

Original FOIA Number: 1998-0255-F

2nd FOIA Number:

3rd FOIA Number:

4th FOIA Number:

5th FOIA Number:

FOIA MARKER

**This is not a textual record. This is used as an
administrative marker by the George Bush Presidential
Library Staff.**

Record Group:	Bush Presidential Records
Office:	Records Management, White House Office of (WHORM)
Series:	Subject File - General
Scanned/Unscanned:	Scanned

WHORM Category Code:	FG006-06
WHORM Category Name:	National Security Council

Document Number:	023634
Alpha File Name:	

UNCLASSIFIED
NSC/S PROFILE

023634
RECORD ID: 8900587

RECEIVED: 08 FEB 89 12

FG006-06

TO: SWING, JOHN T

FROM: SCOWCROFT

DOC DATE: 17 MAR 89

SOURCE REF:

KEYWORDS: ISRAEL
ANSA

MIDDLE EAST

PERSONS: SWING, JOHN T

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR APPT W/ SCOWCROFT TO DISCUSS RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN
MIDDLE EAST

ACTION: SCOWCROFT SGD LTR

DUE DATE: 11 FEB 89

STATUS: C

STAFF OFFICER: HAASS

LOGREF:

FILES: WH

NSCIF:

CODES:

D O C U M E N T D I S T R I B U T I O N

FOR ACTION

FOR CONCURRENCE

FOR INFO

CHARLES

HAASS

SCOWCROFT

COMMENTS: _____

DISPATCHED BY _____ DATE _____ BY HAND W/ATTCH

OPENED BY: NSJEC

CLOSED BY: NSJEC

DOC 3 OF 3

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
NSC/S PROFILE

RECORD ID: 8900587
RECEIVED: 08 FEB 89 12

Feb 2/9/89 1605

TO: SCOWCROFT

FROM: SWING, JOHN TEMPLE

DOC DATE: 03 FEB 89
SOURCE REF:

KEYWORDS: ISRAEL
ANSA

MIDDLE EAST

PERSONS:

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR APPT W/ SCOWCROFT TO DISCUSS RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN
MIDDLE EAST

ACTION: PREPARE MEMO FOR SCOWCROFT DUE DATE: 11 FEB 89 STATUS: S

STAFF OFFICER: HAASS

LOGREF:

FILES: WH NSCIF: CODES:

D O C U M E N T D I S T R I B U T I O N

FOR ACTION
HAASS

FOR CONCURRENCE

FOR INFO
GANTT
HALL
RODMAN
WORKING

COMMENTS: _____

DISPATCHED BY _____ DATE _____ BY HAND W/ATTCH

OPENED BY: NSJEC

CLOSED BY:

DOC 1 OF 1

UNCLASSIFIED

THE WHITE HOUSE

WASHINGTON

March 17, 1989

Dear John,

Thank you for your interesting letter on your latest initiatives concerning the Middle East. As I am sure you know, the Administration is undertaking a major review of the Middle East peace process. In that regard, I believe it would be helpful to hear more about your own project on the Middle East.

Why don't you call my office and we will arrange a suitable time for you and Gidon to come down?

Thank you again for your letter.

Sincerely,



Brent Scowcroft

John Temple Swing
Executive Vice President
Council on Foreign Relations
58 East 68th Street
New York, NY 10021

NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20506

February 9, 1989

ACTION

MEMORANDUM FOR BRENT SCOWCROFT

THROUGH: RICHARD HAASS *MM*

FROM: ~~S~~SANDRA CHARLES

SUBJECT: Response to Letter from John Temple Swing

We have prepared a response to a letter you received from John Swing of the Council of Foreign Relations (Tab II), asking to meet with you to discuss the Middle East.

RECOMMENDATION

That you sign the proposed response at Tab I.

Approve _____

Disapprove _____

Attachments:

Tab I Response to Swing Letter
Tab II Swing Letter

THE WHITE HOUSE

WASHINGTON

*As I am sure you
know, the*

Dear John,

Thank you for your interesting letter on your latest initiatives concerning the Middle East. ~~Within the next few months, this Administration plans to undertake a~~ major review of the Middle East peace process. In that regard, I believe it would be helpful to hear ~~your ideas, as well as~~ more about your own project on the Middle East.

Given my extremely busy schedule for the next several weeks, including accompanying the President on his East Asia trip, I recommend you and Gidon Gottlieb meet with my Senior Director for the Near East and South Asia, Richard Haass, who will be coordinating the Administration's review of the Middle East peace process. He can be reached at (202) 395-6900.

Thank you again for your letter.

John Temple Swing
Executive Vice President
Council on Foreign Relations
58 East 68th Street
New York, NY 10021

*Why don't you
call my office
and we will
arrange a
suitable time
for you and
Gidon to come
down.*

89 FEB 8 14:54
National Security Council
The White House

jc

LOG #

0587

PRS

SYSTEM

GCF

IDF

INT

DOCLOG

A/O

SEQUENCE TO

HAS SEEN

DISPOSITION

Dep Exec Sec

1

ThP

A

Exec Sec

2

✓

Bob Gates

3

8

Brent Scowcroft

4

✓

Exec Sec

Situation Room

West Wing Desk

5

NSC Secretariat

Charles

6

FFA

A = Action

I = Information

D = Dispatch

R = Retain

N = No further Action

cc:

VP

Sununu

Other

COMMENTS

Should be seen by:

(Date/Time)

See changes 2/27/89

Changes made as
requested - jc

COUNCIL ON FOREIGN RELATIONS

1. Reply for
recommendations
& reply by BS
0587

JOHN TEMPLE SWING
Executive Vice President

February 1, 1989

The Hon. Brent Scowcroft
Assistant to the President
for National Security Affairs
The White House
Washington, D.C. 20500

Dear Brent:

Last Friday, Cy Vance asked Gidon Gottlieb and me to see him on a fairly urgent basis to report on a conversation he had just had with Hanan Bar-On, former Director-General of the Israel Foreign Office. We also discussed with him recent developments in our Middle East project which Cy felt were important enough for us to bring to your immediate attention, hence this letter. But for the fact that Gidon is back teaching in Chicago today, we would be writing to you jointly.

In Jerusalem, hardline positions are beginning to thaw. On January 6, Yossi Ben-Ahron, Director General of Shamir's office and his closest advisor, proposed a confederation of three entities on both banks of the Jordan River, as reported in Harretz, Israel's leading daily paper. Gidon has prepared a translation of the piece which is enclosed. Gidon believes that Ben-Ahron's statement can be read as some evidence that our ideas about political links between three entities have begun to "percolate" up. Last summer Gidon discussed our materials with Ben-Ahron and he has since shared with him the texts that we had also discussed with Bassam Abu Sharif. Cy Vance told us last Friday that Hanan Bar-On has no doubt that Ben-Ahron's trial balloon is serious and that it represents the thinking of Shamir's inner circle. Bar-On told Cy that Ben-Ahron had called the editors of the paper to let them know that what he had told them was significant. It does now appear that Ben-Ahron has found some of our formulations useful; he had told Gidon as much in Jerusalem.

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

PETER TARNOFF
President

JOHN TEMPLE SWING
Executive Vice President

JAMES E. BURKE
Treasurer

PETER G. PETERSON
Chairman of the Board

HAROLD BROWN
JAMES E. BURKE
RICHARD B. CHENEY
WARREN CHRISTOPHER
ROBERT F. ERBURU
THOMAS S. FOLEY
STANLEY HOFFMANN
KAREN ELLIOTT HOUSE
B. R. INMAN

WARREN CHRISTOPHER
Vice Chairman of the Board

JEANE J. KIRKPATRICK
JUANITA KREPS
CHARLES McC. MATHIAS, JR.
DONALD F. McHENRY
RUBEN F. METTLER
PETER G. PETERSON
JAMES D. ROBINSON, III
WILLIAM D. ROGERS

ROBERT A. SCALAPINO
BRENT SCOWCROFT
STEPHEN STAMAS
STROBE TALBOTT
PETER TARNOFF,
ex officio
PAUL A. VOLCKER
GLENN E. WATTS
CLIFTON R. WHARTON, JR.

JOHN J. McCLOY
Honorary Chairman

DAVID ROCKEFELLER
Honorary Chairman

89 FEB 3 P 5: 43

Gidon also talked to Bassam Abu Sharif on Friday. He gave Gidon the direct reaction of the Chairman to the latest version of our papers. Abu Sharif told Gidon he had translated these materials for the Chairman, and that the Chairman had annotated them in his own hand. The Chairman's reaction, according to Abu Sharif, is that they are definitely very much interested. Arafat has instructed one of his international law experts to report on the implications of the drafts, and they shall let us know at the end of February their "measured and precise reaction" to the materials. He wants us to meet with him and in all likelihood the Chairman in Europe. They want to be sure that their views will be accurately communicated to the "right party". Gidon reiterated the point that we are not go-betweens and that the materials they are getting from us are our own and no one else's. Abu Sharif said that many were "astounded" by the Ben-Aharon proposal. He credited us for the proposal in spite of the fact that Gidon insisted that the Israelis must have developed it autonomously.

If we can take them seriously, the positions of Ben-Aharon and those of Abu Sharif on key final status questions appear to be within settlement range. Indeed, the convergence of their positions begins to look like the first glimmer of light at the end of the tunnel. But they are no closer on the more immediate issues: from what we can observe, Jerusalem continues to reject any direct or indirect dealings with the PLO, although recent press reports on conversations between a Rabin envoy and Faisal Husseini (just out of administrative detention) are intriguing. Incidentally, Abu Sharif had told us in Zurich that Husseini would be a Minister in the Provisional Government of the State of Palestine. It is also apparent that the PLO will resist any attempt to hold elections in the Territories unless they are part of an accord negotiated with the PLO, either by Israel or by the U.S.

In the second enclosure, Gidon compares the positions of Ben-Aharon with those of Abu Sharif which have begun to draw closer than has been noticed in the media or in the public debate.

Another interesting press report cites a Soviet member of the delegation to the Afro-Asian Solidarity Conference, Prof. Alexei Vassiliev, as saying that the Palestinians should be thinking of new solutions: "One must speak of Confederation with Israel, not with Jordan only."

The idea of Confederal or other political links between two or three entities which is at the core of our materials now appears to be well received by an odd group: Shamir's office, a Soviet delegate, Arafat and Hussein who is giving lip service to the notion of Confederation. This approach is probably now more promising than the old land for peace formula that led nowhere for so long; perhaps "shared links for peace" will be more successful or at least prove to be a useful additive to the old land for peace recipe.

We have also been working on the negotiating process that could get us closer to the scenario we had sketched for the future of the West Bank and Gaza. We shall send you an outline of some ideas that we are definitely not sharing with either side at this time.

Gidon and I would be most happy to come in to see you should you wish to hear more. We have sent the same materials to Dennis Ross with a similar offer and I am sure could arrange to see you both if you think it makes sense for us to do so. In any case, it is beginning to appear that the "delicate flower" that we had all contemplated when we saw you in Washington, is beginning to flourish sooner and with greater strength than any of us could have anticipated.

With all best wishes,

Sincerely,



John Temple Swing

Enclosures

(Translation)

Haaretz, 6 January 1989

Ben Aharon Proposes a Confederation of Three Entities on Both Banks of the Jordan.

The Director General of the Prime Minister's Office: One has to propose to the Arabs of the Territories maximal political expression in return for maximal security for Israel; This arrangement--after a transition period of autonomy.

By Akiva Eldar, Political Correspondent of Haaretz.

A Confederal arrangement, based on ties between Israel and an Arab party east of the Jordan river and west of the river, could be acceptable after a transition period of autonomy. This was told yesterday by the Director General of the Prime Minister's office, Yossi Ben Aharon to Haaretz.

Ben Aharon, who is a close adviser to the Prime Minister, Itzhak Shamir, is engaged at this time in planning Shamir's political moves in preparation for his visit to the United States. He emphasized that his comments do not necessarily reflect the Prime Minister's plan, but he did confirm that what he said implies that there would be no annexation of the Territories.

Ben Aharon claims that the arrangement that he proposes would involve Jordanian access to Israeli ports. He claims that a construct that includes three entities makes more sense than a Confederation between two States. He added that it would require "a common market or a currency arrangement" that is called for by the existing affinity of the Shekel and the Jordanian Dinar. Ben Aharon stressed that any accord on the Territories that would grant Jordan a standing west of the Jordan, must be balanced by a parallel element in Israel's favor.

The Director-General of the Prime Minister's Office added that the autonomy is required as a transition, to test coexistence on the ground. After this period, he says one would have to propose to the Arabs of the Territories maximal political expression in return for maximal security for Israel.

Political expression will not include absolute sovereignty. But two things: local rule and the right to vote for a Parliament east of the river Jordan. Ben Aharon stressed that this does not mean that the Territories will form an integral part of the Jordanian Kingdom.

26 January 1989

Comparison of Positions of Yossi Ben-Aharon and Bassam Abu Sharif
in Regard to the Final Status of the West Bank and Gaza.

A comparison of the proposal of the Director-General of the Office of the Prime Minister of Israel (see enclosure) and of the statements made by Bassam Abu Sharif in a private meeting with John Temple Swing and myself suggests that the two sides have been edging closer on a number of issues:

1. Ben-Aharon accepts an arrangement with an Arab party astride the river Jordan, east and west of the river. Abu Sharif would accept an arrangement involving a Palestinian-Jordanian confederation east and west of the river to be set up immediately upon the establishment of a State of Palestine.
2. Ben-Aharon clearly contemplates a confederal arrangement between at least two states although his preference is for a Confederal arrangement between three entities. Abu Sharif, as I just pointed out, would have a Palestinian-Jordanian confederation established between the Palestinian State and the Kingdom of Jordan. He did accept however the eventuality of common institutions with Israel at some time in the future though not at the beginning of the Palestinian-Jordanian confederation.
3. Ben-Aharon stated that his plan implies that there will be no annexation of the Territories. Abu Sharif would go along with an arrangement that sidesteps the question of sovereignty in the West Bank and Gaza along the lines we had drafted.
4. Ben-Aharon's plan explicitly leaves many questions open: will the Territories form an integral part of Jordan? Will Jordan obtain a standing west of the river and if so how will it be balanced by a parallel element in Israel's favor? Abu Sharif left open questions relating to the nature of the confederation. He insisted that once the State of Palestine is established even though it would join immediately in a confederation with Jordan, every aspect of the nature and character of that state would be negotiable.
5. Ben-Aharon stressed the economic relationship between Israel and the Arab party that is to emerge to the east of Israel. He spoke of a common market, free port arrangements and an accord on currency matters with Jordan. Abu Sharif also placed emphasis on future economic arrangements including the need for economic and trade incentives for the area from the U.S. and EEC.
6. Ben-Aharon was prepared to talk about the final status of the Territories before the autonomy is established. Israel had previously insisted on addressing this question only as contemplated in the Camp David accords. Although flatly dismissing reliance on "Camp David" for symbolic reasons, Abu Sharif seemed ready to discuss several of the substantive aspects of the Accords.

The substantive positions of the two officials on the points mentioned above are closer than conventional wisdom would suggest. But nothing in Ben-Aharon's comments would indicate the slightest change in Israel's refusal to consider the PLO as a partner in the search for peace.

© 1988 F.E.C.

**National Security Council
The White House**

27

89 FEB 28 12: 53

LOG # 0587
SYSTEM PRS NSC INT
DOCLOG 27 A/O _____

	SEQUENCE TO	HAS SEEN	DISPOSITION
Bob Perito	<u>1</u>	<u>Rmb</u>	<u>A</u>
Philip Hughes	<u>2</u>	<u>[Signature]</u>	
Bob Gates	<u>3</u>	<u>[Signature]</u>	
Brent Scowcroft	<u>4</u>	<u>[Signature]</u>	
Philip Hughes			
Situation Room			
West Wing Desk	<u>5</u>	<u>27.3/17</u>	<u>XN</u>
NSC Secretariat	<u>6</u>		<u>D</u>

A = Action I = Information D = Dispatch R = Retain N = No further Action

cc: VP

Sununu

Other _____

COMMENTS

Should be seen by: _____

(Date/Time)

Copy for House please

UNCLASSIFIED
ACTION DATA SUMMARY REPORT

RECORD ID: 8900587

DOC ACTION OFFICER

001 HAASS
002 SCOWCROFT
003

CAO ASSIGNED ACTION REQUIRED

Z 89020812 PREPARE MEMO FOR SCOWCROFT
Z 89020916 FOR SIGNATURE
X 89031712 SCOWCROFT SGD LTR

UNCLASSIFIED