

# New York Lawyers' Practical Skills Series

## Representing the Personal Injury Plaintiff in New York

Patrick J. Higgins, Esq.

2019–2020

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION 

New York State Bar Association publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2019  
New York State Bar Association  
All rights reserved  
ISBN: 978-1-57969-572-9  
Product Number: 4191920

## CONTENTS

I.	Introduction .....	1
II.	Intake Up to Accepting the Case .....	2
	A. Why Represent an Injured Client? .....	2
	B. How to Evaluate the Case.....	2
	1. Initial Client Interview .....	2
	2. Client Issues.....	3
	3. After Meeting the Client.....	4
	4. Clients Who Raise Red Flags .....	7
	C. The Retainer Agreements and Required Records .....	7
	1. Contingency Fee Agreement .....	8
	2. Closing Statement.....	9
	3. Client Disbursements.....	9
	D. Referral Fee-Sharing Agreements .....	9
	1. The Law .....	9
	2. Scenario 1: “We Never Agreed to Share Fees” .....	10
	3. Scenario 2: “You Didn’t Do Enough Work or Share Responsibility” .....	11
	4. Scenario 3: “The Fee-Sharing Agreement Is Void Because It Violates the Model Rules”.....	11
	5. Scenario 4: “The Fee Is Not What You Say It Is”.....	12
	6. How to Avoid the Scenarios Described Above.....	12
	E. Investigating the Case.....	13
	1. Witnesses.....	13
	2. Adverse Party Witness .....	14
	3. Non-Party Witness.....	14
	4. Non-Party Damages Witness.....	15
	5. Investigating Your Client .....	15
	6. Evidence—Find and Preserve .....	17
III.	Substantive Law of Personal Injury .....	17
	A. What Is the Legal Basis for the Injured Plaintiff’s Recovery?.....	18
	B. Common Law Theories .....	18
	1. Negligence .....	18
	2. Comparative Negligence and Assumption of Risk .....	19
	3. Res Ipsa Loquitur .....	20
	C. Statutory Causes of Action.....	20
	1. Labor Law §§ 240(1), 241(6), and 200(1).....	20
	a. Labor Law § 240(1).....	20
	b. Labor Law § 240(1) Defenses .....	22
	c. Labor Law § 200(1).....	24
	d. Labor Law § 241(6).....	25
	2. N.Y. Vehicle and Traffic Law § 388(1) (VTL).....	25
	3. Dram Shop Act Claims—General Obligations Law § 11-101 .....	26
	4. 42 U.S.C. § 1983 and § 1985 Claims .....	26
	5. Wrongful Death Causes of Action—N.Y. Estates, Powers, and Trusts Law § 5-4.1–5-4.6 (EPTL) .....	26

IV.	6. Judiciary Law § 487 .....	26
	7. N.Y. General Business Law §§ 349, 350 (GBL).....	26
	8. Informed Consent—N.Y. Public Health Law § 2805-d (PHL).....	27
	9. Navigation Law § 181 .....	27
	D. Actions Based on Intent.....	27
IV.	Litigating the Medical Malpractice Case .....	27
	A. Substantive Framework and Recent Developments .....	27
	B. Vicarious Liability.....	28
	1. The Mduba Doctrine—Ostensible Agency Liability .....	28
	2. Ostensible Agency Liability Also Applies to Clinics and Medical Offices .....	29
	3. Master Servant Liability .....	29
	C. Medical Malpractice Procedure.....	31
	1. Statute of Limitations .....	31
	2. Continuous Treatment .....	32
	3. Certificate of Merit .....	33
	4. Mandatory Filing and Pre-Calendar Conferences .....	34
	D. Medical Malpractice Discovery .....	35
	1. HIPAA.....	35
	2. The Arons Doctrine .....	36
	a. The Content of Arons Authorizations.....	37
	b. Arons Authorizations Directed to Co-Defendants and Unknown Physicians .....	38
	c. Plaintiffs' Right to Arons Authorizations for Defendants' Physicians in Appropriate Case .....	38
	d. Arons and the Designated Trial Expert Under CPLR 3101(d)(1) .....	38
	e. The Timing of Arons Authorizations .....	38
	3. Hospital Internal and Quality Assurance Records and Statements .....	39
	4. Non-Privileged Medical Malpractice Records .....	41
	a. Hospital ESI Audit Trails .....	41
	5. Prior Transcripts and Lawsuits of Defendant Physicians.....	41
	6. Physical Testing and Discovery .....	42
	7. Depositions in Medical Malpractice Actions .....	42
	8. Discovery Concerning the Defendant Physician.....	43
	9. Medical Malpractice Expert Disclosure .....	43
	10. Medical Privilege Issues for Plaintiffs .....	45
	E. Summary Judgment in Medical Malpractice Actions .....	46
	F. Medical Malpractice Trial Practice .....	47
	1. Evidence .....	47
	2. Frye and Medical Malpractice Actions .....	48
V.	G. Appellate Considerations in Medical Malpractice Actions.....	50
	Products Liability Action .....	50
	A. Summary Judgment in Product Defect Cases .....	53
VI.	Premises Liability Action.....	53
	A. Substantive Framework .....	53
	B. Defenses to Premises Liability Actions.....	55
	C. Investigating the Premises Liability Action .....	56

D.	Tort Liability Based on Contract Obligations .....	57
E.	Snow and Ice Cases .....	57
F.	Summary Judgment Decisions in Premises Liability Cases.....	58
VII.	Automobile Negligence Case .....	60
A.	Checklists for Initial Action .....	60
B.	Investigating the Automobile Negligence Case .....	61
C.	No-Fault Coverage .....	61
1.	Generally .....	61
2.	First-Party Benefits (Basic Economic Loss) .....	62
a.	Entitlements and Offsets.....	62
(1)	Medical (Causally Related) .....	63
(2)	Wages .....	63
(3)	Prescriptions .....	63
(4)	Mileage .....	63
(5)	Home Assistance .....	63
b.	Stacking .....	64
c.	No-Fault Liens .....	63
D.	Uninsured—Motor Vehicle Accident Indemnification Corporation Act (MVAIC) .....	65
1.	Background.....	65
2.	Uninsured Tortfeasor—MVAIC .....	65
3.	Claimant Categories .....	65
4.	Uninsured Policy Coverage.....	66
5.	Policy Insured Claim Filing Procedures.....	66
6.	MVAIC Claim Filing .....	67
a.	No Insurance .....	67
b.	No Insurance—Identity of Wrongdoer Is Not Ascertainable (Hit and Run) .....	68
7.	Insurance Initially Believed to Exist—No Insurance After Later Disclaimer by Carrier.....	68
8.	Failure to File or Late Filing .....	69
9.	Application to the Court .....	69
10.	Claim Resolution .....	70
a.	Insured Person .....	70
b.	Qualified Person .....	70
E.	Uninsured Tortfeasor—Supplemental Uninsured Coverage.....	71
1.	Time Limits for Making the SUM Claim.....	73
2.	Form of the Notice of Claim .....	74
3.	Conditions Precedent to Making a SUM Claim .....	75
4.	Interplay Between SUM and Serious Injury Threshold .....	77
5.	Offsets.....	77
6.	Conclusion .....	77
F.	The Serious Injury Threshold.....	77
1.	The Statutory Requirements .....	77
a.	Death.....	78
b.	Dismemberment.....	79

c. Significant Disfigurement.....	79
d. Fracture .....	79
e. Loss of Fetus.....	80
f. Permanent Loss of Use of a Body Organ, Member, Function or System .....	80
G. Overview of the Most Litigated Threshold Categories .....	80
1. The Court of Appeals on the Serious Injury Threshold .....	81
2. The Current Proof Requirements.....	82
a. Causation .....	82
b. The Gap or Cessation in Treatment .....	84
(1) Who Should Explain the Gap? .....	85
(2) The Proof Needed to Satisfy a Gap .....	85
(3) The Gap on 90/180 Claims .....	86
c. What Constitutes Objective Medical Proof of Injury .....	86
(1) Proof Required for Herniated and Bulging Disks.....	87
(2) Proof Required for Radiculopathy.....	88
(3) Proof Required for Spasms.....	88
(4) Proof Required for Tendon Tears .....	88
(5) Proof Required for Subjective Complaints of Pain and Headaches	88
d. The Need to Identify the Objective Tests Used.....	89
e. The Proof Needed to Show Objective Numeric Quantitative Assessment of Loss of Range of Motion.....	89
f. The Proof Needed for an Objective Qualitative Assessment .....	90
g. The Proof Needed for the 90/180-Day Case.....	91
3. Summary Judgment Motions in the Automobile Negligence Case.....	91
a. The Burden-Shifting Mechanism—The Defendant’s Burden .....	91
b. Marshaling the Proof—The Plaintiff’s Opposition to the Motion .....	93
(1) Unsworn Reports and Records .....	93
(a) Inadmissible .....	93
(b) Admissible .....	93
(2) Competence of the Medical Witness to Render an Opinion.....	93
(3) Plaintiff’s Expert Report.....	94
(4) MRI Reports in the Plaintiff’s Opposing Papers .....	94
(5) The Plaintiff’s Affidavit .....	94
c. Checklist for Prevailing on the Serious Injury Threshold .....	94
H. Pre-Judgment Interest on Liability Verdicts and Inquests Involving the Serious Injury Threshold .....	95
I. Defenses to the Automobile Negligence Action .....	95
1. Seat Belt Defense .....	95
a. Seat Belt Defense Cannot Be Admitted on Liability .....	96
b. Seat Belts Must Be Available for the Defense to Apply .....	96
c. Seat Belt Defense Can Be Waived .....	97
d. Seat Belt Defense Needs Competent Expert Proof.....	98
e. Jury Can Disregard Defense Proof on Seat Belt Use .....	98
J. The Emergency Doctrine in Automotive Cases .....	99
VIII. The Municipal Liability Case .....	100

A.	Notice-of-Claim Requirements .....	100
B.	Service of Notice of Claim.....	101
C.	Application for Leave to Serve a Late Notice.....	101
D.	Provisions Governing Claims Against Municipalities .....	102
1.	Examination Provisions.....	102
2.	Lawsuit Provisions .....	102
3.	Municipalities and the Special Duty Rule—Governmental Propriety Continuum .....	102
IX.	Litigating a Tort Case Against New York State.....	103
A.	The Right to Sue.....	103
B.	Notice of Intention to File a Claim.....	103
C.	The Claim .....	103
D.	Filing Requirements .....	104
E.	Verification of Claim.....	104
F.	Practical Notes.....	105
X.	Pleadings and Serving Process .....	105
A.	Generally .....	105
B.	Summons .....	106
C.	Complaint .....	106
1.	General Requirements .....	106
2.	Specific Pleading Requirements.....	106
3.	Suing an Unknown Party—The Jane Doe Designation .....	107
D.	Demand for Relief (Wherefore Clause) .....	108
E.	Responsive Pleadings .....	108
1.	Review .....	108
2.	Affirmative Defenses.....	108
3.	Moving to Dismiss Affirmative Defenses .....	109
F.	Cross-Claims and Counterclaims .....	109
1.	Cross-Claims .....	109
2.	Counterclaims.....	109
G.	Service of Process.....	109
1.	Personal Service .....	110
a.	Personal Service by Mail .....	110
2.	Substituted Service (Nonpersonal Service).....	110
a.	Delivery to a Person of Suitable Age and Discretion .....	111
b.	Service Upon an Agent for Service .....	111
c.	“Nail and Mail” Service .....	111
d.	Service by Publication .....	111
e.	Alternate Service .....	112
4.	Other Service Methods .....	112
5.	Service Under the Business Corporation Law (BCL) .....	113
6.	Service on Nonresident Motorists .....	113
a.	Service on Resident Motorists for Whom No Address Is Known.....	113
7.	Problems With Filing and Serving .....	113
XI.	Discovery.....	114
A.	Introduction .....	114

B.	Scope and Standard .....	114
1.	Mental Health and Counseling Records .....	114
2.	Non-Party Medical Privilege Issues .....	115
3.	Defendant Medical Privilege Issues .....	116
C.	Electronic Discovery .....	116
1.	What Is ESI?.....	117
2.	How Is ESI Requested and Produced? .....	118
3.	The ESI Litigation Hold and Why It Matters—Spoliation .....	119
4.	Who Pays for a Party Producing ESI?.....	121
D.	Standard for a Protective Order.....	122
E.	Sanctions.....	123
F.	Spoliation.....	123
G.	Request for Production of Documents From a Party.....	123
1.	General Standards.....	123
2.	Objection and Waiver.....	124
3.	Educational Records .....	124
4.	Tax Returns .....	124
5.	Cell Phone Records .....	125
6.	Social Media.....	125
7.	Miscellaneous Documents Held Discoverable .....	127
H.	CPLR 3122(b) .....	128
I.	The Notice to Admit.....	129
J.	Discovery Against Non-Parties .....	129
1.	Request for Production From a Non-Party .....	129
K.	Right to Enter Land or Inspect Things .....	130
L.	Interrogatories.....	130
M.	Bill of Particulars.....	132
1.	General Requirements .....	132
2.	Procedure .....	133
3.	Specific Objections and Commonly Disputed Items.....	133
a.	Demands for Disclosure of Expert Information in a Bill of Particulars .....	133
b.	Bill of Particulars in a Medical Malpractice Case .....	134
c.	Demands for Statutes, Ordinances and Laws in a Bill of Particulars ....	135
d.	Demand for Evidentiary Information in a Bill of Particulars .....	135
e.	Demand for a Breakdown of Future or General Damages in a Bill of Particulars .....	136
f.	Overbroad and Burdensome Demands in a Demand.....	136
g.	Bill of Particulars in Personal Injury Actions.....	137
4.	Supplemental and Amended Bills of Particulars .....	137
N.	Depositions—Oral and Written Questions .....	138
1.	Objections and Directions Not to Answer at a Party Deposition .....	138
2.	Depositions of Non-Parties Under the Deposition Rules—The Role of the Non-Party Witness Counsel .....	140
3.	Is It Proper For a Party’s Attorney to Represent a Non-Party Witness at Deposition?.....	141
4.	Notice Requirements .....	141

5.	Deposition Location .....	141
6.	Preparing to Depose the Opposing Party.....	142
7.	Preparing Your Client for Deposition .....	142
8.	Conduct of the Deposition.....	143
9.	Production of Documents at the Deposition.....	143
O.	Statement of a Party.....	144
P.	Insurance Information .....	144
Q.	Accident Reports .....	144
R.	Names of Witnesses .....	145
S.	Videotapes, Audiotapes and Photographs .....	145
T.	Medical Records and Authorizations .....	145
1.	Overview .....	146
2.	The Court of Appeals Decision in <i>Brito v. Gomez</i> .....	147
U.	Medical Examinations .....	148
V.	Expert Witness Disclosure—Nonmedical Malpractice Action.....	149
1.	Timeliness of Expert Disclosure .....	149
2.	Sufficiency of Expert Disclosure.....	150
3.	Expert Disclosure for Economists .....	151
4.	Treating Physicians and Expert Disclosure .....	151
5.	Third Judicial District Expert Disclosure Rule .....	153
6.	Remedies for Deficient Expert Disclosure .....	153
W.	Amending or Supplementing Disclosure.....	155
XII.	The Summary Judgment Motion .....	156
A.	Summary Judgment Procedure.....	156
1.	Introduction .....	156
2.	Court’s Duty .....	156
3.	Time of Motion.....	156
4.	Burden .....	157
a.	Movant.....	157
b.	Opposing Party .....	159
5.	The Reply Papers.....	160
XIII.	Resolving Common Settlement Issues .....	160
A.	Mr. and Mrs. Jones—Living Adults With No Liens .....	160
B.	Mr. and Mrs. Jones—Bankruptcy .....	161
C.	Mr. and Mrs. Jones—Divorce .....	163
D.	Authority to Settle the Case.....	164
1.	Infant Settlement .....	164
2.	Wrongful Death Case .....	164
E.	Release.....	165
F.	Taxation of Settlements and Lawsuits.....	165
G.	Requirements for a Binding Settlement Agreement.....	165
H.	Structures.....	167
I.	Confidentiality and Sealing Orders .....	167
J.	Indemnity by Plaintiff’s Counsel—Not Appropriate .....	167
XIV.	How to Resolve Liens and Claimed Rights of Reimbursement .....	168
A.	Evaluating and Assessing Liens and Rights of Subrogation .....	168

B.	Medical Benefits Carrier Intervention.....	169
C.	The Most Common Entities Seeking Repayment of Expenses in a Personal Injury Action .....	170
1.	Medicare .....	170
2.	Medicaid .....	170
3.	Health Insurance Contracts.....	170
4.	Self-Funded Private Employer Health Plans .....	170
5.	Medicare Advantage Policy (MAP) .....	171
6.	State Insurance Fund .....	171
7.	No-Fault Insurer Based on the Personal Injury Payment (APIP).....	172
8.	No-Fault Insurer by Lien Under Insurance Law § 5104(b).....	172
D.	Resolving Medicare Liens .....	172
1.	Medicare Liens and the Settlement Process .....	174
a.	Ambiguities About Liens in Settlements .....	174
b.	The Medicare Final Demand Letter.....	175
c.	Medicare as a Co-Payee on the Settlement Check .....	175
d.	Medicare Issues Impacting Settlement Enforcement .....	176
e.	New York Cases Involving Medicare Releases, Forms and W-9s .....	177
f.	Medicare and Wrongful Death/Conscious Pain and Suffering Allocations.....	179
g.	What Is a Related Medicare Conditional Medical Payment? .....	179
h.	How to Reach a Binding Settlement When Medicare Is Involved.....	180
	(1) The Preliminary Conference: Questions for the Plaintiff's Attorney .....	181
	(2) Following Up on the Preliminary Conference.....	181
	(3) The Early Pre-trial Conference .....	181
	(4) Final Negotiations and Settlement.....	181
XV.	Common Medical Evidence Issues at Trial.....	182
A.	Medical Records, Reports and Images .....	183
1.	Admissibility of Medical Records.....	183
2.	Hospital Record .....	183
3.	Hospital Bills .....	185
4.	Treating Physician's Office Records.....	185
5.	Medical Test and Imaging Reports Contained in a Treating Physician's Office Record .....	186
6.	Narrative Medical Reports .....	187
7.	Imaging .....	187
8.	Medical Reports Interpreting Imaging or Other Tests .....	188
9.	The Examining Physician IME Report.....	188
B.	Experts .....	189
1.	Expert Opinions.....	189
2.	The <i>Hamsch</i> Professional Reliability Exception .....	189
3.	Establishing the Reliability of the Out of Court Material Under <i>Hamsch</i> .....	190
4.	Conduit Hearsay .....	191

5.	The Out of Court MRI Report and Conduit Hearsay .....	192
6.	The Open Question—Is the Out of Court Material Admitted Into Evidence or Simply Discussed as a Basis of the Expert’s Opinion?.....	193
C.	Hearsay Medical Documents Associated With Expert Medical Proof .....	195
1.	Clinical Medical Practice Guidelines .....	195
2.	Authoritative Texts, Journals, Books, Studies.....	195
3.	Cross-Examination of an Expert on an Authoritative Text.....	196
4.	Algorithms .....	196
D.	Some Practical Considerations .....	197
XVI.	The Foundation for Expert Opinion on Summary Judgment and at Trial.....	197
A.	New York’s Traditional Evidentiary Requirements for Experts.....	197
1.	Qualification .....	198
2.	Foundation .....	199
3.	Custom and Practice Expert Opinions.....	200
B.	New York’s Frye Test for Novel Scientific or Other Expert Evidence .....	200
C.	Conduit Hearsay and the Expert.....	202
D.	The Professional Reliability Exception .....	203
1.	Criteria for Showing Professional Reliability .....	203
XVII.	Trial .....	204
A.	Decisions of Interest in Trial Practice .....	204
B.	Preparing for Trial—Some Threshold Advice .....	205
C.	Undisclosed Witnesses and Evidence at Trial.....	206
D.	Trial Theme .....	207
E.	Motions In Limine .....	207
F.	Voir Dire (Jury Selection) .....	208
1.	General Rules .....	208
2.	Purpose .....	209
3.	Procedure .....	209
4.	Selection Concepts .....	210
G.	Opening Statements.....	211
H.	Direct Examination.....	212
I.	Cross-Examination .....	212
J.	Demonstrative Evidence.....	213
K.	Trial Expert Testimony Rulings .....	214
L.	Jury Charges, Verdict Sheets, and Jury Notes.....	215
1.	Jury Charges .....	215
2.	Verdict Sheet .....	217
3.	Jury Notes .....	218
M.	Closing.....	218
XVIII.	Post-Trial and Appeal Process.....	220
A.	Post-Trial Matters .....	220
XIX.	Damages .....	220
	Appendix A Time Limitations Chart.....	223

Appendix B	Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services Bulletin: New Common Working File (CWF) Medicare Secondary Payer (MSP) Type for Liability Medicare Set-Aside Arrangements (LMSAs) and No-Fault Medicare Set-Aside Arrangements (NFMSAs).....	225
	Personal Injury Forms Index .....	231
	Table of Authorities.....	457
	About the Author .....	497

**PATRICK J. HIGGINS, ESQ.**

Mr. Higgins is the owner of the Law Offices of Patrick J. Higgins, PLLC in Albany, New York where he represents plaintiffs in complex personal injury and medical malpractice actions. He also represents select plaintiffs in commercial litigation.

Mr. Higgins is the Editor-in-Chief and contributing author to the New York State Bar Association's two-volume treatise *The Plaintiff's Personal Injury Action in New York*, and past state chair for the New York State Bar Association's seminar "Handling Tough Issues in Personal Injury Litigation." Mr. Higgins is board certified by the National Board of Trial Advocacy in Trial Practice and is a graduate of the National Institute of Trial Advocacy (NITA) Master Advocacy Program. He is a past President of the Albany County Bar Association, a past member of the New York State Bar Association House of Delegates, and a past member of the Independent Judicial Elections Qualification Commission for the Third Judicial District.

Mr. Higgins has frequently spoken to attorneys' groups on trial practice issues. He is listed in Best Lawyers of America™ and as AV preeminent™ in Martindale Hubbell.