

IMPASSE RESOLUTION

Under the
Taylor Law

Third Edition

Philip L. Maier, Esq.

Edited by:

Michael Krauthamer, Esq.

Alyson Mathews, Esq.

New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2019
by
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 978-1-57969-578-1
Product Number: 412219

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

About the Author/Editors	vii
Preface	ix
[1.0] I. Introduction	1
[1.1] A. Public Employment Relations Board	3
[1.2] B. Structure of the Act—Impasse Resolution Procedures	4
[1.3] C. Local Options	5
[1.4] 1. Mini-PERBs	5
[1.5] 2. The New York City Office of Collective Bargaining	6
[1.6] D. Section 209-a(1)(e)—Triborough Amendment.....	7
[1.7] E. The Duty to Bargain in Good Faith.....	7
[1.8] 1. Authority of Negotiator	12
[1.9] 2. Delay and Evasion.....	13
[1.10] 3. Counterproposals.....	14
[1.11] 4. Conditions to Bargaining	15
[1.12] 5. Withdrawal of Agreement.....	16
[1.13] F. Subjects of Bargaining	16
[1.14] 1. Mandatory/Nonmandatory/Prohibited	17
[1.15] 2. Balancing Approach—Employer Versus Employee Interests	17
[1.16] 3. Mandatory Subjects of Bargaining.....	20
[1.17] 4. Nonmandatory Subjects of Bargaining	21
[1.18] 5. Prohibited Subjects of Bargaining	22
[1.19] 6. The Conversion Theory of Negotiability— Cohoes.....	24
[1.20] G. Role of the Chief Executive Officer and the Legislative Body	27
[1.21] H. Ratification	33
[1.22] II. Impasse Resolution Procedures Under the Taylor Law.....	34
[1.23] A. Impasse.....	34
[1.24] 1. Premature Impasse Declaration.....	37
[1.25] 2. Introduction of New Subjects to Bargaining After Impasse	38
[1.26] 3. Failure to Meet With Mediator	40
[1.27] 4. The Mediation Process	40
[1.28] a. Appointment of Mediator	40
[1.29] b. Role of Mediator.....	41
[1.30] B. Fact-Finding	44

[1.31]	1. The Statutory Framework.....	44
[1.32]	2. Nature of the Proceeding.....	46
[1.33]	3. Procedure.....	47
[1.34]	4. Scope of Fact-Finding	48
[1.35]	a. Improper Practice Charges	48
[1.36]	b. Declaratory Ruling Petitions	50
[1.37]	5. Objections to the Submission of Demands to Fact-Finding	51
[1.38]	a. Submission of Nonmandatory Subjects of Bargaining to Fact-Finding.....	52
[1.39]	b. Point of Insistence	52
[1.40]	c. Submission of New Matters	56
[1.41]	d. Matters Previously Agreed	56
[1.42]	6. The Fact-Finding Process.....	57
[1.43]	7. Post-Fact-Finding Issues	59
[1.44]	C. Legislative Imposition.....	59
[1.45]	1. Nature of Proceeding.....	60
[1.46]	2. Legislative Imposition—During Life of the CBA.....	61
[1.47]	3. Statutory Framework.....	62
[1.48]	a. Section 209(3)(e):.....	62
[1.49]	b. Waiver of Union Rights.....	70
[1.50]	c. Duration of Legislative Imposition.....	72
[1.51]	4. Issues After Hearing and Legislative Imposition.....	73
[1.52]	D. Interest Arbitration	75
[1.53]	1. Nature of the Proceeding.....	75
[1.54]	2. Constitutionality	76
[1.55]	3. Interest Arbitration—City of New York Context	77
[1.56]	4. Voluntary and Compulsory Interest Arbitration	80
[1.57]	a. Voluntary Interest Arbitration	80
[1.58]	b. Compulsory Interest Arbitration.....	81
[1.59]	(1) Eligibility for Compulsory Interest Arbitration.....	81
[1.60]	(2) Special Interest Arbitration Provisions.....	85
[1.61]	(i) Section 209(4)(e).....	85
[1.62]	(ii) Section 209(4)(f)	85
[1.63]	(iii) Section 209(4)(g)	87
[1.64]	(iv) Section 209(4)(h).....	88

[1.65]	(v) Section 209(4)(i).....	89
[1.66]	c. Metropolitan Transportation Authority and Its Subsidiaries.....	89
[1.67]	5. Rules—Contents of the Petition and the Ithaca Trilogy.....	90
[1.68]	E. Processing the Petition.....	95
[1.69]	F. Challenging the Submission of Demands to the Panel.....	96
[1.70]	1. Objections to Arbitrability	99
[1.71]	2. Nonmandatory Subjects	100
[1.72]	3. Introduction of New Demands	101
[1.73]	4. Resolved During the Course of Negotiations	102
[1.74]	G. Conduct Before the Arbitration Panel.....	102
[1.75]	1. Composition of the Panel—Section 209(4)(c)(ii) of the Act.....	102
[1.76]	2. Authority of, and Procedure Before, the Panel— Section 209(4)(c)(iii) of the Act.....	104
[1.77]	H. Contents of Awards.....	106
[1.78]	1. Form of the Award.....	106
[1.79]	2. Substance and Criteria of Awards.....	106
[1.80]	3. Executive Sessions	110
[1.81]	I. Interest Arbitration—City of New York.....	110
[1.82]	J. Issuance of Awards—Awards and CBAs	111
[1.83]	1. Duration of Awards.....	111
[1.84]	2. Incorporation of Awards	112
[1.85]	K. Post-Award Issues	113
[1.86]	1. Status Quo After Expiration of Award.....	113
[1.87]	2. Review of Interest Arbitration Awards	114
	Table of Authorities.....	119

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

PHILIP L. MAIER, ESQ.

Philip Maier was the Regional Director of the New York State Public Employment Relations Board's New York City office from 1993 until 2012, having joined PERB as an Administrative Law Judge in 1991. During his tenure at PERB, he presided over hundreds of cases relating to matters such as retaliatory discharges, refusals to bargain, and representation questions. He also served as a mediator pursuant to PERB's impasse resolution procedures, and mediated hundreds of collective bargaining disputes involving all types of public sector bargaining, including police, firefighter, and school district units. He was the General Counsel and Deputy Director of the New York City Office of Collective Bargaining from 2012–15. Since 2015 he has been in full time practice as an arbitrator and mediator. He graduated from Clark University and Vermont Law School, has written numerous articles on labor law issues, and is the author of *The Taylor Law and the Duty of Fair Representation* and co-editor of *Lefkowitz on Public Sector Labor and Employment Law*. He is also an adjunct professor at New York University teaching Business Ethics, Business Law and Employment Law.

ABOUT THE EDITORS

MICHAEL KRAUTHAMER, ESQ.

Michael Krauthamer has worked primarily in the area of public sector labor relations since 1995, and is currently employed by the New York State United Teachers (NYSUT) as a Labor Relations Specialist. He represents both public and private sector unions in collective bargaining, grievance arbitration, disciplinary matters, civil service issues and matters before PERB and the NLRB. He was previously a partner in the Melville law firm Lamb & Barnosky where he represented municipalities including school districts, counties, towns and villages in all types of labor and employment matters. He has served as a labor arbitrator, mediator and hearing officer in the public and private sectors, counsel to the Suffolk County Public Employment Relations Board and a Labor Relations Specialist for the Civil Service Employees Association, and lectures extensively in the area of public sector employment law. He received his law degree, *cum laude*, from Suffolk University Law School in Boston, Massachusetts, and his undergraduate degree, *cum laude*, from the University of Massachusetts, Amherst.

ALYSON MATHEWS, ESQ.

Alyson Mathews is a partner at Lamb & Barnosky, LLP and practices education, labor and employment law. She has assisted municipalities with grievance arbitrations, improper practice charges before PERB, disciplinary charges, contract negotiations, fact finding, and compulsory and voluntary interest arbitration proceedings. She is an expert on the Affordable Care Act and has frequently lectured on the topic. She is actively involved in the New York State Bar Association and currently serves on the Executive Committee of the Labor and Employment Law Section as the Co-Chair of the Membership Committee and as a member of the Electronic Communications Committee. Ms. Mathews is also a member of the American Bar Association and the Suffolk County Bar Association. She received her law degree from Brooklyn Law School and her undergraduate degree, *cum laude*, from Boston College. While at Brooklyn Law School, she was a member of the Moot Court Honor Society and the Journal of Law and Policy. She participated in the 2003 National First Amendment Moot Court Competition where she placed as a semifinalist. She also served as the coach of the 2004 First Amendment Moot Court team, Notes and Comments Editor for the Journal of Law and Policy, and editor of the Brooklyn Law School News.

PREFACE

This third edition of *Impasse Resolution Under the Taylor Law* provides both an overview and an in-depth discussion of the impasse resolution procedures under the Public Employees' Fair Employment Act, commonly known as the Taylor Law. It incorporates and reviews recent statutory developments such as the property tax cap and amendments to the Act's interest arbitration provisions, as well as recent decisions of interest. It will assist practitioners of all levels of experience by promoting a greater understanding of this important aspect of public sector labor relations. The detailed discussion of the Act's statutory framework and relevant case law provides a useful resource for those active in the field. It will also assist union officers, public employees, governmental officials and interested members of the public in gaining greater insight into this aspect of labor relations.

Philip L. Maier, Esq.

