Municipal Ethics in New York:

A Primer for Attorneys and Public Officials

Edited by Jeff Tremblay, Esq. Mark Davies, Esq. Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Amber Gonzalez, Esq. New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

> Copyright: 2016 by New York State Bar Association All rights reserved ISBN: 1-57969-472-1 Product Number: 4142

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1	Article 18: New York's Conflict of Interest Law for Municipal Officials Mark Davies, Esq. Steven G. Leventhal, Esq.
Chapter 2	Non–Article 18 Conflicts of Interest Restrictions Governing Counties, Cities, Towns, and Villages Under New York State Law Mark Davies, Esq.
Chapter 3	Misuse of Public Office and Municipal Resources <i>Jessie M. Beller, Esq.</i>
Chapter 4	Applicability of the Hatch Act to Municipal Officers and Employees Sung Mo Kim, Esq. Ethan Carrier, Esq.
Chapter 5	Compatibility of Office James D. Cole, Esq.
Chapter 6	Disclosure Julia Davis, Esq.
Chapter 7	Running a Local Municipal Ethics Board: Ten Steps to a Better Board Steven G. Leventhal, Esq.
Chapter 8	How to Analyze an Ethics Problem: Recognizing Common Law Conflicts of Interest <i>Steven G. Leventhal, Esq.</i>
Chapter 9	Administration of Disclosure Julia Davis, Esq.
Chapter 10	Conflicts of Interest Regulation in New York City Breanne E. Injeski, Esq.
Chapter 11	How to Adopt a Municipal Conflicts of Interest Law: Contents Mark Davies, Esq.
Chapter 12	How to Adopt a Municipal Conflicts of Interest Law: Process <i>Mark Davies, Esq.</i>

- Chapter 13 Access to Government *Robert J. Freeman, Esq.*
- Chapter 14 Reconciling the Duty of Confidentiality Under Article 18 of the General Municipal Law With the Duty to Disclose Under FOIL and the Open Meetings Law *Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq.*
- Chapter 15 Municipal Lobbying Under the New York State Lobbying Act Martin L. Levine, Esq. Ralph P. Miccio, Esq.
- Chapter 16 Whistleblower Protection *Julia Davis, Esq.*
- Chapter 17 Municipal Attorney-Client Relationship *Michael P. Leone, Esq.*
- Chapter 18 Inspectors General in Small and Mid-Sized New York Municipalities: A Practical Approach *Philip A. Zisman, Esq.*

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1		Article 18: New York's Conflict of Interest Law for Municipal Officials Mark Davies, Esq. Steven G. Leventhal, Esq.				
[1.0]	I.	Introduction	3			
[1.1]	II.	Genesis and Adoption of Article 18	4			
[1.2]	III.	Applicability of Article 18	6			
[1.3]	IV.	Prohibited Interests (§§ 800–805)	7			
[1.4]		A. "Contract"	8			
[1.5]		B. "Interest"	9			
[1.6]		C. Control	11			
[1.7]		D. Exceptions	12			
[1.8]		E. Caveat	16			
[1.9]		F. Violations	16			
[1.10]		G. Penalties	17			
[1.11]		H. Special Note for Nassau County	18			
[1.12]		I. Disclosure of Interests in Municipal Contracts	18			
[1.13]		J. Criticisms of § 801	20			
[1.14]	V.	Prohibited Conduct (§§ 805-a and 805-b)	23			
[1.15]		A. Gifts (§ 805-a(1)(a))	24			
[1.16]		1. Bribery and Related Offenses (Penal Law				
		Art. 200)	28			
[1.17]		B. Confidential Information (§ 805-a(1)(b))	29			
[1.18]		C. Compensation for Matters Before an Official's				
		Own Agency (§ 805-a(1)(c))	32			
[1.19]		D. Contingency Fee Agreements (§ 805-a(1)(d))	33			
[1.20]	* **	E. Gaps in § 805-a	34			
[1.21]	VI.	Administration (§§ 806–808)	35			
[1.22]		A. Codes of Ethics (§§ 806 and 807)	36			
[1.23]	X / T	B. Board of Ethics (§ 808)	38			
[1.24]	VII.	11 (0)	41			
[1.25]		Annual Financial Disclosure (§§ 810–812)	43			
[1.26]	IX.	Conclusion	45			
Chapter 2		Non-Article 18 Conflicts of Interest Restrictions Governing Counties, Cities, Towns, and Villages Under New York State Law				
		Mark Davies, Esq.				
[2.0]	I.	Introduction	49			
[2.1]	II.	Review of the Provisions	49			

Chapter 3		Misuse of Public Office and Municipal Resources <i>Jessie M. Beller, Esq.</i>				
[3.0]	I.	Introduction: Misuse of Public Office and				
		Municipal Resources	61			
[3.1]	II.	New York State Constitutional Provisions	62			
[3.2]		A. History of the Gift and Loan Clause	62			
[3.3]		B. What Is a Public Purpose?	63			
[3.4]		C. What Is Prohibited?	65			
[3.5]		1. Actions Taken by the Municipality	65			
[3.6]		a. Municipal Spending	65			
[3.7]		b. Use of Municipal Resources	67			
[3.8]		2. Actions Taken by the Public Servant	68			
[3.9]		D. What Is Permitted?	70			
[3.10]		1. Compensation	70			
[3.11]		2. Incidental Private Benefit	71			
[3.12]		E. Conclusion	73			
[3.13]	III.	General Municipal Law Section 51	74			
[3.14]		A. Legal Standard	74			
[3.15]		B. History	75			
[3.16]		C. Using Section 51	76			
[3.17]		D. Conclusion	78			
[3.18]	IV.	Statutory Provisions	79			
[3.19]		A. The Law	79			
[3.20]		1. New York City Charter § 2604(b)(2):				
		Misuse of Public Resources	80			
[3.21]		2. New York City Charter § 2604(b)(3):				
		Misuse of Public Position	80			
[3.22]		3. 53 Rules of the City of New York § 1-13	80			
[3.23]		B. Use of City Office for Personal Gain	81			
[3.24]		1. What Is Prohibited?	82			
[3.25]		2. What Is Permitted?	85			
[3.26]		3. Conclusion	86			
[3.27]		C. Duty of Undivided Loyalty to the City	87			
[3.28]		1. What Is Prohibited?	87			
[3.29]		2. What Is Permitted?	88			
[3.30]		a. De Minimis Use	88			
[3.31]		b. Waivers Granted by the Board to Permit				
		Limited Use of City Resources	89			
[3.32]		3. Conclusion	91			
[3.33]	V.	Model Local Law Language	91			
[3.34]		A. Model Misuse of Public Resources Law	92			
[3.35]		B. Model Misuse of Public Position Law	93			

[3.36]		C. Model Waiver Provision	93
[3.37]	VI.	Conclusion	93
Chapter 4		Applicability of the Hatch Act to Municipal Officer Employees <i>Sung Mo Kim, Esq.</i> <i>Ethan Carrier, Esq.</i>	s and
[4.0]	I.	Introduction	97
[4.1]	II.	What Is the Hatch Act?	97
[4.2]	III.	How Is It Administered?	97
[4.3]	IV.	To Whom Does It Apply?	98
[4.4]	V.	What Activities Does It Prohibit?	100
[4.5]	VI.	What Activities Are Permissible?	100
[4.6]	VII.	What Happens When a Violation Occurs?	101
[4.7]		Conclusion	101
Chapte	r 5	Compatibility of Office James D. Cole, Esq.	
[5.0]	I.	Introduction	105
[5.1]	II.	Statutory Incompatibility	105
[5.2]	III.	Common Law Incompatibility	105
[5.3]	IV.	Subordination	106
[5.4]	V.	Conflicts of Duties	107
[5.5]	VI.	Recusal	108
[5.6]		Code of Ethics	109
[5.7]	VIII.	Impact of Incompatibility	109
[5.8]	IX.	Local Law Exception	109
[5.9]	Х.	Conclusion	110
Chapte	er 6	Disclosure Julia Davis, Esq.	
[6.0]	I.	Introduction	113
[6.1]	II.	Transactional Disclosure	113
[6.2]	III.	Applicant Disclosure	116
[6.3]	IV.	Annual Disclosure	118
[6.4]		A. Municipalities Subject to Annual Disclosure	
		Requirements	119
[6.5]		1. Populations of 50,000 or More	120
[6.6]		2. Populations Under 50,000	120
[6.7]		B. Personnel Covered	120
[6.8]		1. Populations Over 50,000	120
[6.9]		2. Population Under 50,000	121

	C.	Information to Be Disclosed	122
		1. State Form (Except New York City)	122
		2. Municipality's Own Form	124
		3. New York City (Cities With a Population of	
		One Million or More)	126
	D.	Exclusions, Public Inspection, and Privacy	
		Requests	127
		1. Exclusions	127
		2. Public Inspection	127
		3. Privacy Requests	128
	E.	Enforcement and Penalties	129
	F.	Non-General Municipal Law or Public Officers	
		Law Filers	130
		1. Tax Assessors	130
		2. Public Authority Filers	132
V.	Co	nclusion	135
7	р.,	nning of another Municipal Ethics Doords Ton Ston	a t a a
er /		· · ·	s to a
C .		•	120
-			139
_			140
			140
-		•	143
-		-	1 4 4
			144
-			145
_		-	146
-			1.40
			149
		1	150
			150
-		*	151
			151
Step	10:	Take Advantage of Ethics Resources	153
er 8	Но	w to Analyze an Ethics Problem: Recognizing	
	Co	mmon Law Conflicts of Interest	
	Ste	ven G. Leventhal, Esq.	
L		-	157
			158
	er 7 Step Step Prob Step Be In Step Step Step Com Step Disc Step are S	D. E. F. V. Co er 7 Ru Bel Step 1: U Step 2: I Problem Step 3: S Step 4: H Be Indep Step 5: C Step 6: N Step 7: A Complai Step 9: H are Sued Step 10: er 8 Ho Co Ste I. Intti II. Go	 Municipality's Own Form New York City (Cities With a Population of One Million or More) Exclusions, Public Inspection, and Privacy Requests Exclusions Public Inspection Privacy Requests Enforcement and Penalties F. Non-General Municipal Law or Public Officers Law Filers Tax Assessors Public Authority Filers V. Conclusion Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Step 1: Understand Your Mission Step 2: Learn How to Analyze a Government Ethics Problem Step 3: Set the Right Tone—Be Credible. Step 4: Empower the Board to Control Its Own Business— Be Independent Step 5: Get the Message Out—Be Proactive Step 7: Adopt Rules of Procedure for Investigating Complaints Step 9: Know What to Expect if the Board or Its Members are Sued Step 10: Take Advantage of Ethics Resources Step 10: Take Advantage of Ethics Resources

[8.2]	III.	After <i>Tuxedo</i> and <i>Zagoreos</i>	61			
[8.3]	IV.	Conclusion 1				
Chapt	er 9	Administration of Disclosure				
		Julia Davis, Esq.				
[9.0]	I.	Introduction 1'	71			
[9.1]	II.	Transactional Disclosure 1	71			
[9.2]	III.	Applicant Disclosure 1'	72			
[9.3]	IV.	Annual Disclosure 1	73			
[9.4]		A. Introduction 1'	73			
[9.5]		B. Form of Disclosure 1'	73			
[9.6]		1. Paper Report 1'	73			
[9.7]			74			
[9.8]			75			
[9.9]		-	76			
[9.10]			76			
[9.11]		-	77			
[9.12]			78			
[9.13]		-	78			
[9.14]		· · ·	79			
[9.15]		*	79			
[9.16]		(2) Submission and Collection 1	80			
[9.17]		D. Filer Support During the Filing Period 1	81			
[9.18]			81			
[9.19]		1. Verification 1	82			
[9.20]		2. Conflicts Reviews 1	82			
[9.21]		a. Relevant Law 1	83			
[9.22]		b. Available Documentary Resources 1	83			
[9.23]		c. Available Personnel Resources 1	84			
[9.24]		3. Public Inspection of Reports 1	85			
[9.25]		4. Retention of Reports 1	86			
[9.26]		5. Administrative Issues 1	87			
[9.27]		a. Administrative Application 1	87			
[9.28]		b. Communication With Filers 1	87			
[9.29]	V.	Conclusion 1	88			
Appen	dix A	: Transactional Disclosure (Pursuant to Gen. Mun. Law				
_		§ 803)	89			
Appen	dix B	: Applicant Disclosure (Pursuant to Gen. Mun. Law				
		§ 809)	91			

Chapter 1	Conflicts of Interest Regulation in New York City					
	Breanne E. Injeski, Esq.					
[10.0] I.	Introduction	195				
[10.1] II.	The N.Y.C. Conflicts of Interest Board	195				
[10.2]	A. Interpreting the Law: Informal Advice and Forma	1				
	Advisory Opinions	197				
[10.3]	B. Enforcing & Prosecuting Violations of the City's					
	Conflicts of Interest Laws	198				
[10.4]	1. Commencing an Enforcement Action	199				
[10.5]	2. Administrative Trial	201				
[10.6]	3. Penalties for Violations	203				
[10.7] III.	Conflicts of Interest Standards	204				
[10.8]	A. Prohibited Interests	206				
[10.9]	1. Mechanisms for Dealing with Prohibited					
	Interests	208				
[10.10]	2. Non-Prohibited Positions	209				
[10.11]	B. Prohibitions on Use of City Time and					
	Resources	210				
[10.12]	C. Impartiality in Performing Official Duties:					
	Prohibitions on Using Public Office for Private					
	Advantage					
[10.13]	D. Restrictions on Accepting Gifts and Gratuities					
[10.14]	E. Restrictions on Superior-Subordinate Conduct	213				
[10.15]	F. Restrictions on Engaging in City Matters in the					
	Private Sector	214				
[10.16]	G. Post-Employment Restrictions					
[10.17] IV	e					
[10.18] V.	•					
[10.19] VI	Conclusion	221				
Chanter 1	l How to Adopt a Municipal Conflicts of Interest La	w•				
Chapter 1	Contents	•••				
	Mark Davies, Esq.					
[11.0] I.	Introduction	225				
[11.0] I. [11.1] II.		223				
[11.1] 11.	Ethics Law	226				
[11.2]	A. The Code of Ethics	226				
[11.3]	1. Required Provisions of the Code of Ethics					
[11.4]	 Optional Provisions of the Code of Ethics Optional Provisions of the Code of Ethics 					
[11.4]	 Optional Provisions of the Code of Ethics Prohibited Interests, Definitions, 	232				
[11.2]	Exclusions	235				
[11.6]	4. Regulation of Private Citizens and Entities					
[11.0]		250				

[11.7]		5.	Conclusion	237	
[11.8]	B. Disclosure 2				
[11.9]		1.	Transactional Disclosure	238	
[11.10]		2.	Applicant Disclosure	240	
[11.11]		3.	Annual Disclosure	241	
[11.12]		4.	Contents of Disclosure Provisions for the		
			Local Ethics Law	243	
[11.13]			a. Transactional Disclosure	243	
[11.14]			b. Applicant Disclosure	246	
[11.15]			c. Annual Disclosure	248	
[11.16]		5.	Conclusion	251	
[11.17]	C.	Adn	ninistration	252	
[11.18]		1.	Appointment and Structure of Ethics		
			Board	252	
[11.19]		2.	Training and Education	256	
[11.20]		3.	Legal Advice	258	
[11.21]		4.	Regulation of Disclosure	261	
[11.22]		5.	Enforcement	265	
			ion		
Appendix A:	Eth	ics R	Reform Checklist	271	
Chanter 12	Ho	w to	Adopt a Municipal Conflicts of Interest La	w•	
Chapter 12			Adopt a Municipal Conflicts of Interest La	w:	
Chapter 12	Pro	ocess		w:	
-	Pro Ma	ocess ark Da	avies, Esq.		
[12.0] I.	Pro Ma	ocess erk Da roduc	avies, Esq.		
-	Pro Ma Intr Ste	ocess ark Da roduc ps in	avies, Esq. ction Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest	277	
[12.0] I. [12.1] II.	Pro Ma Intr Ste Lav	ocess erk Da roduc ps in w	avies, Esq. ction Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest	277 277	
[12.0] I.	Pro Ma Intr Ste Lav	ocess ark Da roduc ps in w Dete	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire	277 277 277 s,	
[12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2]	Pro Ma Intr Ste Lav A.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law	277 277	
[12.0] I. [12.1] II.	Pro Ma Intr Ste Lav A.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law fting the Substantive Provisions of the	277 277 s, 277	
[12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3]	Pro Ma Intu Ste Lav A. B.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethio	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law fting the Substantive Provisions of the cs Law	277 277 s, 277	
[12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2]	Pro Ma Intu Ste Lav A. B.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethia	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law fting the Substantive Provisions of the cs Law fting the Annual (Financial) Disclosure	277 277 s, 277 278	
[12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4]	Pro Ma Intu Ste Lav A. B. C.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethio Draf Prov	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law fting the Substantive Provisions of the cs Law fting the Annual (Financial) Disclosure visions	277 277 s, 277 278 278 282	
 [12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4] [12.5] 	Pro Ma Intu Stee Lav A. B. C. D.	ocess ark Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethia Draf Prov Draf	avies, Esq. ction Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law Concerns for the Local Ethics Law	277 277 s, 277 278 278 282 282	
[12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4]	Pro Ma Intu Stee Lav A. B. C. D.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethio Draf Prov Draf	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law Concerns for the Local Ethics Law Conc	277 277 s, 277 278 278 282 282 287 es	
 [12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4] [12.5] [12.6] 	Pro Ma Intri Ste Lav A. B. C. D. E.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethio Draf Prov Draf Draf	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law fting the Substantive Provisions of the cs Law fting the Annual (Financial) Disclosure visions fting the Enforcement Mechanism fting the Provisions Regulating the Other Dution the Ethics Board	277 277 s, 277 278 282 287 287 289	
 [12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4] [12.5] [12.6] 	Pro Ma Intu Stee Lav A. B. C. D.	ocess rk Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethio Draf Prov Draf of th Draf	avies, Esq. Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law Concerns for the Local Ethics Board Concerns for the Entities Regulating the Establishm	277 277 s, 277 278 282 287 282 287 es 289 ent	
 [12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4] [12.5] [12.6] [12.7] 	Pro Ma Intr Ste Lav A. B. C. D. E. F.	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethia Draf Prov Draf of th Draf and	avies, Esq. Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law Concerns for the Ethics Board Concerns for the Ethics Board	2777 2777 2778 2777 2778 2782 287 289 289 289 289 289	
 [12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4] [12.5] [12.6] [12.7] [12.8] III. 	Pro Ma Intr Ste Lav A. B. C. D. E. F. Cc	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethic Draf Draf Draf of th Draf and of th Draf	avies, Esq. etion Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law Cring the Substantive Provisions of the cs Law Cring the Annual (Financial) Disclosure visions Cring the Enforcement Mechanism Cring the Provisions Regulating the Other Dution the Ethics Board Cring the Provisions Regulating the Establishm Structure of the Ethics Board	2777 2777 2778 2777 2778 282 287 289 289 289 289 292	
 [12.0] I. [12.1] II. [12.2] [12.3] [12.4] [12.5] [12.6] [12.7] [12.8] III. Appendix A: 	Pro Ma Intu Ste Lav A. B. C. D. E. F. Cc Mc	ocess ork Da roduc ps in w Dete and Draf Ethic Draf Draf Draf of th Draf and of th Draf and of th Draf Draf	avies, Esq. Adopting a Local Conflicts of Interest ermining the Municipal Client's Needs, Desire Concerns for the Local Ethics Law Concerns for the Ethics Board Concerns for the Ethics Board	2777 2777 2778 2777 2778 2782 287 289 289 289 289 289	

Chapter 13 Access to Government

Robert J. Freeman, Esq.

[13.0]	I.	Common Sense	343
[13.1]	II.	FOIL	344
[13.2]		A. Scope	344
[13.3]		B. Exceptions to Rights of Access	345
[13.4]		1. Unwarranted Invasion of Personal Privacy	346
[13.5]		2. Intra-Agency Materials	348
[13.6]		C. Financial Disclosure Statements	349
[13.7]		D. Other Exceptions	349
[13.8]		E. Procedural Matters	352
[13.9]	III.	The Open Meetings Law	353
[13.10]		A. Definitions	353
[13.11]		B. Personnel	354
[13.12]		C. Attorney-Client Privilege	355
[13.13]		D. Notice	356
[13.14]		E. Minutes	356
[13.15]	IV.	Role of the Committee on Open Government	357
_		of the General Municipal Law With the Duty to Dis	sclose
		Under FOIL and the Open Meetings Law <i>Steven G. Leventhal, Esq.</i>	
[14.0]	I.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq.	361
[14.0] [14.1]	I. II.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq.	361
		Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction	361 362
		Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters	
[14.1]	II.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session?	
[14.1]	II.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A	362
[14.1] [14.2]	II. III.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look	362
[14.1] [14.2]	II. III.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government	362 364
[14.1] [14.2] [14.3]	II. III. IV.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education	362 364
[14.1] [14.2] [14.3]	II. III. IV.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different	362 364 367
[14.1][14.2][14.3][14.4]	II. III. IV. V.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different Meaning For Purposes of Gen. Mun. Law Art. 18	362 364 367
 [14.1] [14.2] [14.3] [14.4] [14.5] 	II. III. IV. V.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different Meaning For Purposes of Gen. Mun. Law Art. 18 Than It Does For Purposes of FOIL and the OML?	362 364 367
[14.1][14.2][14.3][14.4]	II. III. IV. V.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different Meaning For Purposes of Gen. Mun. Law Art. 18 Than It Does For Purposes of FOIL and the OML? "Confidential Government Information": New York	362364367371
 [14.1] [14.2] [14.3] [14.3] [14.4] [14.5] [14.6] 	II. III. IV. V. VI. VII.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different Meaning For Purposes of Gen. Mun. Law Art. 18 Than It Does For Purposes of FOIL and the OML? "Confidential Government Information": New York Rules of Professional Conduct	362364367371
 [14.1] [14.2] [14.3] [14.4] [14.5] 	II. III. IV. V. VI. VII.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different Meaning For Purposes of Gen. Mun. Law Art. 18 Than It Does For Purposes of FOIL and the OML? "Confidential Government Information": New York Rules of Professional Conduct	 362 364 367 371 373 374
 [14.1] [14.2] [14.3] [14.3] [14.4] [14.5] [14.6] [14.7] 	II. III. IV. V. VI. VII.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different Meaning For Purposes of Gen. Mun. Law Art. 18 Than It Does For Purposes of FOIL and the OML? "Confidential Government Information": New York Rules of Professional Conduct May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Records of Proceedings Before the Local Board of Ethics?	 362 364 367 371 373 374 375
 [14.1] [14.2] [14.3] [14.3] [14.4] [14.5] [14.6] 	II. III. IV. V. VI. VII.	Steven G. Leventhal, Esq. Carol L. Van Scoyoc, Esq. Introduction May a Local Law Prohibit Disclosure of Matters Discussed in Executive Session? New York State Attorney General Opinion—A Closer Look New York State Committee on Open Government Opinions—A Closer Look Opinions of the New York State Commissioner of Education Can "Confidential Information" Have a Different Meaning For Purposes of Gen. Mun. Law Art. 18 Than It Does For Purposes of FOIL and the OML? "Confidential Government Information": New York Rules of Professional Conduct	 362 364 367 371 373 374

	Application of Exceptions under FOIL and OML	376
[14.11] XII	. Decision of the State Supreme Court, Westchester	
	County	379
[14.12] XII	I. Investigation into the Conduct of the Suffolk County	
	Ethics Commission	381
[14.13]	A. Decision of the State Supreme Court, Suffolk	
	County	383
[14.14]	B. Investigation by the Suffolk County Grand	
	Jury	385
[14.15]	C. Audit by the Suffolk County Comptroller	387
[14.16] XIV	V.Conclusion	389
CI 4 1		
Chapter 15	5 Municipal Lobbying under the New York State	
	Lobbying Act	
	Martin L. Levine, Esq.	
	Ralph P. Miccio, Esq.	
[15.0] I.	Introduction	393
[15.1] II.	History	394
[15.2]	A. 1999 Amendments	394
[15.3]	B. 2005 Amendments	395
[15.4]	C. 2015 Amendments	396
[15.5] III.	Lobbying Before Municipalities	397
[15.6]	A. Jurisdictional Subdivision	398
[15.7]	B. Lobbying Target Audience and Governmental	
	Action	398
[15.8]	C. Exceptions from the State Lobbying Act	400
[15.9]	1. Zoning	400
[15.10]	2. Permitting	400
[15.11]	3. Religious Orders	400
[15.12]	D. Reporting Requirements	401
[15.13]	1. Lobbyist Statement of Registration	
	(Lobbying Act § 1-e)	401
[15.14]	2. Lobbyist Bimonthly Report	
	(Lobbying Act § 1-h)	401
[15.15]	3. Client Semiannual Report	
	(Lobbying Act § 1-j)	402
[15.16]	a. Source of Funding Disclosures	402
[15.17]	4. Disbursement of Public Monies Report	
	(Lobbying Act § 1-1)	403
[15.18]	5. Additional Lobbying Laws Enacted by	
	Local Governments	403
[15.19] IV.	Lobbying by Municipalities	404

[15.20]		A. Public Officials	404
[15.21]		B. Public Corporation	404
[15.22]		C. Reporting Requirements for Public	
		Corporations	405
[15.23]		1. Statement of Registration	
		(Lobbying Act § 1-e)	405
[15.24]		2. Public Corporation Bimonthly Report	
		(Lobbying Act § 1-i)	405
[15.25]		3. Client Semiannual Report (Lobbying	
		Act § 1-j)	406
[15.26]	V.	About JCOPE	406
[15.27]		A. New York City	406
[15.28]	VI.	Conclusion	407
Chanta	- 1 <i>C</i>	Whistlahlawan Dustastian	
Chapte	r 10	Whistleblower Protection Julia Davis, Esq.	
[16 0]	т	-	411
[16.0]	I.	Introduction	
[16.1]	II. III.	Who Is Covered	
[16.2]		Protected Conduct	
L 1	IV.	Prohibited Retaliation	413
[16.4]	V.	Connection Between Disclosure and Adverse	111
[16 5]	1 /1	Personnel Action	
	VI.	Remedies: When and How Raised	415
[16.6]	V II.	Comparison With Other Laws and Other	417
[16 7]	1 /111	Protections	
[16.7]	VIII	.Conclusion	422
Chapte	r 17	Municipal Attorney-Client Relationship	
-		Michael P. Leone, Esq.	
[17.0]	I.	Who Is the Client?	425
[17.1]	II.	Through the Eyes of an Elected Official	
[17.2]	III.	Developing Trust and Confidence	
[17.3]	IV.	Attorney as a Public Official	
	V.	Government Ethics and Legal Ethics	
		Distinguished—Conflicts of Interest	428
[17.5]	VI.	Governmental and Legal Ethics Distinguished—	
		Disclosure Requirements	433
[17.6]	VII.	Rules of Professional Responsibility—Rule 1.11	434
[17.7]		A. Rule 1.11—Screening in Successive	
		Engagements	435
[17.8]	VIII	. Delivery of Public Books	436
[17.9]	IX.	Municipal Attorney-Client Privilege	436

[17.10]	X.	Attorney-Clier	t Privilege and the Public's					
			-	437				
[17.11]	XI.	Attorney Work	Attorney Work Product and FOIL 4					
		Extent of the Governmental Attorney Client						
			-	439				
[17.13]	XIII	Who Can Waiv	ve the Privilege?	441				
				442				
Chante	r 18	Inspectors Ge	neral in Small and Mid-Sized New Yo	ork				
enupre	1 10		and the shoet of the shoet from the shoet from the shoet of the shoet					
		Philip A. Zismo	an, Esq.					
[18.0]	I.	Introduction		445				
[18.1]	II.		e History of Inspectors General	446				
[18.2]			rs Department of Inspector General	448				
[18.3]			reation of the Yonkers Department of					
		Inspec	tor General	449				
[18.4]		2. Legisla	ative Authority	450				
[18.5]		3. Core F	Functions of the Yonkers IG's Office-					
		Focus	on Auditing	452				
[18.6]		4. Core A	Activities Outside of the Audit					
		Functi	on	454				
[18.7]		a. Inv	estigations into Allegations of					
		Em	ployee and Official Misconduct	454				
[18.8]		b. Eth	ics Investigations and Ethics					
			unseling	454				
[18.9]		c. Co	ntract Monitoring and Vendor					
			ckground Screening	455				
[18.10]		d. Re	view of Community-Based					
			ganizations	455				
[18.11]			view of Developers' Promises to					
			ovide Community Benefits	456				
[18.12]	III.	-	s in Conducting IG Investigations					
				456				
[18.13]	IV.		f Establishing an IG's Office	459				
[18.14]	V.		ials in Small Municipalities to Consider					
			Incorporate Inspector General Concepts					
		into their Gove	ernment's Administration	461				
[18.15]	VI.	Conclusion		463				

JESSIE M. BELLER, ESQ.

Jessie M. Beller graduated from New York University School of Law in 2005 and graduated magna cum laude from the University of Pennsylvania in 2000 with a B.A. in history. At NYU School of Law, Ms. Beller served as an Executive Articles Editor of the Annual Survey of American Law, and received the Philip Cohen Award in recognition of her work on the journal. During law school, she worked for the Honorable Richard Berman, S.D.N.Y., and Lawyers Alliance for New York, the leading provider of transactional legal services for nonprofits within New York City. Prior to law school, Ms. Beller worked for Computers for Youth, a New York City-based nonprofit organization that provides inner-city middle school students and their teachers with computers and the training to use them, where she worked on program growth and development. She currently is an Associate Counsel at the New York City Conflicts of Interest Board, an independent city agency which interprets and enforces the Conflicts of Interest Law governing all New York City public servants, including elected and appointed officials.

ETHAN CARRIER, ESQ.

Ethan Carrier served as Deputy General Counsel for the New York City Conflicts of Interest Board. Prior to serving the Conflicts of Interest Board, Mr. Carrier served as an attorney and ethics official for the U.S. Office of Government Ethics, the U.S. Department of Treasury, the Federal Election Commission, and the Office of White House Counsel. He received his J.D. from the University of Wisconsin Law School and a B.A. from St. John's College in Maryland.

JAMES D. COLE, ESQ.

James D. Cole serves as Special Counsel with the Association of Towns of the State of New York.

MARK DAVIES, ESQ.

Mark Davies is the Executive Director of the Conflicts of Interest Board. He is a native of Long Beach, California who moved to New York in 1968 to attend Columbia University, where he majored in German and English. Following his graduation in 1971, Mr. Davies studied Germanic Philology at Philipps-Universität in Marburg, Germany on a one year fellowship. Upon his return to the United States, Mr. Davies enrolled in Columbia Law School, a choice he made after considering other options, including seminary and a medieval studies program at Yale.

Mr. Davies graduated law school in 1975 and began his legal career at Donovan, Leisure, Newton & Irvine, a Wall Street firm. He later taught at St. John's Law School and was a visiting professor at Fordham Law School. While teaching, he also worked as counsel to a small firm in Westchester focusing on municipal law. In 1987, Governor Mario Cuomo asked Fordham Law School's Dean John D. Feerick to head up the Moreland Act Commission to investigate municipal corruption throughout the state. Feerick asked Mr. Davies to lead the non-New York City division of the Commission. In 1988, he returned to Fordham Law School as a visiting professor teaching, New York Practice, which since 1990 he has continued to each as an adjunct professor. Between 1990 and 1992, Mr. Davies served as Executive Director of the Temporary State Commission on Local Government Ethics, which investigated municipal conflicts of interest and proposed a new state municipal ethics law to replace Article 18 of the General Municipal Law. Mr. Davies returned to private practice when, in late 1993, he interviewed for the New York COIB, a position he began in 1994 and has held ever since.

JULIA DAVIS, ESQ.

Julia Davis is Director of Annual Disclosure and Special Counsel at the New York City Conflicts of Interest Board. She previously served as Deputy Commissioner for Legal Affairs/General Counsel at the New York City Business Integrity Commission, Inspector General at the New York City Department of Investigation, Principal Court Attorney to Judge Gerald Sheindlin (ret.) of Bronx Supreme Court, Criminal Term, and an Assistant District Attorney in the Kings County District Attorney's Office. She has lectured and written articles on anti-corruption, government ethics, and Megan's Law issues. She received her J.D. from American University's Washington College of Law and her A.B. from Smith College.

ROBERT J. FREEMAN, ESQ.

Bob Freeman has worked for the New York State Committee on Open Governmentsince its creation in 1974 and was appointed executive director in 1976. He received his law degree from New York University and a B.S. in Foreign Service from Georgetown University in Washington, D.C. Mr. Freeman has addressed numerous government-related organizations, bar associations, media groups and has lectured at various colleges and universities. He has also spoken on open government laws and concepts throughout the United States, as well as Canada, the Far East, Latin America and Eastern Europe, and has taught the only course in an American law school on public access to government information. He is the

CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES

recipient of numerous honors, and in the spring of 2010, received the John Peter Zenger Award from the New York News Publishers Association and was selected by the National Freedom of Information Coalition and the Society of Professional Journalists for their Heroes of the 50 States award and induction into The Open Government Hall of Fame. Most recently, Mr. Freeman was given the Lifetime Achievement Award by the New York State Associated Press Association.

BREANNE E. INJESKI, ESQ.

Breanne Injeski is the Deputy Director of Enforcement for the City of New York's Conflicts of Interest Board, where she helps oversee the Board's enforcement program. Prior to that, she served as Assistant Counsel to the Board. She regularly speaks and writes on legal issues involving conflicts of interest and ethics in New York City government and has been a regular presenter at the "Annual Citywide Seminar on Ethics in New York City Government" at New York Law School since 2007. She has been a member of the New York City Bar Association's Professional Ethics Committee and Government Ethics Committee. She received undergraduate degrees in Political Science and Strategic Communications from the University of Wisconsin, Madison, and her law degree from Georgetown University Law School, where she was Notes and Comments Editor of the *Tax Lawyer*.

SUNG MO KIM, ESQ.

Sung Mo Kim has spent over a decade in public service, having served as Deputy General Counsel at the New York City Council, Procurement Counsel at the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, and Deputy General Counsel at the Conflicts of Interest Board. Prior to joining City service, he served over three years as a criminal defense attorney at the Nassau County Legal Aid Society. Mr. Kim has chaired the Technology Committee of the New York State Bar Association's Municipal Law Section and has served on the Section's Executive Committee. He is currently the Associate General Counsel at the Queens Borough Public Library.

MICHAEL P. LEONE, ESQ.

Michael Leone received his Bachelor's degree in education and Certificate of Advanced Study from SUNY Brockport and his Juris Doctor from the State University of New York at Buffalo School of Law. He also earned an advanced certificate in Strategic Human Resources Management from Cornell University, School of Industrial and Labor Relations, and a Certificate in Taxation Law from SUNY at Buffalo School of Law. During his years in private practice, Mr. Leone represented a number of municipalities, including serving as general counsel. In addition to advising municipal clients on the legal concerns involved in running day-to-day operations, he has extensive experience in contract negotiations, contract administration, planning and zoning, environmental concerns, FOIL requests, employee issues and NYS Civil Service requirements.

STEVEN G. LEVENTHAL, ESQ.

Steven G. Leventhal is an attorney and a CPA, with extensive experience in the areas of Securities Arbitration, Commercial Litigation, Tax Planning and Litigation, Business Relations, Real Property Transactions, Professional Ethics, Wills, Trusts, Estate Planning and Probate, Municipal Affairs and Land Use Regulation. Mr. Leventhal has lectured and written extensively on the subjects of government, legal and corporate ethics. He is frequently engaged to provide ethics advice, training and continuing professional education programs for municipal officers and employees throughout the State, municipal associations, bar associations, law firms and universities.

MARTIN L. LEVINE, ESQ.

Martin Levine is the Director of Lobbying and Financial Disclosure Compliance and Senior Counsel at the N.Y. State Joint Commission on Public Ethics, where he oversees the administration and review of state and local lobbying activity under the New York's Lobbying Act, as well as the financial disclosure statements filed by state officers and elected officials. While at JCOPE, Martin has led the compliance division's expansion to meet new oversight responsibilities, establishing dedicated units for identifying filing irregularities, implementing major reporting and compliance applications, and authoring new guidance on the intersection between lobbying, strategic consulting, and public relations. He is a frequent speaker on New York lobbying and ethics regulation, including to the Council on Government Ethics Laws, the N.Y. State Bar Association, and various trade associations.

Prior to JCOPE, Mr. Levine worked on the federal response to the 2008 financial crisis, serving as an advisor to U.S. Representative Elijah E. Cummings, and for inspectors general at the U.S. Department of the Treasury and the Federal Housing Finance Agency. He began his career at the Maryland General Assembly and then as counsel to the City of Baltimore Employees' Retirement Systems. He is a graduate of the Case Western Reserve University School of Law and the University of Maryland.

RALPH P. MICCIO, ESQ.

Ralph Miccio served as Special Counsel to both the New York State Temporary Commission on Lobbying and the Commission on Public Integrity.

CAROL L. VAN SCOYOC, ESQ.

Carol L. Van Scoyoc has served as Chief Deputy Corporation Counsel of the City of White Plains since 1995. One of her duties is as legal advisor to the City's Board of Ethics. Previously, she served as an Assistant Chief Deputy Westchester County Attorney. She is the Chair of the Local and State Government Law Section of the New York State Bar Association. She has authored a number of articles appearing in the *Municipal Lawyer* and has been published in the New York Law *Journal*. She is a Past President of the Westchester County Bar Association, Past Chair of its Municipal Law Section, and is Editor-in-Chief of the Westchester Bar *Journal*. She is an Adjunct Professor at Pace University's Graduate School of Public Administration and a former Adjunct Assistant Professor at Iona College.

Ms. Van Scoyoc received NYSBA's 2012 Award for Excellence in Public Service and the *Westchester Business Journal*'s 2011 Above the Bar Award for Outstanding Public Service Attorney. She is a *summa cum laude* graduate of Manhattan College, where she was elected to Phi Beta Kappa, and earned her law degree from Pace University School of Law, and was a published senior editor of the *Pace Law Review*.

PHILIP A. ZISMAN, ESQ.

Philip Zisman has served as the Executive Director of the Association of Inspectors General since 2011. The Association has over 1,300 members consisting of federal, state, local and international inspectors general, their staffs, and other professionals who work to ensure government accountability and integrity. In addition to his work for the Association, Phil is also a Distinguished Lecturer at the City University of New York, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, in the Department of Public Management. He teaches graduate level courses in public labor law, ethics and government inspection and oversight.

From 1998 to 2010, he served as the Inspector General for the City of Yonkers, NY. In 2010–11, he supervised investigations into conspiracies involving claims for compensation for damages incurred as a result of the BP/Deepwater Horizon offshore oil well explosion and oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico. He received his law degree from American University, Washington College of Law, in 1986.