

Criminal and Civil
Contempt
Second Edition

Lawrence N. Gray, Esq.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Foreword.....	ix
		Preface	xi
[1.0]	I.	Introduction	1
[1.1]	II.	Statutes.....	3
[1.2]	III.	The Nature of Legislative Inherent Contempt Power	5
[1.3]	IV.	The Nature of the Judiciary Law Contempt Power	8
[1.4]	V.	Preparation of the Order to Show Cause for a Criminal Contempt Proceeding	19
[1.5]	VI.	The Mandate of Commitment for Criminal Contempt	19
[1.6]	VII.	Ordering a Grand Jury Witness to Answer— the Prosecutor, the Witness and the Role of the Court.....	24
[1.7]	VIII.	Ordering the Criminal Trial Witness to Testify— the Role of the Prosecutor, the Court and the Witness	27
[1.8]	IX.	Contempt and the Media—New York’s Shield Law	31
[1.9]	X.	Contempt and Double Jeopardy	36
[1.10]	XI.	Evasive Contempt—What Is It?	46
[1.11]	XII.	Is Evasive-Answer Criminal Contempt Tried on the Record Alone?	54
[1.12]	XIII.	Admonishing the Evasively Contemptuous Grand Jury Witness	56
[1.13]	XIV.	The <i>Mens Rea</i> of Testimonial Criminal Contempt	58
[1.14]	XV.	Contempt Traps Are Legalisms in Search of Facts	62
[1.15]	XVI.	Multiplicitousness and Contempts.....	67
[1.16]	XVII.	Purgation of Criminal Contempts.....	69
[1.17]	XVIII.	Materiality and Judiciary Law Criminal Contempt; Legality and Propriety and Penal Law Contempt, First and Second Degree	76

[1.18]	XIX.	Judiciary Law Criminal Contempts Are Not Crimes.....	79
[1.19]	XX.	Criminal Contempt and the Grand Jury's Subpoena	82
[1.20]	XXI.	A Civil Contempt Contemnor Holds the Keys to His Own Jail Cell	92
[1.21]	XXII.	“Willfulness” and Contempt	94
[1.22]	XXIII.	Duress	97
[1.23]	XXIV.	Contempt in the Immediate View and Presence of the Court—Statutes, Case Law	97
[1.24]	XXV.	Court Rules for Immediate View Contempt.....	99
[1.25]	XXVI.	Summary Contempt's Source.....	101
[1.26]	XXVII.	“Immediate View” and “Presence” of the Court	102
[1.27]	XXVIII.	Examples of “Immediate View” Contempt.....	107
[1.28]	XXIX.	Historical Development of “Immediate View and Presence” Summary Contempt Power.....	110
[1.29]	XXX.	Serious Criminal Contempt Fines	134
[1.30]	XXXI.	A Postscript on Criminal Contempt and Jury Trials	141
[1.31]	XXXII.	Judge Frank's Analysis of the Summary Contempt Power	146
[1.32]	XXXIII.	Contemptuous Lawyers, Defendants, Witnesses and Spectators.....	149
[1.33]	XXXIV.	Attorneys Who Do Not Show Up for Court; Those Who Are Always Late	151
[1.34]	XXXV.	Contempt and Court Jurisdiction.....	156
[1.35]	XXXVI.	The Collateral Bar Rule.....	157
[1.36]	XXXVII.	Advice of Counsel and Criminal Contempt	160
[1.37]	XXXVIII.	Appealability and Scope of Review of Criminal Contempt	161
[1.38]	XXXIX.	Civil Contempt Is Not Available Against a Grand Jury Witness in New York	170
[1.39]	XL.	The Institution of the Grand Jury as Relevant to Criminal Contempt.....	173

[1.40]	XLI.	Thoughts for a Judge Presiding Over a Contempt Proceeding.....	185
[1.41]	XLII.	Criminal Contempt Proceedings Must Be Tried in Open Court	187
[1.42]	XLIII.	Notice of Contempt Proceedings.....	189
[1.43]	XLIV.	Contempts and Executive Pardons	193
[1.44]	XLV.	Corporations and Contempt	194
[1.45]	XLVI.	Corporate Officers and Contempt	195
[1.46]	XLVII.	Contempt by Publication	196
[1.47]	XLVIII.	Conclusions and Suggestions	198
		Appendix A—Suggestions for a New Contempt Statute Followed by Suggested Statute With Annotations	207
		Appendix B—Sample Orders to Show Cause	219
		Sample Order to Show Cause #1	221
		Sample Order to Show Cause #2.....	223
		Sample Order to Show Cause #3.....	225
		Sample Order to Show Cause #4.....	228
		Sample Order to Show Cause #5.....	230
		Appendix C—Sample Mandates of Commitment.....	233
		Sample Mandate of Commitment #1—	
		Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i>	234
		Sample Mandate of Commitment #2—	
		Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i>	236
		Sample Mandate of Commitment #3—	
		Immediate-View-and-Presence Contempt.....	239
		Appendix D—Sample Arrest Orders for Failure to Obey Order to Show Cause Commanding Appearance for Contempt Proceeding	241
		Sample Arrest Warrant #1	242
		Sample Arrest Warrant #2	243
		Sample Arrest Warrant #3	245
		Sample Arrest Warrant #4	247
		Table of Authorities.....	249
		Index	275
		About the Author	279

LAWRENCE N. GRAY, ESQ.

Lawrence N. Gray is a former Special Assistant Attorney General in the appellate section of the Attorney General's Medicaid Fraud Control Unit. He was previously a Special Assistant Attorney General in the Office of the Special State Prosecutor for the Investigation of the New York City Criminal Justice System; prior to that he was an Assistant Attorney General in the Bureau of Real Estate, Securities Fraud and Theatrical Syndications. He began his career as an Assistant District Attorney in Bronx County. Mr. Gray is a 1969 graduate of St. John's University School of Law, where he was an associate editor of the *St. John's Law Review*. His other publications include *Criminal and Civil Contempt: Some Sense of a Hodgepodge*, 72 *St. John's Law Review* 337 (1998); *Judiciary and Penal Law Contempt in New York: A Critical Analysis*, *Brooklyn Law School Journal of Law and Policy*, Vol. III, No. 1 (1994); *The Criminal Contempt Handbook*, New York State Criminal Justice Services (2000); *Criminal Contempt Under New York's Penal and Judiciary Laws* (1992); *Direct Examination* (1983); *The Role of Counsel at the Grand Jury* (NYSBA, 1987); *Extradition* (1991); and he is Editor-in-Chief of NYSBA's *New York Criminal Practice Handbook Supplements*.