People Across Lines Of Class And Color, Creating Community And Opportunity

Chapter 5. The Record Of The Clinton-Gore Administration

[Organized as historical narrative, rather than laundry list; programmatic details from NEC/DPC/agencies in an appendix. Clear presentation of the values framework for the Administration's agenda; cf. *Between Hope and History*.]

Chapter 6. A Workplan For Our Nation

[Workplan organized by sectors/subject matter; and including within each, federal, state, local, private and personal elements. **This is not just about the federal government, and not just about government.** Very few elements will have FY 2000 budget implications. Key areas for focus include: (a) education; (b) civil rights enforcement; (c) economic opportunity and community development; (d) criminal justice; (e) civic participation, voting and citizenship; research needs.]

Chapter 7. Leadership For One America

[A call to action, appealing for the recruitment of a cadre of leaders from all sectors who will dedicate themselves to learning, teaching and practicing the difficult tasks of building One America for the 21st century. A plan to sustain and expand the efforts now underway around the country. Explicitly challenging: elected officials; faith community; corporate community; youth educators; organized labor; the media.]

Chapter 8. Conclusion

Previous presidents – personalized examples of how some of them chose to move forward, and others didn't. Tragedies seeded or averted. Opportunities seized and squandered. Optimism about the our ideals and our spirit. Our standing in the eyes of the world, and in the judgment of historians. We must not be mere participants in the history of this struggle. We must be the authors of that history. Our standing in the hearts of our children and grandchildren; what we owe them. We must lighten their burdens and brighten their futures, each and all. Closing message: response to a letter from a grade school child; and a prayer.

**ONE AMERICA:
THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT TO THE NATION
ON RACIAL AND ETHNIC JUSTICE IN THE 21ST CENTURY**

Note: This is only an evolving outline of ideas and subjects. It is not an effort to capture the appropriate language with which to communicate the President's ideas to a general audience. It is only intended to guide research, outreach and deliberation.

Executive Summary

Introduction: One America in the 21st Century

- A. Opening:
 - 1. Why, as the last President of the 20th century, I launched this initiative.
 - America faces several challenges at home and abroad as we enter the new century; Among these is the challenge of making the most of the opportunities created by our growing diversity, while avoiding the tragic mistakes we've seen too often in our nation's history and around the globe.
 - No subject has been more vexing – threatening our domestic tranquility, testing the sincerity of our deepest civic values, shaping our public policies and even our most private thoughts about one another. The difficulty and pervasiveness of the problem perhaps explains the temptation to let things drift along, absent an explosive crisis. Perhaps there's been too much of that in recent decades. But we cannot afford that any longer, if we ever could.
 - 2. What we mean by "race"
 - Since 1960s, greater complexity of "race" and identity; historical contingency; *beyond black-white*; ambivalence in the Hispanic context; "white" ethnics; Arab-Americans; Jews; Native Americans and the interrelationships of race, culture, sovereignty.
 - Intragroup heterogeneity and even tensions
- B. Personal context
 - 1. Observations from 1950s and 1960s: horror and hope
 - Personal impressions of the Civil Rights movement – what it meant to me then, and what it means to me today.
 - 2. Gubernatorial experiences – not a record of accomplishments, but a few examples of challenge, struggle, failure or success, as a window on the post- civil rights movement evolution of our nation's work on the issue.
 - Voting rights/districting; hiring/affirmative action? The politics of race.

- Comparing notes with other political and civic leaders in the 1970s and 1980s.
- C. Summary of core themes and vision
1. *Vision of community*: Celebration of our diversity, not mere tolerance of our differences; building inclusive communities and organizations to take advantage of the benefits and strengths. (Examples from forums, etc.)
 2. *Vision of opportunity*: Opportunity enjoyed so equally that there is no discernable legacy of slavery, colonization or conquest; of Jim Crow or internment. (Examples from forums, etc.)
 3. *Vision of responsibility*: responsibilities of citizenship; responsibility of reaching out to others. (Examples from forums, etc.)
 4. We must do this for our children and their children. We must do this to honor those who have sacrificed over the generations in earlier battles to put our sacred civic values into practice. And I believe we must do this to honor the God who has created us all equal, and blessed our nation in so many countless ways.
- D. The Advisory Board and its work
1. What has been accomplished since launching this initiative – the work of the Advisory Board, the engagement of scores of thousands of people in communities and organizations around the nation.
 2. Appreciation to the Advisory Board, and to the many people throughout the nation who responded to our call to engage in a national conversation on race, or to redouble their efforts already underway.
- E. What I hope to accomplish with this report/book:
1. Authoritative social scientific background information on demographics, disparities, discrimination, and intergroup relations;
 2. My vision of One America in the 21st century, and why it is preferable to some alternatives that are implicit in public discourse, and how the motivation for that vision is rooted in our history and cherished ideals;
 3. Some models or examples of how we can constructively engage one another on hard questions, and the promising practices that may build bridges connecting people across lines of color and class;
 4. A workplan for the nation – not just what the Federal government should undertake this year and next, but what *all* of us can do together and individually. Federal, state and local governments; private sector and voluntary sector; in our public lives and our personal lives, to help build One America with racial and ethnic justice
- F. Some highlights of this report to the American people:
1. Headlines from promising practices and dialog efforts (chapter 5)
 2. Headlines from the workplan: enforcement, education, criminal justice, health disparities, history initiative (chapter 7)
 3. Headlines from leadership/next steps (chapter 8)
- G. Closing message to the Congress, and to the American People.

Chapter 1. Where is America on race, and where are we going?

1.1. The salience of race and ethnicity in our everyday lives

- (a) How it intrudes on us in various ways, explicitly or subtly.
- (b) For some of us, our communities are homogenous and we live in a racial or ethnic enclave with exposure to racial differences almost entirely through mass media. Others of us have constant reminders about the differences in America.
- (c) For example [*real stories*]

1.2. Demographic history and trends

- (a) Population and population characteristics
- (b) Intermarriage; multiracial families, the census category controversy

1.3. Social policy history.

- (a) What the Kerner Commission said
- (b) Narrative starting with Myrdal, through Kerner Commission, to Clinton Inauguration. Organized to focus on:
 - Hinging events, or milestones in 5-7 key policy sectors: antidiscrimination law; political rights and participation; education; economic opportunity (jobs, training, economic development); criminal justice; housing; health
 - Weaving through the narrative a half dozen conceptual themes that are the framework for the narrative – how are ideas have evolved, and our struggles been shaped, with reference to:
 - Federalism – what’s the proper role of different levels of government;
 - Public-private-personal? Includes the roles of market and family; includes the nature redistributive norms – as in the establishment of food stamps, or SSI; EITC, but not a guaranteed income or job; etc.
 - Targeting by race or income, versus broad-based programs
 - Black-white, versus more complex multiculturalism (this includes rising consciousness about Native American issues, as well as burgeoning Hispanic and Asian populations)
 - Norms of tolerance, inclusion and antidiscrimination
 - Pivotal figures: include within the narrative some examples of individuals who have made a big difference – Eisenhower at Little Rock; MLK at Montgomery and Birmingham; Nixon on Native Americans; etc.
 - Stressing the nature of the choices we faced and made at each juncture.

- /
- 1.4. Disparities, and what we know about the effectiveness of past policies intended to help.
 - (a) A survey of sectoral conditions today: Socioeconomic indicators: income, wealth, business ownership, employment, education, housing, health, criminal justice variables, benefits program participation
 - The sectoral drawing on CEA Factbook and on NAS/NRC study]
 - [An especially detailed look at education and economic mobility]
 - Voting and civic engagement – voting rights, voter registration and participation, elected officials, other dimensions of participation
 - (b) The broad sweep of social policies, and what conclusions to draw about their effectiveness
 - 1.5. Discrimination: authoritative data using various methodologies: How much discrimination is there?
 - (a) Definitions: not looking at mere disparities; considering both traditional econometric methods and the compelling evidence from “testers”
 - (b) Sectors: employment, housing, retail sales, credit, business/contracting
 - 1.6. Intergroup relations: how integrated are our lives, how have attitudes and stereotypes changed, etc.
 - (a) What is the significance of group separation or segregation? Why does it matter? Connection to the vision of One America; separateness of our communities leading to divisions in perceptions and even values, with implications for our broader sense of community and our ability to live and work together.
 - (b) One community, or many?
 - Patterns of residential, school and occupational segregation; trends and historical comparisons
 - Religious life
 - Other dimensions of social life
 - (c) Attitudes: tolerance, etc., over time.
 - Racial attitudes
 - Ethnic attitudes, e.g., Arab-Americans facing discrimination
 - 1.7. Summation:
 - (a) The effects of race on our civic discourse: how race poisons politics and policymaking, overtly or subtly; examples of how *not* to address issues of opportunity, responsibility and community.
 - (b) Most salient elements of progress to date
 - (c) Our most challenging work ahead

Chapter 2. More than a dream: Racial and ethnic justice in the 21st century

[The President's vision of One America with racial and ethnic justice in the 21st century, and why his vision is preferable to competing visions. Seeking clarity about our value commitments and ambitions for One America. This pivotal section is an elaboration of the framework sketched in speeches and in the introduction to this Report. The section should be significantly historical, illustrating the conceptual points with references to historical struggles and statements.

What follows in analytical material – a start for eliciting the President's views and theories. The book would not be written or organized in this manner.]

*

- 2.1. Models: There several ways to think about national identity, and about racial and ethnic justice, each of which has valuable and even compelling claims on our values, but which ultimately are inadequate and/or unattainable:
- (a) *Neutral formalism*: Eliminate race-conscious barriers in law; achieve "colorblindness" in official and personal conduct: Martin Luther King, Jr.'s "I have a dream" formulation, as commonly misconstrued.
 - Clear problems as an instrumental prescription (MLK acknowledged this in his support for race-conscious measures), but what about as ideal, as vision?
 - Seems unattainable if there are group-correlated inequalities because these will fuel stereotypes and, in turn, be incorporated into attitudes, and from these into private practices and public policies.
 - (b) *Assimilation*, with racial differences vanishing in importance.
 - May imply a radical kind of assimilation, in which I have to give up too much of who I am in order to be accepted in this One America. That's unacceptable.
 - (c) *Celebratory pluralism*: Racial differences as analogous to religious differences.
 - Religious diversity analogy:
 - America is the most religious of industrialized nations, but we do not worship in the same way; indeed, some scholars assert that religion flourishes precisely because of religious freedom.
 - We do not merely tolerate this diversity, we celebrate it. It is one aspect of America about which we are intensely proud.
 - Fine, but needs an element of distributive justice as well.
 - (d) *Rawlsian distributive justice*: Definition: no discernable evidence that America had a history of slavery, conquest or colonialism.
 - For example, no inherited legacy of disadvantage as reflected today in, for example, the incredible wealth disparities.

- Fine formulation, but incomplete. It needs an element to ensure *community*; interactions across lines of differences. Even if it were possible, we wouldn't want fully equal individuals separated from one other by walls and distance.
- We care about *integration*. And we should. Because
- (e) *Clintonian Synthesis*, and its basic implications for policy and practice
 - The sources of our values
 - Civic sources – Declaration of Independence, etc.
 - Family and communal sources
 - Spiritual sources
 - The connection between national identity and our conception of justice
 - What a just One America should and will look like.
 - Why I believe we can and must do it.

Chapter 3. Wrestling Lessons: Constructive Engagement Of Our Vexing Differences¹

- 3.1. Beyond the Black-White paradigm. What that means, and why it is necessary.
- The distinctiveness created by colonization, conquest and culture; the importance, and limits, of the old model.
 - Immigration policy and attitudes – distinguishing a principled pursuit of One America from divisive and even nativist proposals.
 - Language, culture and subgroup identity – especially the issue of bilingual education and English acquisition.
 - Will other Americans accept a Spanish-speaking 51st state, if the people of Puerto Rico seek admission to the Union?
 - The special challenges of Native American justice. Tribal sovereignty: what it is, and what is must be in the 21st century.
- 3.2. The unfinished agenda of combating discrimination, bigotry and exclusion:
- (a) How much does race still matter?
- What is discrimination, and how much of it is there?

¹ The purpose of this chapter: Using just a handful from the menu of topics below, model how we can face up to some of the hardest questions dividing us in an honest and constructive way; teasing out the policy implications of the values and vision by grappling with some questions that animate the national conversation. Make use of short essays that will be contributed by a diverse group of "thinkers", leaders and citizens; the essays will be separately published in a companion document.

List of topics for this chapter to be developed; the following items are among the menu of possibilities, for POTUS selection. The book's discussion of each question would (i) respectfully note and engage a broad range of views, searching for the "kernel of truth" in opposing positions; (ii) develop the President's view on the matter by reference to the Vision presented in Chapter 4; (iii) sketch the practical implications for public policies and private practices – with some of those implications detailed in later chapters of the book.

- How much observed disadvantage is fairly attributable to discrimination or its lingering effects? (Includes discussion of the “culture” critique.)
 - Absent specific discrimination, How important are diversity, inclusion and integration as ideals, and as social policy objectives? Why?
 - When we act in public and private life to close the opportunity gap, when is racial targeting appropriate, and when not? What are the moral, practical and legal considerations?
 - Since affirmative action is so controversial, should we abandon it? [Recapitulation of “Mend it, don’t end it.”]
 - (b) Profiling in the criminal justice system: where do we draw the line between efficient allocation of resources, and impermissible stereotyping?
 - (c) What about “apologizing” for slavery, conquest, and colonization?
- 3.3. The new agenda of inclusion and opportunity:
- (a) Do we still care about integration? What price, what burdens are we willing to bear?
 - Education
 - Housing
 - (b) Identity politics and ethnic enclaves
 - (c) Public policies: with, or without, racial targeting?
 - (d) When is a public policy battle, such as bilingual education or affordable housing or welfare reform, a covert battle about color? And when, in our civic discourse, must we face issues of race in order to address issues of opportunity?

Chapter 4. Promising Practices: How To Build Bridges That Connect People Across Lines

- 4.1. Topic: examples of public and private efforts to promote racial reconciliation and racial justice
- 4.2. We need important changes in public policies and private practices to change the social and economic facts in people’s lives, but policy initiatives will founder and fail to command consensus unless build on a foundation of moral and political agreement. That kind of agreement requires that we feel more connected to one another, across our differences. So we need promising practices for how people can come together to improve understanding and, ultimately, to make a difference.
- (a) Criteria for making these judgments – although not every practice fits with every criterion :
 - Does it help build bridges across lines of class and color?
 - Is it action that improves people’s lives, or does it lead to such action?
 - Is it sustainable over time, and can it be used by others elsewhere?

- (b) The importance of effective dialogue
 - The work of the Advisory Board and its staff;
 - Description of the guidelines for effective conversations on race, as developed by PIR staff in consultation with experts and practitioners
- (c) Examples of promising dialogue programs
 - Examples and descriptions from different sectors: government, business, the media, the faith community, education, nonprofit sector, etc. And in different modalities: dialogue; education efforts; service efforts; action efforts, etc. (Excerpting from the web site and from a separate, detailed compendium volume we will publish)
 - City Year
 - Americorps
 - Search for Common Ground
 - Bell Atlantic, Levi Straus (?)
 - A World of Difference
 - Students Talking About Race (STAR)
 - Etc.
 - Unpromising practices: what doesn't work, and makes our problems worse

4.3. Establishing an ongoing program to recognize and replicate promising practices

- (a) Announce (pre-cooked) creation of a private program analogous to the Ford Foundation-funded Kennedy School program on Innovations in Government, which produces annual awards and publishes case studies

Chapter 5. The Record Of The Clinton-Gore Administration

[Organized as historical narrative, rather than laundry list; programmatic details from NEC/DPC/agencies in an appendix. Presented to show debate and struggle (within the Administration and with Congress) over the conceptualization the Opportunity Agenda and the appropriate means; an overlay of debate about the role of government generally, and of the Federal government in particular.]

Chapter 6. A Workplan For Our Nation

[Workplan organized by sectors/subject matter; and including within each, federal, state, local, private and personal elements. To repeat: *This is not just about the federal government, and not just about government. Few items will have FY 2000 budget impacts. Several will have "down payments" represented in Administration accomplishments and earlier proposals.*]

6.1. Education and Economic Opportunity

- (a) Closing the opportunity gap in K-12 education
- (b) Closing the gaps in higher education and technical education
- (c) Combating the twinned calamities of racial isolation and poverty concentration, in schools and in housing.
- (d) Leveling the economic development playing field, and affirmatively mitigating disincentives for job-creation in struggling communities.
- (e) Building a stronger entrepreneurial class –initiatives in business formation and development (apart from government contracting programs, which deserve continued support to remedy discrimination where it exists).

6.2. Enforcing our antidiscrimination laws and values

- (a) Strengthening law enforcement -- federal and state, public and private; increasing voluntary compliance with antidiscrimination laws and principles
- (b) The legal framework for opportunity – shaping federal and state civil rights law and law enforcement to promote educational and economic opportunity
- (c) Data and research:
 - authoritative time-series data measuring the extent of discrimination in various sectors and regions, using both statistical and “tester” methodologies.
 - We must be able to answer the questions, “How much discrimination is there, and are we making progress?”

6.3. Public safety and the administration of justice

- (a) The entitlement to a safe community
- (b) Youth focus: Just as we invest in child nutrition to save lives, we must find a way to make the interventions needed to prevent the reckless or desperate turn to crime

6.4. Health and Services

- (a) Health disparities initiative
- (b) The insurance gap
- (c) Elder services [?]

6.5. Citizenship and Civic Life

- (a) Voter registration and participation as civic obligation
- (b) Naturalization and immigrant integration
- (c) The news and entertainment media
 - Enormous power for good of ill; limited accountability to government because of the First Amendment, which if of course as it should be. But the media are accountable to us in a different sense, and have both rights and responsibilities. What are those in connection with the struggle for a racially just One America?

- Cf., the issue violence in the media
 - (d) School and university curricula
 - Bold initiative to expand/improve the teaching of history, viewing the study of history as instruction in dealing with difference; cf. NDEA/Sputnik.
 - More generally, curricular improvements so that Americans understand more about Americans
 - (e) Bold initiative to enlist the faith community in this work, tapping not just their resources in free basements and mailing lists, but their spiritual resources.
- 6.6. Research needs
- (a) Missing data – under-analyzed groups and subgroups, especially Native Americans and Asians.
 - (b) Authoritative tracking of disparities to mark our progress into the next century.
 - (c) Periodic report card [by the “follow-on entity”]

Chapter 7. Leadership For One America

7.1. Call to action

- (a) I am issuing a call to action, appealing for the recruitment of a cadre of leaders from all sectors who will dedicate themselves to learning, teaching and practicing the difficult tasks of building One America for the 21st century.
- (b) What the Federal government’s ongoing commitment will be – the “follow-on entity”

7.2. A plan to sustain and expand the efforts now underway in communities and organizations around the country.

- (a) *In general terms:* Holding ourselves accountable for the quality of our leadership: creating effective watchdog and feedback mechanisms.
- (b) *Sectoral leadership and action:* I am assigning responsibility for nurturing this community-based engagement by explicitly challenging certain sectors, organizations and leaders.
 - Elected officials
 - Faith community
 - Corporate community
 - Youth
 - Educators
 - Organized labor
 - The media
 - Others??

- (c) *Community leadership and action:* Community-based workplans to be developed by local partnerships, reporting to their communities. [One America Partnerships?]
- (d) *Federal leadership and action:*
 - Strengthening the Civil Rights Commission and its state partners. A network of means to monitor the roles and activities of political leaders, corporate leaders, civic leaders, the media.
 - [An ongoing Federal council or other “follow-on entity”]

Chapter 8. Conclusion

8.1. Reprise

8.2. Personalized examples of how previous presidents chose to move forward, and others didn't. Tragedies seeded or averted. Opportunities seized and squandered. Optimism about the our ideals and our spirit. Our standing in the eyes of the world, and in the judgment of historians. We must not be mere participants in the history of this struggle. We must be the authors of that history. Our standing in the hearts of our children and grandchildren; what we owe them. We must lighten their burdens and brighten their futures, each and all.

8.3. Closing message. Response to a letter from a grade school child. A prayer.

**ONE AMERICA:
THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT TO THE NATION
ON RACIAL AND ETHNIC JUSTICE IN THE 21ST CENTURY**

What I hope to accomplish with this report/book:

- Authoritative social scientific background information on demographics, disparities, discrimination, and intergroup relations;
- My vision of One America in the 21st century, and why it is preferable to some alternatives that are implicit in public discourse, and how the motivation for that vision is rooted in our history and cherished ideals;
- Some models or examples of how we can constructively engage one another on hard questions, and the promising practices that may build bridges connecting people across lines of color and class;
- A workplan for the nation – not just what the Federal government should undertake this year and next, but what *all* of us can do together and individually. Federal, state and local governments; private sector and voluntary sector; in our public lives and our personal lives, to help build One America with racial and ethnic justice

Introduction: One America in the 21st Century

Context for the book; why I launched this; 21st century challenges; no subject more vexing; my personal experiences and motivation, in private and public life; summary of core themes and vision; appreciation to the Advisory Board; some highlights of the book; closing message to Congress and to the American people.

Chapter 1. Where Is America On Race, And Where Are We Going?

Salience of race/ethnicity in our daily lives; demographic trends; disparities; authoritative evidence on the extent of discrimination and prejudice; information on integration, social relations; thematic social policy history since Myrdal/Kerner; most salient progress to date; the effects of race on our political and policy discourse.

Chapter 2. More Than A Dream: Racial And Ethnic Justice In The 21st Century

My vision of One America with racial and ethnic justice in the 21st century, and why his vision is preferable to competing visions. Seeking clarity about our value commitments and ambitions for One America. [The section should be significantly historical, illustrating the conceptual points with references to historical struggles and statements, revealing the competing visions in the views of notable figures, past and present.]

Chapter 3. Wrestling Lessons: Constructive Engagement Of Our Vexing Differences

[Modeling how to think about complex, hard questions involving race.] Tackling tough questions that divide us requires attention to the facts, and a search for the kernel of truth

in what the *other* side of the debate is saying. Beyond the black-white paradigm: distinctiveness created by colonization, conquest and culture; the importance, and limits, of the old model. Examples from the unfinished agenda of combating discrimination, bigotry and exclusion – including: how much does race still matter; affirmative action and race-conscious policies; merit; the definition of discrimination; profiling. Examples from the new agenda of inclusion and opportunity – including: how much do we care about integration; identity politics and ethnic enclaves; bilingualism; reconciling tribal sovereignty and interdependence; immigration and nativism.

Chapter 4. Promising Practices: How To Build Bridges That Connect People Across Lines Of Class And Color, Creating Community And Opportunity

Chapter 5. The Record Of The Clinton-Gore Administration

[Organized as historical narrative, rather than laundry list; programmatic details from NEC/DPC/agencies in an appendix. Clear presentation of the values framework for the Administration's agenda; cf. *Between Hope and History*.]

Chapter 6. A Workplan For Our Nation

[Workplan organized by sectors/subject matter; and including within each, federal, state, local, private and personal elements. **This is not just about the federal government, and not just about government.** Very few elements will have FY 2000 budget implications. Key areas for focus include: (a) education; (b) civil rights enforcement; (c) economic opportunity and community development; (d) criminal justice; (e) civic participation, voting and citizenship; research needs.]

Chapter 7. Leadership For One America

[A call to action, appealing for the recruitment of a cadre of leaders from all sectors who will dedicate themselves to learning, teaching and practicing the difficult tasks of building One America for the 21st century. A plan to sustain and expand the efforts now underway around the country. Explicitly challenging: elected officials; faith community; corporate community; youth educators; organized labor; the media.]

Chapter 8. Conclusion

Previous presidents – personalized examples of how some of them chose to move forward, and others didn't. Tragedies seeded or averted. Opportunities seized and squandered. Optimism about the our ideals and our spirit. Our standing in the eyes of the world, and in the judgment of historians. We must not be mere participants in the history of this struggle. We must be the authors of that history. Our standing in the hearts of our children and grandchildren; what we owe them. We must lighten their burdens and brighten their futures, each and all. Closing message: response to a letter from a grade school child; and a prayer.

**ONE AMERICA:
THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT TO THE NATION
ON RACIAL AND ETHNIC JUSTICE IN THE 21ST CENTURY**

Note: This is only an evolving outline of ideas and subjects. It is not an effort to capture the appropriate language with which to communicate the President's ideas to a general audience. It is only intended to guide research, outreach and deliberation.

Executive Summary

Introduction: One America in the 21st Century

- A. Opening:
 - 1. Why, as the last President of the 20th century, I launched this initiative.
 - America faces several challenges at home and abroad as we enter the new century; Among these is the challenge of making the most of the opportunities created by our growing diversity, while avoiding the tragic mistakes we've seen too often in our nation's history and around the globe.
 - No subject has been more vexing – threatening our domestic tranquility, testing the sincerity of our deepest civic values, shaping our public policies and even our most private thoughts about one another. The difficulty and pervasiveness of the problem perhaps explains the temptation to let things drift along, absent an explosive crisis. Perhaps there's been too much of that in recent decades. But we cannot afford that any longer, if we ever could.
 - 2. What we mean by "race"
 - Since 1960s, greater complexity of "race" and identity; historical contingency; *beyond black-white*; ambivalence in the Hispanic context; "white" ethnics; Arab-Americans; Jews; Native Americans and the interrelationships of race, culture, sovereignty.
 - Intragroup heterogeneity and even tensions
- B. Personal context
 - 1. Observations from 1950s and 1960s: horror and hope
 - Personal impressions of the Civil Rights movement – what it meant to me then, and what it means to me today.
 - 2. Gubernatorial experiences – not a record of accomplishments, but a few examples of challenge, struggle, failure or success, as a window on the post- civil rights movement evolution of our nation's work on the issue.
 - Voting rights/districting; hiring/affirmative action? The politics of race.

- Comparing notes with other political and civic leaders in the 1970s and 1980s.
- C. Summary of core themes and vision
1. *Vision of community*: Celebration of our diversity, not mere tolerance of our differences; building inclusive communities and organizations to take advantage of the benefits and strengths. (Examples from forums, etc.)
 2. *Vision of opportunity*: Opportunity enjoyed so equally that there is no discernable legacy of slavery, colonization or conquest; of Jim Crow or internment. (Examples from forums, etc.)
 3. *Vision of responsibility*: responsibilities of citizenship; responsibility of reaching out to others. (Examples from forums, etc.)
 4. We must do this for our children and their children. We must do this to honor those who have sacrificed over the generations in earlier battles to put our sacred civic values into practice. And I believe we must do this to honor the God who has created us all equal, and blessed our nation in so many countless ways.
- D. The Advisory Board and its work
1. What has been accomplished since launching this initiative – the work of the Advisory Board, the engagement of scores of thousands of people in communities and organizations around the nation.
 2. Appreciation to the Advisory Board, and to the many people throughout the nation who responded to our call to engage in a national conversation on race, or to redouble their efforts already underway.
- E. What I hope to accomplish with this report/book:
1. Authoritative social scientific background information on demographics, disparities, discrimination, and intergroup relations;
 2. My vision of One America in the 21st century, and why it is preferable to some alternatives that are implicit in public discourse, and how the motivation for that vision is rooted in our history and cherished ideals;
 3. Some models or examples of how we can constructively engage one another on hard questions, and the promising practices that may build bridges connecting people across lines of color and class;
 4. A workplan for the nation – not just what the Federal government should undertake this year and next, but what *all* of us can do together and individually. Federal, state and local governments; private sector and voluntary sector; in our public lives and our personal lives, to help build One America with racial and ethnic justice
- F. Some highlights of this report to the American people:
1. Headlines from promising practices and dialog efforts (chapter 5)
 2. Headlines from the workplan: enforcement, education, criminal justice, health disparities, history initiative (chapter 7)
 3. Headlines from leadership/next steps (chapter 8)
- G. Closing message to the Congress, and to the American People.

Chapter 1. Where is America on race, and where are we going?

1.1. The salience of race and ethnicity in our everyday lives

- (a) How it intrudes on us in various ways, explicitly or subtly.
- (b) For some of us, our communities are homogenous and we live in a racial or ethnic enclave with exposure to racial differences almost entirely through mass media. Others of us have constant reminders about the differences in America.
- (c) For example [*real stories*]

1.2. Demographic history and trends

- (a) Population and population characteristics
- (b) Inter-marriage; multiracial families, the census category controversy

1.3. Social policy history.

- (a) What the Kerner Commission said
- (b) Narrative starting with Myrdal, through Kerner Commission, to Clinton Inauguration. Organized to focus on:
 - Hinging events, or milestones in 5-7 key policy sectors: antidiscrimination law; political rights and participation; education; economic opportunity (jobs, training, economic development); criminal justice; housing; health
 - Weaving through the narrative a half dozen conceptual themes that are the framework for the narrative – how are ideas have evolved, and our struggles been shaped, with reference to:
 - Federalism – what's the proper role of different levels of government;
 - Public-private-personal? Includes the roles of market and family; includes the nature redistributive norms – as in the establishment of food stamps, or SSI; EITC, but not a guaranteed income or job; etc.
 - Targeting by race or income, versus broad-based programs
 - Black-white, versus more complex multiculturalism (this includes rising consciousness about Native American issues, as well as burgeoning Hispanic and Asian populations)
 - Norms of tolerance, inclusion and antidiscrimination
 - Pivotal figures: include within the narrative some examples of individuals who have made a big difference – Eisenhower at Little Rock; MLK at Montgomery and Birmingham; Nixon on Native Americans; etc.
 - Stressing the nature of the choices we faced and made at each juncture.

- /
- 1.4. Disparities, and what we know about the effectiveness of past policies intended to help.
 - (a) A survey of sectoral conditions today: Socioeconomic indicators: income, wealth, business ownership, employment, education, housing, health, criminal justice variables, benefits program participation
 - The sectoral drawing on CEA Factbook and on NAS/NRC study]
 - [An especially detailed look at education and economic mobility]
 - Voting and civic engagement – voting rights, voter registration and participation, elected officials, other dimensions of participation
 - (b) The broad sweep of social policies, and what conclusions to draw about their effectiveness
 - 1.5. Discrimination: authoritative data using various methodologies: How much discrimination is there?
 - (a) Definitions: not looking at mere disparities; considering both traditional econometric methods and the compelling evidence from “testers”
 - (b) Sectors: employment, housing, retail sales, credit, business/contracting
 - 1.6. Intergroup relations: how integrated are our lives, how have attitudes and stereotypes changed, etc.
 - (a) What is the significance of group separation or segregation? Why does it matter? Connection to the vision of One America; separateness of our communities leading to divisions in perceptions and even values, with implications for our broader sense of community and our ability to live and work together.
 - (b) One community, or many?
 - Patterns of residential, school and occupational segregation; trends and historical comparisons
 - Religious life
 - Other dimensions of social life
 - (c) Attitudes: tolerance, etc., over time.
 - Racial attitudes
 - Ethnic attitudes, e.g., Arab-Americans facing discrimination
 - 1.7. Summation:
 - (a) The effects of race on our civic discourse: how race poisons politics and policymaking, overtly or subtly; examples of how *not* to address issues of opportunity, responsibility and community.
 - (b) Most salient elements of progress to date
 - (c) Our most challenging work ahead

Chapter 2. More than a dream: Racial and ethnic justice in the 21st century

[The President's vision of One America with racial and ethnic justice in the 21st century, and why his vision is preferable to competing visions. Seeking clarity about our value commitments and ambitions for One America. This pivotal section is an elaboration of the framework sketched in speeches and in the introduction to this Report. The section should be significantly historical, illustrating the conceptual points with references to historical struggles and statements.

What follows in analytical material – a start for eliciting the President's views and theories. The book would not be written or organized in this manner.]

*

2.1. Models: There several ways to think about national identity, and about racial and ethnic justice, each of which has valuable and even compelling claims on our values, but which ultimately are inadequate and/or unattainable:

- (a) *Neutral formalism*: Eliminate race-conscious barriers in law; achieve “colorblindness” in official and personal conduct: Martin Luther King, Jr.’s “I have a dream” formulation, as commonly misconstrued.
 - Clear problems as an instrumental prescription (MLK acknowledged this in his support for race-conscious measures), but what about as ideal, as vision?
 - Seems unattainable if there are group-correlated inequalities because these will fuel stereotypes and, in turn, be incorporated into attitudes, and from these into private practices and public policies.
- (b) *Assimilation*, with racial differences vanishing in importance.
 - May imply a radical kind of assimilation, in which I have to give up too much of who I am in order to be accepted in this One America. That’s unacceptable.
- (c) *Celebratory pluralism*: Racial differences as analogous to religious differences.
 - Religious diversity analogy:
 - America is the most religious of industrialized nations, but we do not worship in the same way; indeed, some scholars assert that religion flourishes precisely because of religious freedom.
 - We do not merely tolerate this diversity, we celebrate it. It is one aspect of America about which we are intensely proud.
 - Fine, but needs an element of distributive justice as well.
- (d) *Rawlsian distributive justice*: Definition: no discernable evidence that America had a history of slavery, conquest or colonialism.
 - For example, no inherited legacy of disadvantage as reflected today in, for example, the incredible wealth disparities.

- Fine formulation, but incomplete. It needs an element to ensure *community*; interactions across lines of differences. Even if it were possible, we wouldn't want fully equal individuals separated from one other by walls and distance.
- We care about *integration*. And we should. Because
- (e) *Clintonian Synthesis*, and its basic implications for policy and practice
 - The sources of our values
 - Civic sources – Declaration of Independence, etc.
 - Family and communal sources
 - Spiritual sources
 - The connection between national identity and our conception of justice
 - What a just One America should and will look like.
 - Why I believe we can and must do it.

Chapter 3. Wrestling Lessons: Constructive Engagement Of Our Vexing Differences¹

- 3.1. Beyond the Black-White paradigm. What that means, and why it is necessary.
- The distinctiveness created by colonization, conquest and culture; the importance, and limits, of the old model.
 - Immigration policy and attitudes – distinguishing a principled pursuit of One America from divisive and even nativist proposals.
 - Language, culture and subgroup identity – especially the issue of bilingual education and English acquisition.
 - Will other Americans accept a Spanish-speaking 51st state, if the people of Puerto Rico seek admission to the Union?
 - The special challenges of Native American justice. Tribal sovereignty: what it is, and what it must be in the 21st century.
- 3.2. The unfinished agenda of combating discrimination, bigotry and exclusion:
- (a) How much does race still matter?
- What is discrimination, and how much of it is there?

¹ The purpose of this chapter: Using just a handful from the menu of topics below, model how we can face up to some of the hardest questions dividing us in an honest and constructive way; teasing out the policy implications of the values and vision by grappling with some questions that animate the national conversation. Make use of short essays that will be contributed by a diverse group of “thinkers”, leaders and citizens; the essays will be separately published in a companion document.

List of topics for this chapter to be developed; the following items are among the menu of possibilities, for POTUS selection. The book's discussion of each question would (i) respectfully note and engage a broad range of views, searching for the “kernel of truth” in opposing positions; (ii) develop the President's view on the matter by reference to the Vision presented in Chapter 4; (iii) sketch the practical implications for public policies and private practices – with some of those implications detailed in later chapters of the book.

- How much observed disadvantage is fairly attributable to discrimination or its lingering effects? (Includes discussion of the “culture” critique.)
 - Absent specific discrimination, How important are diversity, inclusion and integration as ideals, and as social policy objectives? Why?
 - When we act in public and private life to close the opportunity gap, when is racial targeting appropriate, and when not? What are the moral, practical and legal considerations?
 - Since affirmative action is so controversial, should we abandon it? [Recapitulation of “Mend it, don’t end it.”]
 - (b) Profiling in the criminal justice system: where do we draw the line between efficient allocation of resources, and impermissible stereotyping?
 - (c) What about “apologizing” for slavery, conquest, and colonization?
- 3.3. The new agenda of inclusion and opportunity:
- (a) Do we still care about integration? What price, what burdens are we willing to bear?
 - Education
 - Housing
 - (b) Identity politics and ethnic enclaves
 - (c) Public policies: with, or without, racial targeting?
 - (d) When is a public policy battle, such as bilingual education or affordable housing or welfare reform, a covert battle about color? And when, in our civic discourse, must we face issues of race in order to address issues of opportunity?

Chapter 4. Promising Practices: How To Build Bridges That Connect People Across Lines

- 4.1. Topic: examples of public and private efforts to promote racial reconciliation and racial justice
- 4.2. We need important changes in public policies and private practices to change the social and economic facts in people’s lives, but policy initiatives will founder and fail to command consensus unless build on a foundation of moral and political agreement. That kind of agreement requires that we feel more connected to one another, across our differences. So we need promising practices for how people can come together to improve understanding and, ultimately, to make a difference.
- (a) Criteria for making these judgments – although not every practice fits with every criterion :
 - Does it help build bridges across lines of class and color?
 - Is it action that improves people’s lives, or does it lead to such action?
 - Is it sustainable over time, and can it be used by others elsewhere?

- (b) The importance of effective dialogue
 - The work of the Advisory Board and its staff;
 - Description of the guidelines for effective conversations on race, as developed by PIR staff in consultation with experts and practitioners
 - (c) Examples of promising dialogue programs
 - Examples and descriptions from different sectors: government, business, the media, the faith community, education, nonprofit sector, etc. And in different modalities: dialogue; education efforts; service efforts; action efforts, etc. (Excerpting from the web site and from a separate, detailed compendium volume we will publish)
 - City Year
 - Americorps
 - Search for Common Ground
 - Bell Atlantic, Levi Straus (?)
 - A World of Difference
 - Students Talking About Race (STAR)
 - Etc.
 - Unpromising practices: what doesn't work, and makes our problems worse
- 4.3. Establishing an ongoing program to recognize and replicate promising practices
- (a) Announce (pre-cooked) creation of a private program analogous to the Ford Foundation-funded Kennedy School program on Innovations in Government, which produces annual awards and publishes case studies

Chapter 5. The Record Of The Clinton-Gore Administration

[Organized as historical narrative, rather than laundry list; programmatic details from NEC/DPC/agencies in an appendix. Presented to show debate and struggle (within the Administration and with Congress) over the conceptualization the Opportunity Agenda and the appropriate means; an overlay of debate about the role of government generally, and of the Federal government in particular.]

Chapter 6. A Workplan For Our Nation

[Workplan organized by sectors/subject matter; and including within each, federal, state, local, private and personal elements. To repeat: *This is not just about the federal government, and not just about government. Few items will have FY 2000 budget impacts. Several will have "down payments" represented in Administration accomplishments and earlier proposals.*]

6.1. Education and Economic Opportunity

- (a) Closing the opportunity gap in K-12 education
- (b) Closing the gaps in higher education and technical education
- (c) Combating the twinned calamities of racial isolation and poverty concentration, in schools and in housing.
- (d) Leveling the economic development playing field, and affirmatively mitigating disincentives for job-creation in struggling communities.
- (e) Building a stronger entrepreneurial class –initiatives in business formation and development (apart from government contracting programs, which deserve continued support to remedy discrimination where it exists).

6.2. Enforcing our antidiscrimination laws and values

- (a) Strengthening law enforcement -- federal and state, public and private; increasing voluntary compliance with antidiscrimination laws and principles
- (b) The legal framework for opportunity – shaping federal and state civil rights law and law enforcement to promote educational and economic opportunity
- (c) Data and research:
 - authoritative time-series data measuring the extent of discrimination in various sectors and regions, using both statistical and “tester” methodologies.
 - We must be able to answer the questions, “How much discrimination is there, and are we making progress?”

6.3. Public safety and the administration of justice

- (a) The entitlement to a safe community
- (b) Youth focus: Just as we invest in child nutrition to save lives, we must find a way to make the interventions needed to prevent the reckless or desperate turn to crime

6.4. Health and Services

- (a) Health disparities initiative
- (b) The insurance gap
- (c) Elder services [?]

6.5. Citizenship and Civic Life

- (a) Voter registration and participation as civic obligation
- (b) Naturalization and immigrant integration
- (c) The news and entertainment media
 - Enormous power for good or ill; limited accountability to government because of the First Amendment, which if of course as it should be. But the media are accountable to us in a different sense, and have both rights and responsibilities. What are those in connection with the struggle for a racially just One America?

- Cf., the issue violence in the media
 - (d) School and university curricula
 - Bold initiative to expand/improve the teaching of history, viewing the study of history as instruction in dealing with difference; cf. NDEA/Sputnik.
 - More generally, curricular improvements so that Americans understand more about Americans
 - (e) Bold initiative to enlist the faith community in this work, tapping not just their resources in free basements and mailing lists, but their spiritual resources.
- 6.6. Research needs
- (a) Missing data – under-analyzed groups and subgroups, especially Native Americans and Asians.
 - (b) Authoritative tracking of disparities to mark our progress into the next century.
 - (c) Periodic report card [by the “follow-on entity”]

Chapter 7. Leadership For One America

7.1. Call to action

- (a) I am issuing a call to action, appealing for the recruitment of a cadre of leaders from all sectors who will dedicate themselves to learning, teaching and practicing the difficult tasks of building One America for the 21st century.
- (b) What the Federal government’s ongoing commitment will be – the “follow-on entity”

7.2. A plan to sustain and expand the efforts now underway in communities and organizations around the country.

- (a) *In general terms:* Holding ourselves accountable for the quality of our leadership: creating effective watchdog and feedback mechanisms.
- (b) *Sectoral leadership and action:* I am assigning responsibility for nurturing this community-based engagement by explicitly challenging certain sectors, organizations and leaders.
 - Elected officials
 - Faith community
 - Corporate community
 - Youth
 - Educators
 - Organized labor
 - The media
 - Others??

- (c) *Community leadership and action:* Community-based workplans to be developed by local partnerships, reporting to their communities. [One America Partnerships?]
- (d) *Federal leadership and action:*
 - Strengthening the Civil Rights Commission and its state partners. A network of means to monitor the roles and activities of political leaders, corporate leaders, civic leaders, the media.
 - [An ongoing Federal council or other “follow-on entity”]

Chapter 8. Conclusion

8.1. Reprise

- 8.2.** Personalized examples of how previous presidents chose to move forward, and others didn't. Tragedies seeded or averted. Opportunities seized and squandered. Optimism about the our ideals and our spirit. Our standing in the eyes of the world, and in the judgment of historians. We must not be mere participants in the history of this struggle. We must be the authors of that history. Our standing in the hearts of our children and grandchildren; what we owe them. We must lighten their burdens and brighten their futures, each and all.

- 8.3.** Closing message. Response to a letter from a grade school child. A prayer.
