

Protecting the Catastrophically Injured Personal Injury Plaintiff's Recovery

The Benefits and Risks of Structured Settlements and
Their Alternatives in a Changing Economy

by Michael W. Kessler, Esq.

New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2010
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-293-1
Product Number: 42230

CONTENTS

	Preface	iii
[1.0]	I. Introduction	1
[1.1]	II. What Are the Considerations in Placing a Catastrophically Injured Plaintiff’s Recovery?	2
[1.2]	A. Longevity Risk	2
[1.3]	B. Investment Risk.....	2
[1.4]	C. Default or Credit Risk	3
[1.5]	D. Reinvestment Risk	4
[1.6]	E. Flexibility/Liquidity Risk.....	4
[1.7]	F. Dissipation Risk	4
[1.8]	G. Inflation Risk.....	5
[1.9]	H. Tax Exposure	5
[1.10]	I. Investment Expense	5
[1.11]	III. Annuity-backed Structured Settlements.....	6
[1.12]	IV. Annuity-backed Structure Benefits	7
[1.13]	A. Assuring That Funds Are Available to Meet Future Needs	7
[1.14]	B. Minimized Investment Risk and Expense.....	9
[1.15]	C. Tax-Free Returns, Impact of “Rated Age” Returns and Tax Deferral	9
[1.16]	D. Use of Structures May Enable an Otherwise Impossible Settlement	11
[1.17]	V. Annuity-backed Structure Risks.....	12
[1.18]	A. Inflation	12
[1.19]	B. Interest Rate Risk	13
[1.20]	C. Lack of Flexibility/Liquidity	13
[1.21]	D. Safety.....	14
[1.22]	VI. Summary of the Annuity-backed Structured Settlement.....	15
[1.23]	VII. Methods to Increase Benefits and Reduce the Risks of Annuity-backed Structures.....	16
[1.24]	A. Vertical and Horizontal Risk Spreading	16
[1.25]	B. Rated Ages	17
[1.26]	VIII. Minimum Guaranteed Total Payouts	17
[1.27]	IX. Commutation Language	17
[1.28]	X. Other Structure Considerations	18
[1.29]	A. Qualified Settlement Funds.....	18
[1.30]	B. “Special Needs” or Supplemental Needs Trusts ...	19
[1.31]	C. Article 50-A and 50-B Considerations.....	19
[1.32]	XI. Plaintiff’s Attorneys’ Rights and Responsibilities	20

[1.33]	XII. Defense Obligations	23
[1.34]	XIII. Alternatives to Annuity-Backed Structures.....	25
[1.35]	A. Self-Managed Funds	25
[1.36]	B. Post-Settlement Trusts.....	26
[1.37]	XIV. Summary of the Options.....	27
[1.38]	A. Market Risk as Both a Positive and a Negative— Flexibility vs. Certainty	27
[1.39]	B. The Halpern Group.....	28
[1.40]	C. What Is The Halpern Group?	29
[1.41]	D. What Are The Halpern Group’s Criticisms of Annuity-Backed Structures?	30
[1.42]	1. Lack of Flexibility.....	31
[1.43]	2. Insurance Company Profit.....	32
[1.44]	3. Annuity Payments Are Fixed and Cannot Keep Up With Inflation.....	35
[1.45]	4. Risk of Insurer Failure and Inability to Make Payments	36
[1.46]	5. Defense Involvement and Cooperation Is Required to Place Annuity-Backed Structures.....	37
[1.47]	E. What Is the Nature of THG’s Alternatives to Annuity-Backed Structures?	39
[1.48]	1. The “United States Government Guaranteed Inflation-Proof Structured Settlement”	39
[1.49]	2. “The Section 130 Exempt Structured Settlement (The 130-X)”	40
[1.50]	F. What Are the Criticisms of THG Products?.....	42
[1.51]	1. Investment Risk.....	42
[1.52]	2. Mortality Risk	46
[1.53]	3. Income and Estate Tax Issues	47
[1.54]	a. Income Taxes.....	47
[1.55]	b. Estate Taxes	49
[1.56]	4. Investment Performance: What Is PRIMS and How Is It Represented to Plaintiffs and Their Attorneys?.....	49
[1.57]	a. What Is PRIMS?.....	50
[1.58]	b. How Is PRIMS Marketed?	50
[1.59]	c. Measuring PRIMS Performance.....	55
[1.60]	5. Costs of THG 130-X Trust.....	59
[1.61]	6. Reserves	61
[1.62]	7. Flexibility and Dissipation	61
[1.63]	8. Summary of Criticisms of the 130-X Trust....	62

[1.64] XV. What Questions Should Plaintiff’s Counsel
(and a Court) Ask When Considering the Options
Available for the Plaintiff’s Recovery?..... 63

[1.65] A. For an Annuity 63

[1.66] B. For a “130-X” Trust, U.S. Treasury Trust
(or Any Other Trust) 64

[1.67] XVI.Conclusion..... 66

About the Author 69

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

MICHAEL W. KESSLER

Michael Kessler is a partner in the firm of Rosenblum, Ronan, Kessler and Sarachan in Albany, New York, where he limits his practice to representing catastrophically injured plaintiffs. Mr. Kessler was selected for inclusion in *The Best Lawyers in America*® and *New York Superlawyers*.®

Former Counsel to the National Association of Insurance Commissioners, Mr. Kessler is perhaps best known for the \$19.1 million verdict he won for the plaintiff in *Auer v. State of New York*. A sought-after speaker, he has given Grand Rounds for the Ob/Gyn Department at Albany Medical Center Hospital and lectured for the Albany Law School, the New York State Bar Association (NYSBA), New York State Trial Lawyers Association (NYSTLA) and the Capital District Trial Lawyers. He presented a paper on life expectancy of catastrophically injured children both at NYU Hospital and at Mount Sinai Hospital in New York City and spoke on the life expectancy defense before the American Association for Justice (AAJ), North American Brain Injury Society (NABIS), Brain Injury Association (BIA), Brain Injury Society of New York State (BISNYS) and the Birth Trauma Litigation Group of AAJ. He wrote a chapter on this subject for the textbook *Pediatric Life Care Planning and Case Management*.

Mr. Kessler has also appeared as a guest commentator on personal injury law on Court TV, and his articles have been published in *Trial Magazine* and *Trial Lawyers Quarterly*. He is a recognized authority on Articles 50-A and 50-B of the CPLR and his 1990 monograph on this subject predicted the Court of Appeals decisions on the effect of inflation on plaintiff's recoveries. Mr. Kessler has lectured to both the New York State Office of Court Administration and the Association of Supreme Court Justices of New York State on the topics of structured settlements and post-recovery planning.

Mr. Kessler is admitted to practice in New York and Pennsylvania. He is a Diplomate of the National College of Advocacy, a member of AAJ, BIA, NABIS, and NYSTLA, and a Charter Member of the New York State Academy of Trial Lawyers. He served on the House of Delegates of NYBSA, was a Director of the Capital Region Affiliate of NYSTLA, and served on the Board of Directors of BIANYS. He is also a member of

AAJ's Traumatic Brain Injury Litigation Group and has served on its Executive Board. He serves on the Executive Board of AAJ's Birth Trauma Litigation Group. He is a graduate of Albany Law School, where he was a member of the *Law Review*.

He is also a proud member of the Association of Surfing Lawyers.