

# New York Lawyers' Practical Skills Series

## New York Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits  
Damon P. Howard, Esq.  
Honorable Michael L. Weisberg

2019–2020\*

\* This volume is current through 2019 and includes changes effected by the Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act of 2019.

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION



New York State Bar Association publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2019  
New York State Bar Association  
All rights reserved  
ISBN: 978-1-57969-568-2  
Product Number: 4161920

# CONTENTS

I.	Introduction .....	1
II.	The Tenancy .....	12
	A. Market Rentals.....	16
	1. The Parties .....	18
	2. The Premises.....	21
	3. Rent.....	22
	4. Default .....	23
	5. Legal-Fees Provisions.....	24
	6. Recording of Leases .....	30
	B. Rent Regulation .....	31
	1. Rent-Stabilized Premises .....	33
	a. Rent Stabilization Overview .....	33
	b. Tenants’ Rights Under Rent Stabilization .....	37
	c. Exemptions From Rent Stabilization .....	41
	2. Rent-Controlled Premises .....	47
	3. Rent-Overcharge Claims .....	50
	4. Succession Rights .....	54
	5. Preferential Rents .....	58
	C. Public Housing .....	59
	D. Section 8 (Tenant and Project-Based) Housing.....	61
	1. The Voucher Program .....	61
	2. Project-Based Section 8.....	66
	E. Cooperatives and Condominiums.....	67
	1. Cooperatives Generally .....	67
	2. Cooperative and Condominium Conversions.....	69
	3. Condominiums.....	71
	4. Subsidized/Regulated Cooperatives Under the Private Housing Finance Law .....	72
	a. Housing Development Fund Companies .....	72
	b. Limited-Profit Housing Companies (Mitchell-Lama Housing).....	73
	F. Lofts.....	74
	G. Hotels and Single-Room Occupancy Buildings (SROs).....	76
III.	Tenancy Protections .....	79
	A. Housing Discrimination.....	79
	B. Warranty of Habitability.....	81
IV.	Conveying the Tenancy .....	85
V.	Summary Proceedings .....	88
	A. Introduction to Summary Proceedings .....	88
	1. Overview .....	88
	2. The Basic Structure of Modern Summary Proceedings .....	91
	a. Pleadings.....	91
	b. Governing Procedural Statutes .....	92
	c. Counterclaims and Jury Waivers .....	93
	d. Attorney Fees and Costs .....	93

e.	Types of Summary Proceedings .....	93
B.	Holdover Proceedings .....	94
1.	Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants.....	95
2.	Grounds for Holdover Proceeding Against Tenants—Breach of a Substantial Obligation of the Tenancy .....	97
a.	Unauthorized Sublets .....	97
b.	Pets.....	101
c.	Alterations.....	103
d.	Security Deposit.....	105
e.	Specified Use or Purpose .....	105
3.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Wrongful Acts of Tenants and Nuisance .....	106
a.	Nuisance.....	106
b.	Hoarding .....	108
c.	Chronic Late Payment of Rent.....	109
d.	Access .....	111
e.	Destruction of the Premises .....	112
f.	Illegal Occupancy .....	112
g.	Illegal Use .....	112
4.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Separate Grounds to Recover Rent-Regulated Units .....	115
a.	Nonprimary Residence .....	115
b.	Owner’s Use .....	119
c.	Recovery for Use by Nonprofit Institution .....	123
d.	Demolition .....	124
(1)	Application and Requirements Under Rent Stabilization.....	124
(2)	Notice Requirements Under Rent Stabilization.....	125
(3)	Administrative Orders, Conditions and Tenant Protections Under Rent Stabilization.....	126
(4)	Distinctions Between Rent Control and Rent Stabilization.....	128
e.	Withdrawal from the Rental Market .....	128
f.	Eviction Plan.....	129
g.	Failure to Renew .....	129
h.	Profiteering .....	130
5.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Nontenants.....	130
a.	Proceedings by Purchasers in Foreclosure.....	130
b.	Licensee Proceedings.....	131
c.	Squatters.....	133
d.	Occupant Remaining in Possession After Sale of the Premises .....	133
e.	Vendee in Possession After Default Under Contract of Sale .....	134
f.	Occupant Under Cultivation Agreement .....	134
g.	Employer-Employee Proceedings.....	134
h.	Occupant After Termination of Life Estate .....	136
i.	Occupant by Forcible or Unlawful Entry .....	136
6.	Predicate Notices .....	136
a.	Overview.....	136

b.	Notice to Cure .....	136
c.	Notice of Termination.....	138
d.	Timeliness of Notices Served by Mail.....	146
7.	Notice of Petition and Petition.....	146
a.	Notice of Petition/Service/Necessary Parties .....	146
(1)	Issuance of the Notice of Petition .....	146
(2)	Timing for Service of the Notice of Petition and Petition .....	147
b.	Contents of the Petition.....	150
(1)	General Requirements.....	150
(2)	Description of the Premises Sought to Be Recovered .....	151
(3)	Statement of the Parties' Interests in the Premises Sought to Be Recovered .....	152
(4)	Regulatory Status of the Premises and Compliance With the Applicable Rent Regulation Laws .....	153
(5)	Verification of the Petition .....	154
(6)	Liberalization of Pleading Requirements .....	154
(7)	Alternative Pleadings.....	155
(8)	Inquests .....	156
C.	Nonpayment Proceedings.....	157
1.	Proper Parties.....	157
2.	Elements of a Nonpayment Proceeding.....	157
3.	What May Be Recovered as Rent in a Nonpayment Proceeding .....	158
4.	Rent Demands.....	160
a.	Overview.....	160
b.	Contents of the Rent Demand.....	160
c.	Modifying Notice Requirements by Agreement Between the Parties .....	163
d.	Compliance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act .....	163
5.	Notice of Petition and Petition.....	164
6.	Defaults.....	165
7.	Spiegel Law .....	166
8.	Bankruptcy.....	167
D.	Answering a Summary Proceeding .....	167
E.	Recovery of Use and Occupancy in Summary Proceedings .....	171
F.	Disclosure in Summary Proceedings.....	175
G.	Rent Deposits/Pendente Lite Use and Occupancy .....	177
H.	Stays, Warrant, Cures .....	178
1.	Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Nonpayment Proceedings .....	178
2.	Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Holdover Proceedings.....	181
a.	Ten-Day Stay of Warrant of Eviction in Breach of Lease Holdover Proceedings .....	181
b.	Extension of the Post-Judgment Cure to Holdover Proceedings Based on Grounds Other Than Breach of Lease .....	182
(1)	Non-Renewal of a Rent Stabilized Lease .....	182
(2)	Failure to Give Access.....	183
(3)	Nuisance.....	183

(4) Unavailability of a Post-Judgment Cure in Certain Types of Holdover Proceedings.....	183
(5) Public Policy Against Forfeiture of Tenancies in New York .....	185
(6) Non-Residential Tenants and Tenants Outside the City of New York .....	185
(7) Prevailing Landlords’ Entitlement to Attorney Fees .....	185
3. General Powers to Stay Warrants in Summary Proceedings.....	185
4. Stay of the Proceeding Itself Before or After Judgment.....	186
I. Service of Process in Summary Proceedings .....	187
1. Overview of “Traverse” in Summary Proceedings .....	187
2. Service Requirements .....	188
3. Challenging Service.....	192
4. Process Server Rules and Regulations in the City of New York.....	193
a. Overview of Rules .....	193
b. Licensing Requirements/Process Servers and Process Server Agencies .	193
c. Mandatory Posting of Bonds .....	194
d. Record-Keeping Requirements.....	194
e. GPS Technology .....	195
f. Judicial Actions and Proceedings/Claims for Improper Service/Traverse Hearings .....	195
g. Exemptions .....	196
J. General and Affirmative Defenses to Summary Proceedings.....	196
1. Overview.....	196
2. Traverse/Service .....	197
3. Lack of Multiple Dwelling Registration in New York City .....	197
4. Lack of a Proper Certificate of Occupancy .....	198
5. Failure Accurately to State Regulatory Status and Comply with Rent Laws .	199
6. Omitting or Misstating Required Elements of the Petition .....	199
7. Lack of Proper Predicate Notice/Rent Demand Notice.....	200
8. Predicate Notice Vitiating/Tenancy Reinstated .....	200
9. Retaliatory Eviction .....	200
10. A Laches Defense in a Nonpayment Proceeding .....	201
11. Conditions.....	202
12. Actual Eviction/Constructive Eviction .....	203
13. Statute of Limitations .....	203
14. Succession Rights .....	204
15. Waiver of a Breach of Lease .....	205
K. Alleging a Respondent’s Military Status.....	205
L. Competency of Parties to a Landlord-Tenant Proceeding, Including the Unrepresented, Non-English Speakers, and Those Needing Guardians Ad Litem.....	207
M. Settlements and Stipulations in Landlord-Tenant Summary Proceedings .....	209
N. Enforcing Warrants of Eviction and Orders of Possession .....	216
O. Post-Eviction Relief.....	216
VI. Landlord-Tenant Actions and Proceedings Other Than Nonpayment and Holdover Proceedings.....	219

	A. Ejectment Actions .....	219
	B. HP Proceedings .....	221
	C. Article 7-A Proceedings .....	227
	D. Proceedings Under the Tenant Protection Act in New York City.....	228
	1. Expanded Definitions of Harassment .....	229
	2. Presumption of Intent .....	230
	a. Penalties for Harassment .....	230
	E. Illegal Lockout/Unlawful Eviction Actions and Proceedings.....	231
	1. Overview .....	231
	2. Summary Proceedings to Be Restored to Possession.....	232
	3. Criminal Penalties.....	233
	4. Plenary Actions for Damages/RPAPL 853 .....	233
	5. Defenses Against Illegal Lockout Allegations .....	234
	F. Foreclosure Proceedings.....	234
	G. <i>Yellowstone</i> Injunction Actions.....	241
	H. Plenary Actions Between Landlords and Tenants.....	243
VII.	Abandonment and Surrender of Possession .....	243
VIII.	Courts That Award Possession of Real Property .....	246
	A. Overview of Which Courts Adjudicate Summary Proceedings in Which Geographic Locations.....	246
	B. Supreme Court.....	246
	C. The New York City Civil Court .....	247
	D. New York State District Courts (Nassau and Suffolk Counties) .....	251
	E. City Court .....	252
	1. The Housing Part of Buffalo City Court .....	252
	a. History .....	252
	b. Code Violation Actions .....	252
	(1) The Initial Impetus Behind the Problem-Solving Model—District-by- District Scheduling .....	253
	(2) Use of Housing Court Liaisons.....	253
	(3) Arraignment .....	255
	(4) Use of Interlocutory Orders .....	255
	(a) Orders to Vacate .....	256
	(b) Demolition Orders .....	256
	(c) Receiverships .....	256
	(d) Case-Specific Orders .....	257
	(5) The Funding Calendar .....	257
	(6) Sentencing.....	258
	c. Evictions .....	260
	(1) Accessibility.....	261
	(2) Legal Representation for Qualifying Tenants.....	261
	(3) Linkage .....	261
	(4) Stays Until Housing Violations Are Addressed .....	262
	(5) Stipulations .....	262
	(6) Mandatory Mediation .....	263
	(7) Habitability Investigations and Hearings.....	263

	(8) Duty to Repair in the Commercial Setting.....	264
	(9) Hearing Before the Court Attorney/Referee.....	264
	(10) Money Judgments and Appearances in the Buffalo City Court	264
	(11) Attorneys Signing Petitions .....	265
	(12) Control of Out Dates.....	265
	(13) Evictions in Section 8 Tenancies .....	266
	(14) Conclusion .....	266
	2. City Courts Outside Buffalo and the City of New York .....	266
	a. Binghamton City Court.....	267
F.	Town and Village Courts.....	269
	1. Overview.....	269
	2. Eviction Proceedings Specific to Town and Village Courts in Upstate New York .....	269
	3. Town and Village Courts: Jurisdiction and Venue.....	270
	4. Notice of Petition.....	271
	5. Petition.....	272
	6. Service .....	272
G.	Surrogate’s Court.....	273
H.	County Courts.....	273
I.	Federal Courts .....	274
IX.	Appeals .....	274
X.	Conclusion.....	279
Appendix 1	New York’s Housing Stability and Tenant Protection Act of 2019: What Lawyers Must Know — Parts II and II*.....	281
Appendix 2	Duties of Housing Court Liaisons .....	307
Appendix 3	Script for Arraignments.....	309
Appendix 4	Order for Access.....	313
Appendix 5	Order to Vacate .....	315
Appendix 6	Order Appointing Receiver .....	317
Appendix 7	Response to Violation Notice/Request for Rehabilitation Funding Assistance .....	321
Appendix 8	Petition Addendum.....	323
Appendix 9	Memorandum, Decision and Order .....	325
Appendix 10	Stipulation .....	329
Appendix 11	Referral to Department of Health for Premises Violations .....	331
Appendix 12	Request for Extension of Time for Issuance or Execution of a Warrant of Eviction .....	333
	Table of Authorities .....	335
	About the Authors.....	387

\* Reprinted with permission from: New York State Bar Association *Journal*, November 2019, Vol. 91, No. 8, and December 2019, Vol. 91, No. 9, published by the New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.



## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors of the twelfth (2019–2020) edition thank Hon. Carol A. Cocchiola, a Binghamton City Court judge, for updating the City Court section, and Dov Trieman, Esq. for his co-authorship of the eleventh (2018–2019) and tenth (2017–2018) editions; Jeffrey R. Metz, Esq. for his co-authorship of the ninth edition (2016–2017); Michael B. Terk, Esq., for his co-authorship of the eighth (2015–2016), fifth (2012–2013) and fourth (2011–2012) editions; Peter K. Diskint, Esq., for co-authorship of the seventh (2014–2015) and sixth (2013–2014) editions; Victor S. Faleck, Esq., for his co-authorship of the third (2010–2011) and second (2009–2010) editions; and Dan M. Blumenthal, Esq., for his co-authorship of the first (2008–2009) edition. For their research on the sixth (2013–2014) edition, the authors thank Peter Kane, Esq., and Nancy Hassell of the Appellate Term, First Department, and law students Ian Steinberg (Cardozo) and James Steiner (New York Law School). For their research on the fourth (2011–2012) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Daphne Bareket (Florida International), Alison Genova (Fordham), and Hailey B. Render (Syracuse). For their research on the third (2010–2011) edition, the authors thank then-New York Law School students Deena M. Crimaldi and Alana Sliwinski. For their research on the second (2009–2010) edition, the authors thank Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns P. Alex de Richemont (Harvard), Mariella Soussou (Fordham), and Mary Jane Yoon (Columbia). For their research on the first (2008–2009) edition, the authors thank Mary Ann Amodeo, Esq., Judge Lebovits’s court attorney Alexandra Standish, Esq., and Judge Lebovits’s judicial interns Alana Wrublin (Fordham), Victor J. Brubaker (New York Law School), and Stephanie L. Torre (New York Law School). For writing the section on the Buffalo Housing Court and for providing the Buffalo Housing Court forms, the authors thank former Buffalo City Court judge, and now Supreme Court justice, Henry Nowak and now-retired court attorney/referee Mark Doane, Esq. For writing the section on the Justice Courts, the authors also thank Town of Bethlehem Justice Ryan Donovan and Katelyn Primono, Esq. For writing the section on the Binghamton City Court, the authors thank the Hon. Carol Cocchiola of the Binghamton City Court.

**HONORABLE GERALD LEBOVITS**

Hon. Gerald Lebovits has been a New York City judge since 2001. An acting Supreme Court justice in New York County, he serves as the president of the New York State Association of Acting Supreme Court Justices. He previously presided in Civil Court, for which he was the president of the Board of Judges of the New York City Civil Court; Criminal Court; and Housing Court, for which he served as the president of the Association of Housing Court Judges. A part-time teacher for 35 years, he is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Columbia Law School, Fordham University School of Law, and New York University School of Law and was an adjunct at St. John's University School of Law and New York Law School. Active in the New York State Bar Association, for which he has lectured at many Continuing Legal Education programs, he is a past Co-chair of the Association's Committee on Landlord and Tenant Proceedings, has authored the *Bar Journal's* Legal Writer column since 2001, and has published 33 articles in the Association's journals, 19 of them in the Association's *New York Real Property Law Journal*. A Canadian native, he graduated from the Ottawa (LL.L.), Tulane (M.C.L.), and New York University (LL.M.) law schools.

Justice Lebovits dedicates this book to his soulmate and love, New York County Supreme Court Justice Margaret A. Chan.

**DAMON P. HOWARD, ESQ.**

Damon P. Howard is a founding partner of Ephron-Mandel & Howard, L.L.P., located in New York City. His experience ranges from commercial litigation, including actions for injunctive and declaratory relief, to residential and commercial landlord-tenant issues. Mr. Howard is a graduate of the University of Texas at Austin and the Tulane University Law School. He is admitted to practice in New York, the Southern District of New York, New Jersey, and Louisiana.

**HONORABLE MICHAEL L. WEISBERG**

Hon. Michael Weisberg has been a judge in the New York City Housing Court since 2015. Before taking the bench, he was Director of the Housing Law Unit at Brooklyn Legal Services and co-founder of the Brooklyn Tenant Lawyers Network. He is a graduate of the University of Virginia and New York University School of Law.